Editorial/Advisory Board

Prof. Dr. Ahmed Mohammed Ahmed Al-Qadi
Faculty of Languages & Translation,

Prof. Dr. Gary Gorman
Faculty of Computer Science and Technology,
University of Malaya 50603 Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia.

Dr. Widad Mustafa ElHadi
Professor of the Universities in Information Science Laboratory,
Geriico University Charles-of-Gaulle - Lille 3 Lille, France.

Dr. Rubina Tareen
Professor & Chairperson, Department of Urdu,
B. Z. University, Multan, Pakistan.

Dr. Imran Sharif
Professor, Department of Economics,
B. Z. University Multan, Pakistan.

Dr. Khalid Mahmood
Professor, Department of Library and Information Science,
University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan.

Dr. Muhammad Shamsuddin
Ex-Dean, Faculty of Arts,
University of Karachi, Pakistan.

Dr. Ann Marlow Riedling
Associate Professor, Department of Library and Information Science,
San Jose State University, CA, USA.

Prof. Dr. John Feather
Associate Dean (Research) Faculty of Science and Professor of Library and Information Studies, Loughborough University, Leicestershire, LE11 3TU, UK.

Prof. Dr. Ishtiaq Ahmad Chaudhary
Chairman, Department of Peace & Conflict,
National Defence University, Islamabad, Pakistan.

Tayyeb Shabbir
IUB Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities

The Islamia University of
Bahawalpur. Pakistan

VOL.9 NO.1 January-June, 2011

CONTENTS

Development of Regional Planning Criteria for Health Services in the City of Riyadh
Dr. Suleiman S. Abu-Kharmeh

Issue of New Provinces in Pakistan
Ghulam Ali
Prof. Dr. Razia Musarrat
Muhammad Salman Azhar

Human Rights and Role of the Press in Pakistan
Prof. Dr. Ghulam Shabir
Shumaila Ahmed

Shrine and Divine Essence in African Indigenous Religious Tradition, Experiences and Expressions
Dr. Charles Obafemi Jegede

Politics and Novel: An Eclectic Reading of Maniza Naqvi’s Novels
Dr. Mohammad Ayub Jajja

Dr. Abdul Wajid Khan
Arshad Ali

Comparing the Salient Features of Digital Library Software
Dr. Farzana Shafique
Sundus Tariq

5
Development of Regional Planning Criteria for Health Services in the city of Riyadh

Taqiyy Al-Din Ibn Taymiyyah as a Philosopher 130
*Prof. Dr. Abdul Rauf Zafar*

John Donne and Dylan Thomas: A Parallelism towards Death 151
*Dr. Mushtaq ur Rehman*
Development of Regional Planning Criteria for Health Services in the city of Riyadh

Suleiman S. Abu-Kharmeh*

Abstract: This study aimed at developing criteria for planning health services in the city of Riyadh through assessing the actual distribution of these services and comparing them with planning criteria adopted by the Municipality of Riyadh, local, Arab and foreign cities, in order to propose planning criteria that best serve citizens of Riyadh city more fairly and efficiently. Data related to health services and their attributes were gathered and incorporated into a GIS database.

The results of the study regarding the primary health centers showed that the criterion of the service coverage rate of the Riyadh Municipality was slightly applied, notwithstanding the criterion of the served population was moderately applied, the criterion of the square meters of land per capita was slightly applied, the criterion of the served population was asymptotic to that one in Dubai. The criterion of the land's area allocated to per capita was relatively high in comparison with other cities. While the results regarding hospitals showed that the criterion of the service coverage rate for the municipality was moderately applied, the criterion of the served population was asymptotic to that one in Dubai and the criterion of the land's area allocated to per capita was relatively high in comparison with other cities.

Key words: Regional Planning; Planning Criteria; Health Services; Location; Development.

1. Introduction

The provision of public services in general and especially health ones are necessary to save human’s life and secure their welfare. It must be provided to citizens based on the principles and criteria of public interest without bias to a particular place. The provision aims to secure a sustainable standard of living for all citizens, manage and develop these services optimally (Ministry of Planning, 2004).

* Associate Professor, Faculty of Planning and Management Balqa Applied University, Jordan
Tel: 962-795-592-761 E-mail: dr_kharmeh@yahoo.com
Although the provision of health services is non-profit, it does not imply that they don’t have economic and social returns since investment in health is considered for developing the human resources at the level of society as a whole and pays off in the long term. This requires the attention to the optimal allocation of all the input elements to satisfy the needs of the community at the highest degree of efficiency. Accordingly, the services related to satisfying the basic needs of the population and delivery of services is primarily the responsibility of the state as it represents the pillars of its sovereignty. The efficient management of public utilities is required for the proper utilization of resources allocated to them (Ministry of Health, 2002).

To raise and improve the services provided to the population, it is necessary to have a set of planning criteria which helping to provide these services based on comprehensiveness and justice.

These criteria represent a support tool for decision makers in the field of services, and also contributes to estimate the extent of adequacy for the levels of availability of these services in comparison with the population needs according to the region and population categories, attaining coordinative plans for providing public services in the future in order to overcome obstacles, and meet the anticipated needs in the future according to the future population projections in 2023 (Ministry of Municipal and rural Affairs, 2001).

Therefore, this study is to develop planning criteria for of health services in the city of Riyadh through the assessment of actual reality and compared them with planning criteria approved in the Municipality of Riyadh. In addition, to compare them with planning criteria in the other local, Arab and foreign cities in order to propose planning criteria that may contribute in the development of health services provided to the citizens in city of Riyadh and distributed them fairly and efficiently.

2. Study Objectives

The study seeks to achieve a set of goals as follows:

i. Study the current situation of health services in Riyadh city.
ii. Investigate the compliance of the current distribution of health services with approved planning criteria for Riyadh city.

iii. Explore the international practices in terms of planning criteria for health services.

iv. Suggest criteria which go in line with the architect fabric of Riyadh city.

3. Methodology of Developing the Planning Criteria

Development of planning criteria is based on a number of considerations as follows: (OECD, 2008)

i. Population data according to their geographical distribution, demographic characteristics, sex and age categories.

ii. The levels of different population categories interested in health services. These levels are affected by social and economic development and also by trends of sectarian policies.

iii. Technical and procedural considerations committed by those responsible for health services apart from the availability of autonomous demand by population in regular circumstances.

iv. Sectarian criteria that take into account the rates of autonomous turnout on health services from one hand, and technical considerations which are committed by the responsible departments on the other hand for using it in estimating the needs of the population for the health services, and thus measuring the deficit or surplus of demand through comparing the estimated demand with the available supply.

The planning criteria in the various cities of the world include all or some of the following categories: (Charnes; Cooper; Lewin & Seiford, 1995): These Criteria are:
i. The extent of covering service units and are expressed through the service coverage rate, the number of beneficiaries, and the number of population covered by the service.

ii. The provision of necessary plots for the units of service that specify the conditions of land divisions, expropriation and management of land owned by government entities. It is expressed in one of the following indicators: the number of square meters per beneficiary and the number of square meters per capita in the coverage area.

iii. The size of construction which includes the service unit that determines the built-up area and is expressed by: number of square meters of the facility, the number of meters per beneficiary and the number of square meters per capita of the population.

iv. Equipping and operating the service unit: which specifies conditions for providing health services such as: the availability of special equipment (laboratories, toilets, etc...), identifying areas dedicated to specific parts of the facility (clinics sizes, parking sizes, etc...) and different technical conditions (altitudes, the conditions for public safety, etc...).

These criteria vary depending on its nature, for example, the first category of the criteria reflect the coverage policy, while the second category related to the responsibilities of urban planning, the third category of the criteria related to the engineering considerations, while the fourth related to the operating and quality conditions. These criteria integrate with each other and are difficult to separate them most probably because they are not independent from each other (For example: the size of the building is linked to the breadth of land and building size governs the possibility of providing equipment and operational requirements). Because some of these criteria are linked indirectly to underlying considerations such as population density resulting from the pattern of urban practice and the single size for each of the service units. For
example, relying on a certain range of service in an area has certain density results underlying identifying of the number of population served by the facility. It is well known that the economic cost for operating any service facility depends largely on its size and the number of beneficiaries. Therefore, the adoption of limited coverage service in a low density region leads to small size service units and high cost (OECD, 2008).

4. Considerations for the Use of Planning Criteria

The planning criteria are related with three basic considerations: (Ministry of Municipal and rural Affairs, 2000)

i. Availability of lands, which is in turn affected by the planning legislations and processes of expropriation. The more available lands to receive health services due to the presence of urban planning systems and regulations in place, the more easily to meet the demand and upgrade the level of service.

ii. The demand for health services is influenced by population density and transportation. As the population density is increased and mobility become accessible through, the provision of lands, meeting demand and improving the level of service will be easier.

iii. The level of health service is influenced by shortness of distances crossed, providing sufficient spaces. The more flexibility adopted in determining the level of service in terms of geographical coverage and relying on public transport instead of walking or the use of private cars, or in terms of space required for each facility as a result for merging similar facilities (health centers and hospitals) in unified sites and shared in using equipment’s that require large areas, the less pressure on lands and the more easier to meet the demand.

In order to make criteria realistic and feasible, planners must take into account the balance between such considerations. For the city
Development of Regional Planning Criteria for Health Services in the city of Riyadh

of Riyadh, the following can be observed the: (Ministry of Municipal and rural Affairs, 2000; Ministry of Health, 2007).

i. Demand is characterized by low density and extended area of the city. From other side, it is possible to benefit from the size of the road network and the electrical train proposed to facilitate the transition within the city depending on more effective means of transport than the current reality governed by using private cars.

ii. Availability of lands in the city of Riyadh is characterized by distinguished features since the governmental lands are available in the outskirts of the city but rare in the city center. But the problem highlights in new neighborhoods surrounding the old center and built according to the hierarchical layout style and then changing took place in the use of governmental lands for many reasons, generating large deficit in the provision of public lands and the city began to suffer from its negative consequences seriously.

iii. Regarding the levels of service, the commitment to the geographical coverage of services is no longer viable in most neighborhoods without substantial modification in the land policy.

Therefore, the proposed criteria should take into account the lands problem and adapt the required levels of service within the area of giving priority to areas that suffer from deficits in the availability of public services.

5. Data Collection

Data compiled from official sources showed the following characteristics:

i. Services without spatial coordinates and without descriptive information.

ii. Services with available spatial coordinates, but without service descriptive information.
iii. Services without spatial coordinates, but with available service descriptive information.

iv. Information and various statistics (urban, demographic, social ...).

Data was collected, indexed, classified and integrated into GIS database. For this reason and to obtain the missing data, a questionnaire has been designed according to the types, and categories of health services (Bandura, 2006).

6. The Geographical Scope of the Field Survey

The field survey and cadastral boundaries which was conducted by Al-Riyadh Development Authority (ADA) covers the borders of the urban development area of the city of Riyadh (till the year 2028) with a total area of about 5400 square kilometers.

Figure 1: The boundaries of the geographical coverage of the field survey
7. Produce Maps of the Geographic Sectors

A basic map was provided by the ADA for the usage of the field surveys, the map shows the borders of sub-municipalities, Districts, sub-districts, and blocks which is divided into Parcels and buildings, each has a serial code number to be identified in the questionnaire. A randomized verification of the findings of the survey was conducted through satellite images of modern and high-resolution (Quick Bird) with accuracy up to 60 cm.

8. Field Survey Work

The survey questionnaires were filled in the following ways:

i. Visiting the health service site: the service site was visited and interviewed the person in charge and filled the questionnaire according to the information given by supported documents or references.

ii. Phone call: In cases where field researchers’ encountered obstacles which prevented them from accessing the facility, phone calls were used to get the required information.

9. Results

The investigated health facilities included are: primary care centers, public specialized and general hospitals that provide health services for residents. The results of the analysis showed:

i) Primary health care centers

They are the essence of medical services because they provide primary health care services at the level of neighborhoods and residential zones. They establish personal health files for all families within the coverage area of service for treatment and transfer to specialized medical centers if necessary. The center includes rooms for examination, waiting halls for male and female patients, and an emergency room. It may contain a laboratory, pharmacy and ambulance unit attached with services such as toilets, stockroom and maternity-infancy care offices (Ministry of Health, 2000).

ii) Hospitals
It is divided into two types: General and specialized hospitals:

a) **General hospitals:** provide the basic level of health services. It involve the most medical specialties including sections of different specializations and rooms for surgery with its accessories, laboratories, workshops for medical analysis and X-ray, sections for reception and emergency, ambulance unit, admission, and facilities for services such as kitchens to prepare food, rooms for physicians and nurses, administrative and service appendages, and others. It should be noted that the hospitals are a stand-alone projects that need an in-depth study of each case. The planning criteria to be proposed later in the study are considered to be a general indicator and should not be applied without detailed study for each site chosen during the distribution of demand needs.

b) **Specialized hospitals:** provide treatment and preventive services in a particular specialty (pediatrics, obstetrics, ophthalmology, psychiatry, thoracic). They cover health services at the range of the city and include all equipment such as general hospital, the necessary medical departments and all the accessories according to the specialty of hospital (The Ministry of Health, 2000).

**Table 1:** Summary of the current situation of health services in Riyadh.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Public</th>
<th>Private</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>General Hospital</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specialized hospital</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary care center/clinic</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>205</td>
<td>321</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number</td>
<td>4977</td>
<td>4380</td>
<td>8004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. Beds</td>
<td>1177</td>
<td>9063</td>
<td>10534</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. physicians</td>
<td>1388</td>
<td>4631</td>
<td>5019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. nurses</td>
<td>4927</td>
<td>11063</td>
<td>11550</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. owned buildings</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. rented buildings</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unknown ownership</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 2:** Indicators of health services quality

1. Occupancy rate: The number of patients attending the health unit (hospital - primary care center / clinic) during the week.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Bed/ health unit</th>
<th>Patient/ health unit</th>
<th>Physician/health unit</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Public</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public hospital</td>
<td>374(^1)</td>
<td>452</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preliminary Care center / Clinic</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>260</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private hospital</td>
<td>203</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preliminary Care center / Clinic</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>394</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 3**: Comparison of indicators of health services quality (public - private).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hospital bed/ 1000 individual</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>1.89</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physician/ 1000 individual</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

10. **Comparison of Current Situation with the Criteria of the Municipality of Riyadh**

The current reality of health services was evaluated through comparison with the current criteria approved by the Municipality (Ministry of Municipal and rural Affairs, 2000) which include the coverage rate for both service units represented in the geographical coverage of the service (service coverage rate), and the number of people covered by the service. In addition to the criteria

\(^2\) The indicator of Patient/ health unit represents the number of patients per one week.

\(^3\) With consideration to number of Beds/ hospital reached to 25 hospitals in case of adding 10 specialized hospitals to the public ones (15 hospitals) listed in previous table.
concerning the provision of plots required for each of the service units, i.e. the number of square meters per capita of served population. This was done through the graphs show the number of services that fall within or outside the criteria of Municipality and through maps showing the extent of compatibility for the current reality of these services with the criteria of Municipality.

It required identifying the coverage of service for each service unit; compute the number of served population within it, and the coverage of its service in meters, in addition to its land area for the served population (Ebert & Welsch, 2004). This was done through the use of geographic information systems (GIS) and the technology of Thiessen Polygon specifically which define polygonal (Polygon) service per unit of service in which the coverage of a service for each unit can be obtained as follows: (Charnes; Cooper; Lewin & Seiford, 1995)

i. Calculating population per unit of service within the coverage of service that was specified in the Thiessen Polygon. Calculate the service scope rate per unit of service through the development of a mathematical equation in the GIS operates automatically and computing the average of distances from the unit of service to the units surrounding it.

ii. Calculating the land area of each unit of service for the served population within the Thiessen Polygon in order to extract the criterion of area land service per individual of population.

iii. Grouping units within specific ranges in order to compare them with the coverage of Municipality criteria. This information were then converted into an Excel file and included in moving tables (Pivotable) (Office of National Statistics, 2005) so as to check the compliance of the current status of these services with the criteria of Municipality. Then graphs were extracted showing the number of service units that fall within or outside the criteria of Municipality.
Development of Regional Planning Criteria for Health Services in the city of Riyadh

iv. Then graphs were converted into statistical circles (Pie charts) so as to obtain an accurate assessment (percentages) reflects the extent of compliance for the current service criteria with the criteria of the Municipality.

v. Finally, the comparison results were included with the criteria of Municipality within illustrative maps at the sub-municipal level.

The following graphs and charts show comparing the results of analysis of the reality of these services with the criteria approved by the Municipality of Riyadh:

a) Primary Health Centers

These results show the following:

- The criterion of service coverage rate for the Municipality is applied slightly where the majority of clinics (94%) have service coverage rate much wider of the criterion applied by the Municipality (800 m).

- The criterion of served population is moderately applied where 74% of the clinics serving much more numbers of residents than what approved in the Municipality criterion (clinic per 8000 people).

- The criterion of square meters of land per person is applied slightly where 88% of clinics covering a square meter of land per capita less than the criterion of Municipality and only 4% falls within the criterion of the Municipality (0.34 to 0.48 m² / people).

Figure 2: Primary health care centers (clinics) / service coverage rate (municipality criterion: 800 m)
Figure 3: Preliminary care centers (clinics) / number of served population (Municipality criterion: clinic per 8,000)

Figure 4: primary care centers (clinics) / land area allocated to each individual of the population (standard secretariat 0.34 to 0.48 m² / individual).
**Figure 5:** Comparison of analysis for results of primary health care centers reality with the criteria approved by the Municipality of Riyadh

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria</th>
<th>Municipal Approval</th>
<th>Hospital Reality</th>
<th>Difference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Service Scope Rate</td>
<td>3000-5000 m</td>
<td>54%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Served Population</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>74%</td>
<td>46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Area of Land Allocated to Each Individual of Population</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>89%</td>
<td>88%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**b) Hospitals**

These results show the following:

- The criterion of service scope rate for the Municipality is implied moderately where half of the hospitals or equivalents to 54% have much broader service scope than criterion approved by the Municipality (3000-5000 m).

- The criterion of served population is applied well where 28% of the hospitals serving more numbers of population than what approved by the Municipality (hospital per 8,000 individual).

- It should be noted that the allocated area per capita of population regarding hospitals was not included in this section of the report because of the lack of data related to the services planning criteria in the Municipality.

**Figure 6:** Hospitals / service coverage rate (Municipality criterion: 3000-5000 m)
**Figure 7**: Hospitals / number of served population (Municipality criterion: Hospital per 8,000 individual).

![Number of Served Population](image)

**Figure 8**: Comparison of analysis for results of hospitals reality with the criteria approved by the Municipality Riyadh

![Service Scope Rate and Number of Served Population](image)
11. Comparison of Current Criteria with the Planning Criteria in other cities

The comparison of global and local planning criteria and experiences of other countries calls attention that some of these planning criteria are different from the Saudi society in terms of environment, climate, developmental policies and the social customs (Hartigan, 1975). Therefore, the comparison of these criteria must be based on countries with similar living conditions and taking into account the privacy of citizens in the city of Riyadh such as:

- The form of the city and its geographical location.
- The social structure of the city.
- The economic situation.
- The environment and nature.
- Development of structure of urban growth

The planning criteria applied by the municipality of Riyadh were compared with a number of Arab and international cities such as Jeddah, Mecca, Dubai, Muscat, Manama, Kuwait, and Kuala Lumpur. Moreover, modern international cities such as Rincon and Fairfax in Britain and America as developed countries were addressed. Furthermore, considering the most prominent issues related to those criteria (the degree of complying with sectarian policies, congruity with the nature and climate of the city of Riyadh). The following represent a comparison of service criteria under consideration with local and international criteria:

a) Preliminary care centers / clinics

Graphs show the extent of compatibility for the criteria applied in the Municipality of Riyadh with local and international criteria. It was found that the number of served population was less than the rate implemented in most other cities. Also the comparison of service coverage rate was unavailing since this criterion is not taken into account in the other cities. Furthermore, the allocated land area per capita was high compared with the other cities.
**Figure 9:** Evaluation of standard Riyadh Municipality (1421 e): preliminary care centers / clinics versus service scope rate (in meter).

**Figure 10:** Evaluation of criterion for the Municipality of Riyadh: Preliminary care centers / clinics versus the number of population served in the area (per capita).
**Figure 11:** Evaluation of criterion for the Municipality of Riyadh: Primary health care centers / clinics versus the area of service land (m² / individual).

### 2b) Hospitals

Graphs show the extent of compatibility for the criteria applied in the Municipality of Riyadh with local and international criteria. It was found that the criterion of served population is asymptotic to the served population in Dubai. In addition, most cities do not adopt the criterion of service coverage rate and that the area allocated per capita was higher than the allocated area in the other cities that have been considered. Thus the criterion of land’s area allocated to each individual is relatively high compared with other cities.

**Figure 12:** Evaluation of criterion for the Municipality of Riyadh: hospitals versus service scope rate (in meter).
Figure 13: Evaluation of criterion for the Municipality of Riyadh: hospitals versus the served population (per capita)

![Figure 13](image)

Figure 14: Evaluation of criterion for the Municipality of Riyadh: hospitals versus the area of service land (m²/individual)

![Figure 14](image)

12. The Proposed Criteria for Health Services

The revised criteria regarding health services were reviewed. Based on the results obtained from reviewing planning criteria in Arab and international cities, the nature of the urban and social fabric in the city of Riyadh, in addition to what has been deduced from the extent of compatibility of current criteria with the
practical reality of health services, a Planning criteria was proposed for health services (Taylor & Kuljis, 1998).

The problem of health services was related to implementing the criteria of planning and not to their levels since reviewing and comparing the current status for these services with the criteria of Municipality indicated that the vast majority of clinics and hospitals have broader coverage of service than the criterion of Municipality with serving much more numbers of population than what approved in the criterion of Municipality. They also afford square meters per capita less than the criterion of Municipality. It is therefore proposed to maintain the same criteria with proposing adoption of the minimum limit of criteria for land area needed per person, since the areas of required lands for the clinics are limited areas and should be available within the range of service required even if requires carrying out the expropriation or diversion of government land usage. The explanation is represented in the following:

a) **Primary health care centers / clinics**

During the selection of the health center site, it should be taken into account the site which mediates the neighborhood and located by major or aggregated roads.

*Table 4: The existing and proposed criteria of primary health care centers*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Preliminary care centers</th>
<th>The current criterion of Municipality</th>
<th>Proposed criterion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Service scope rate ( in meter)</td>
<td>800</td>
<td>800</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of served population</td>
<td>8000</td>
<td>8,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Area allocated per individual m²</td>
<td>0.48-0.34</td>
<td>0.25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

b) **Hospitals**
**Public hospitals:** it is preferable for the sites of public hospitals to be near the main roads away from the factories, sports stadiums, markets and workshops as well as it is necessary to choose the hospital entrance on a service road so that emergency entrances located on roads do not suffer from congestion or heavy traffic. Also it is necessary to take into account the area of the site to be sufficient to create green spaces and the different coordinating elements for the site that allows patients to exercise light sports.

**Specialized hospitals:** it has the same considerations of public hospitals except that specialized hospitals with infectious diseases should be located on a distance not less than 500 m from the surrounding residential areas. It is advisable to be isolated and use plants inside and on the sides especially high trees.

The comparison with the quality indicators of service indicates that the number of beds in hospitals is determined in accordance with the benchmark criterion of 4 beds / 1000 individual. Specialists consider that each bed needs 150 m2 of built-up area. Since the good and sustainable design of buildings requires the use of a limited part of the ground with avoiding the use of the site horizontally. Also to adopt investment factor ranges between 3 and 5 which means the need for 30 to 50 m2 per one bed? In addition to surface areas for parking on the basis of a car or two cars per one bed, so that the total area will reach to 80 - 100 m2 per bed for a between 0.32 and 0.4 m2 as shown in Table (5).

**Table 5:** The existing and proposed criteria of hospitals

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hospitals</th>
<th>The current criterion of Municipality</th>
<th>Proposed criterion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Service scope rate (in meter)</td>
<td>3,000-5,000</td>
<td>4,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of served population</td>
<td>16,000</td>
<td>16,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Area allocated per individual m²</td>
<td>3,000-5,000</td>
<td>0.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**13. Conclusion**
Due to the scarcity of lands and the difficulty of its provision, in addition to the application of proposed planning criteria, it is recommended to apply specific techniques and means as follows:

- Regarding high-density neighborhoods where there are no public lands it is necessary to carry out the expropriation within the neighborhood, which is the only solution, sponsored to apply the criterion of health service coverage.

- Regarding low-density neighborhoods where there is an adequate government land or it is easy to carry out the expropriation, applying the proposed criteria of health services is possible.

- Achieving the principles related to economies of scale that is reducing in the cost of construction by collecting service units in a common center.

- Increasing the number of served individuals in the Primary care centers/clinics and reducing the land area for each individual so that they can provide a greater number of services using less space.

- Adopting of service coverage (in meter) for served individuals in hospitals and reducing the land area allocated to each individual to facilitate the provision of land and reduce the deficit in hospitals.

References


http://www.statistics.gov.uk/themes/population/default.asp


www.nationmaster.com/cat/hea-health
Development of Regional Planning Criteria for Health Services in the city of Riyadh

www.nationmaster.com/graph/hea_hos_bed_Per_1000_peo-beds
www.nationmaster.com/graph/hea_hos_bed-health-hospital-beds
www.nationmaster.com/graph/hea_phy_per_1000_peo-physician-per-1-000-people

Issue of New Provinces in Pakistan
Ghulam Ali*  
Razia Musarrat**  
Muhammad Salman Azhar***

**Abstract:** Quaid-e-Azam warned the nation against regionalism and provincialism but due to the incapability of Pakistani rulers after the death of Quaid-e-Azam, these curses spread in the state and the country disintegrated in 1971. In the remaining Pakistan, political stability, coherence and economic prosperity remained a dream and ruling junta ignored many remote areas at the cost of their favourite big cities. The people of these areas felt deprivation and started demanding provinces of their own. New provinces are being created in different federations mainly for administrative purposes and somewhere to appease the ethnic tensions. Issue of new province in Pakistan came in to fore front in 1970 when Yahiya Khan dissolved One Unit and due to the autocratic behaviour of military regimes, demand for new provinces could not become popular. After the approval of 18th Amendment in Yousaf Raze Gilani’s Government, the Issues of Hazara, Bahawalpur and Saraiki provinces got momentum by renaming NWFP as Khyber Pkahtunkhwa. Some political factions started these issues only for political gains and the neglected people of these areas stood by them. In the presence of Article 239 of the constitution and present political and economic condition of the state, this task looks extremely hard.

**Key words;** Federation, Institution, Nationalist, State, Movement

1. Introduction

Quaid-e-Azam on June 25, 1948 at Quetta municipality said “while however one must love one’s town and work for its welfare--indeed because of it one must love better one’s country and work more devotedly for it. Local attachments have their value but what is the value and strength of a “part” within the “whole”, but people so easily forget and begin to prize local, sectional or provincial interests above and regardless of the national interests. It naturally

---

* Lecturer Government Degree College Chowk Azam, Layyah  
E-mail: g.ali666@yahoo.com

** Prof & Chairperson, Department of Political Science, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur  
E-mail: drazia_mussarat@yahoo.com

*** Lecturer, Department of Management Sciences, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur
pains me to find the curse of provincialism holding away over any section of Pakistan”. The above statement explained clearly that there is no room for any political movement on ethnic and linguistic bases in Pakistan.

This statement also indicates the structure of Pakistan. But contrary to Jinnah’s aspiration of becoming a united nation, some feudal lords, political leaders and political activists are working for their vested interests in Pakistan in name of provincial rights. No doubt creation of new federating units on administrative grounds is a justified formula all over the world. India has also appeased the ethnic and linguistic tension by enhancing administrative zones or by authorizing some special status to some areas but creation of new provinces on ethnic or linguistic grounds with in federation is hardly done in federations like Pakistan (Koreshi, 2012, June 20).

2. Demand for Hazara Province

The movement for Hazara province was started in 1987 and the party which was formed to lead the movement was “Hazara Qaumi Mahaz” (HQM). The demand of the leaders of HQM throughout the years remained to create a new province for Hazara people by the territorial adjustment of NWFP on administrative grounds. Pakistani government tried to solve the problem by administrative measure and succeeded in subduing their demands for creation of new province but when 18th amendment was passed in 2010 and NWFP was named as Khyber Pakhtun Khawa on linguistic and ethnic lines, this act provided a new enthusiasm to this issue. Violence and protests started all over the Hazara region to demand the new province on ethnic lines. Their stress is that in Hazara region Hindko and Gojri speaking people are dominant as compared to Pashtun people. By renaming NWFP as Khyber Pakhtun Khwa they are in danger of losing their identity. On the first day of riots 10 people were killed and almost two hundreds were injured on May 2, 2010. Wheel jam and shutter down strike was witnessed in Hazara division. Protests were started under the leadership of Baba Haider Zaman to support the demand of Hazara province and in opposition to renaming NWFP as Khyber Pakhtun Khwa. Business centers in areas like Mansehra, Battagram,
Kohistan and Haripur remained closed on strike day. Current situation is that it looks that federal government and provincial leadership of Khyber Pakhtun Khwa once again succeeded in subduing the movement but it is myopic vision. There are still currents which are trying to organize the movement on linguistic and rural bases. Renaming NWFP as KPK on the insistence of Awami National Party (ANP) may be correct decision but it has raised the racial and lingual sentiments all over the state. It may prove harmful for federation in Pakistan (Politics of New Province, 2012, January 8).

Now the situation is that ANP, PPP and MQM are against the creation of Hazara Province mainly for political gains but the economic loss by the creation of Hazara Province for KPK is also obvious. Presently there is only one dam in KPK that is Khanpur Dam which is supplying electricity to the province, if Hazara is created as a new province it will fall in the boundaries of new province that will cause electricity problem for KPK. Besides this Hazara division is also famous for its minerals and tourism which is a source of huge income for KPK, if Hazara is separated from KPK it will create a shortage of income for Khyber Pakhtun Khwa (Nishtar, 2008, May 8).

3. Demand for Saraiki Province:

Punjab is a big province of Pakistan, having 36 districts, population of 81.3 million and an area of 205343 sq km (Government of Pakistan, 2003). This province is linguistically and economically diversified. Some areas of this province which have enjoyed the status of separate province in the past like Bahawalpur or neglected areas like that of Southern Punjab are now facing the issue of new provinces in the form of Bahawalpur or Saraiki province. This issue of new provinces is mainly raised by the feudal lords of these areas only for political purposes but we cannot ignore mismanagement of the rulers of the province. It is the fact that the political leaders of these areas always remained in government but they did not do anything for the uplift of these areas (PILDAT, 2011). The poor economic condition of the people
development of regional planning criteria for health services in the city of Riyadh

of these areas which is due to the mismanagement of the ruling elites is the main cause for raising the issue of Saraiki province.

It may be said that the media highlighted this issue 2009 when sentiments of people living in Saraiki belt badly hurt by knowing about a report regarding economic discrimination in the province. In June 2009 during the question session, National Assembly members were informed that Rs. 20 billion loan was received by ministry of communication from World Bank for the construction of mega projects in the country. But Southern Punjab was deprived from any project. Total 18 projects were started, of those 8 were started in Central and Northern Punjab. In the same way out of 20 billion loan from Asian Development Bank for improving road infrastructure Saraiki belt received a meagre share and only a project of 37 Km road was started on Multan Muzaffargarh road. Total estimation of 2009-10 budget of Punjab was 490 billion out of which only 5 billion were allotted for Saraiki areas which also aggravated the sense of deprivation of the people (PILDAT (2011). In this way a new discussion was started for an old issue when in 2009 some parliamentarian belonging to Saraiki areas of Punjab demanded for a new province in the area of southern Punjab. Members of provincial assembly of Punjab and National Assembly relating to Southern Punjab started this discussion in media with strong arguments. Saraiki has a long history. It existed as a regional language for centuries ago. In the 19th century it has been written in Urdu script. In 1960’s it has been standardized for writing purpose and for the purpose that people of southern Punjab could have their one identity symbol instead of being recognized by local linguistic symbol like Derawali, Multani, Riasti or Bahawalpuri etc. It was given the status of separate language during the regime of Zia-ul-Haq in 1981’s census. Besides Southern Punjab, Saraiki is also widely spoken in Sindh, in some areas of Khyber Pakhtun Khwa and Baluchistan provinces. Nearly 70000 emigrants and their descendants who had been migrated from Pakistan to India in 1947 also spoke Saraiki. Population and housing census of 1998 indicated that 13.9 million people speak Saraiki all over the country. The major Saraiki speaking areas are
comprised on near about 17 districts of southern Punjab along with some southern areas of Khyber Pakhtun Khwa (Jukes, 2003).

Table No.1. Pakistan by Mother Language

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language</th>
<th>Punjab</th>
<th>Sindh</th>
<th>NWFP</th>
<th>Balochistan</th>
<th>Pakistan</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>All U</td>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>Erba</td>
<td>All U</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urdu</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>10.1</td>
<td>21.1</td>
<td>41.5</td>
<td>0.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Punjabi</td>
<td>75.2</td>
<td>78.8</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>11.5</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pashto</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>11.5</td>
<td>73.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sindhi</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>59.7</td>
<td>25.8</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balochi</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saraiki</td>
<td>17.4</td>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>3.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>20.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: (Kennedy, 2002).

Above Table shows that Saraiki speaking people are living in all provinces of Pakistan but their highest number is residing in Punjab.

Demand for separate Saraiki province is not a new one. It has a history of past three decades. It was started during the military rulers of 1960’s when Yahya Khan dismembered one unit and annexed Bahawalpur with southern Punjab. Some historians viewed one unit as against the spirit of accession signed by the princely states which gave birth to ethnic politics to Saraiki areas along with other parts of the country. The first time in 1960s Saraiki movement started by the people as a cultural and linguistic movement only to preserve their linguistic identity. In 1971 movement for the restoration of Bahawalpur province started and during these years, Saraiki movement also got momentum. After the military coup of 1977, Zia-ul-Haq started centralization policies which increased the deprivations of Saraiki peoples and after his death in 1988 leaders of Saraiki movement openly demanded for the recognition of Saraiki nationalism (Adney, n.d.). Six major political parties are working for Saraiki cause which are:
Major grievances of Saraiki areas are the settlement of outsiders in their areas who reduced their land holding and employment opportunities, negligence of Saraiki areas by Punjab government in developmental projects which raised the poverty in these areas up to 43% as compared to 27.7% of other areas in Punjab (Mayo, 2009, October 12). The purposed Saraiki province is consisted of 22 district of Punjab along with some Saraiki speaking areas of Khyber Pakhtun Khwa. Sarasikis nationalists argue that when Sindhis are living in Sindh, Baluchis in Baluchistan, Punjabis in Punjab, Pakhtuns in Khyber Pakhtun Khwa then why not Sarasikis in Saraikistan or Saraiki Sooba. Supporters of Saraiki province also claim that creation of Saraiki province will enhance administration and good governance of these areas and will result in decentralization of power. Moreover with the separate Saraiki province a separate budget will be allocated for Saraiki areas which certainly will be more than that which the present government is spending on Saraiki areas that will lead to developmental projects, more employment and less poverty (Liaqatpuri, 2010, April 16).

4. Revival of Bahawalpur Province

Land of Pirs, Sayyeds and Nawabs, Bahawalpur with a rich cultural heritage and vast desert was a State before the creation of Pakistan and a dynasty of Nawabs was ruling on it. It was ruled by Abbasi Nawabs for 228 years. This State came into existence in 1727 and came to an end in 1955 when One Unit was created in former West Pakistan (Civil and Military Gazette Press, 1951). Now it is the largest division of Punjab comprising on Bahawalpur, Bahawalnagar and Rahim Yar Khan areas. Total area of this division is 2880sq Kms. According to the 1998’s census 7.158
million people reside in this region which is 10.3 percent of the total population of Punjab and 5.6 percent of the total population of Pakistan. In the assemblies, 15 MNAs and 31 MPAs are representing the region. This area has its unique importance for defense and agriculture. It is a historical truth that before the creation of One Unit in 1955 Bahawalpur was enjoying the status of province and it merged into One Unit with the same status. Cotton and wheat are the special crops of the area which contribute 23 and 10 percent of the total production of the state. It also has three hundred miles long border with India that requires special desert warfare tactics. But besides all this the region is one of the most backward areas of Pakistan. People of the area still remember the rule of Abbasi Nawabs who not only founded the State but also provided security, prosperity and justice to the people. Nawab Salah ud din Abbasi the grandson of last Nawab has great respect among the people. Nawabs not only founded the state in 1727 but also developed the state in a manner that it became one of the richest states of the Subcontinent. They constructed schools, colleges and hospitals for the masses. They laid the foundation of Railway tracks. They dug canals for agricultural purposes especially Sutlej Valley Project was completed that brought prosperity to the region. This region has witnessed two movements in the past and in the present the same two movements are in progress in this area. One is Saraiki province movement and the other is Bahawalpur province movement. Saraiki Province Movement was started in the area in 1971 with the objective of creation of a new province by dividing Punjab on cultural and linguistic grounds. Pioneers of Saraiki province movement claimed that they are being neglected by the different governments of Punjab. Their major grievance is the settlement of outsiders in their area that has affected the development of native people. As for as Bahawalpur region is concerned, this movement has not many roots in the area. Few Saraiki speaking people are supporting it while the Urdu, Punjabi and speakers of other languages are against the creation of new province on cultural and linguistic grounds. They also feared if Saraiki province is created then Multan would be its capital and it
is not acceptable for them to be ruled by the people of other region. They are also of the view that they are not in favor of creating new province rather they are demanding the restoration of their past provincial status given to the state in 1951.

Accession of the State

On 30 April 1951 Nawab Sadiq Muhammad Khan Abbasi-V signed an agreement which was known as Supplementary Instrument of Accession and the then Governor General of Pakistan Khawaja Nazimudin accepted it. This agreement declared the state with its same identity as province under the government of India Act 1935 in legislative and administrative fields. All the subjects that belong to the central list under Government of India Act 1935 were transferred to the central government of Pakistan (Dawn, 1951, May 1). At this time government of Pakistan clarified that rules and regulations applied for the accession of Bahawalpur State are not applicable to other states because every state has its unique status and geography. Even after the accession, the Nawab of Bahawalpur was enjoying the office of the constitutional head of the state. Bahawalpur had its all major provincial institutions like that of Public Service Commission, Auditor General, Accountant General and a High Court. After the accession, elections were held in 1951 in the state and a 49 member’s assembly was elected that started functioning in 1952. It is a historical fact that till the creation of One Unit, Bahawalpur enjoyed the status of province and the provincial assembly of Bahawalpur adopted a resolution for the accession to the West Pakistan like the provincial assemblies of other provinces. In 1969 Yahiya Khan assumed the power by imposing Martial Law in the country and he dissolved the One Unit in 1970 on the demands of opposition parties and Bahawalpur was declared part of Punjab. When One Unit was created an agreement was signed between government of Pakistan and Nawab of Bahawalpur that whenever One Unit will be dissolved, Bahawalpur will be given the status of Province. After dissolution of One Unit, Bahawalpur’s merger in Punjab was violation of agreement. This was the point from where Bahawalpur province movement was started. In November 1969
Newspapers started publishing news about the dissolution of One Unit and declaring Bahawalpur as the part of Punjab. Knowing about this Allama Arshad called a meeting of leading political parties to probe into the matter. In April 1970 strikes were observed in favor of restoration of Bahawalpur province and on 4th April 1970 security agencies of Punjab government crushed the movement by opening fire on the protesters in which two persons were killed and hundreds were injured. Besides this hundreds were arrested by provincial authorities that inflamed the region. One of the leading figures of Anti One Unit movement was hailed from Bahawalpur. He filed a petition in Supreme Court of Pakistan for restoration of the province but Court dismissed the petition. It is also the historical fact that from the origin of the state of Bahawalpur to the creation of One Unit, this region has retained it internal sovereignty. Even when Sikhs occupied the whole Punjab, Bahawalpur remained out of their rule (Javid, n.d.).

There are two main reasons for which Bahawalpur province movement was started that are loss of internal sovereignty of people of the region and economic deprivations of the people because during the rule of Nawabs, people were enjoying both of them. Although Nawabs ruled in autocratic style yet they provided all economic, educational and social facilities to the people. Nawabs established schools and colleges for educational purposes. All colleges were affiliated with Punjab University. Intelligent, needy and poor students were provided stipends, intelligent students were also sent abroad for higher education on State’s expenses. Another fact is that Bahawalpur State had been economically strong throughout the history; it helped firstly British and later on Pakistan. When it was merged into One Unit it had a surplus budget. But when it was declared as the part of Punjab, it was neglected by selfish rulers; its sources were not utilized in the region. People were kept deprived from educational and economic activities and moreover Sutlej a river that provided water for this cotton and wheat belt was given to India. A sense of deprivation prevailed all over the region and masses provided support to those elements who were demanding the restoration of Bahawalpur Province. People of the area feel that they are not duly represented
in different provincial institutions like that of Public Service Commission, High court, Industrial Development Corporation and even in political and administrative institutions. After the approval of 18th amendment in 2010, when some political parties raised the issue of Saraiki province, the issue of Bahawalpur province once again was highlighted only for political purposes by some politicians without knowing its consequences for federation of Pakistan. In May 2012 provincial assembly of Punjab unanimously adopted two resolutions asking to central government to constitute a commission for the creation of new province of Southern Punjab and for restoration of Bahawalpur province (Business Recorder, 2012, May 2).

5. Issue of Jinnah Pur or Mohajir Province

Many thinkers are of the opinion that MQM is mainly responsible for raising Jinnah pur or Mohajir province issue but Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto is also responsible for sowing the seeds of division in Sindh. Currently this dead issue is raised by Punjab’s chief minister Shehbaz Sharif only for counter attack on PPP for raising the issue of Saraiki province but in the past some factions of MQM raised their voices in favor of Jinnah Pur to secure their identity and economic interests. Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto introduced quota system in Sindh in 1970 for the people of rural and urban areas of Sindh in name of providing better economic facilities to the people of the province (Haq, 1997). But the actual situation was that he wanted to maintain his hold over PPPs vote bank in interior Sindh which was generally in the control of feudal lords of province. He introduced his party in Sindh as the champion of Sindhi cause and favored the demands of nationalist Sindhis. The Urdu speaking people of Karachi, Sukkar and Hyderabad who migrated to Pakistan and settled in this province after partition of India were called as Mohajirs and “Panah gir” (refugees) by the native Sindhis and were thought as the burden on their economy (Azad, 1996, May 4). Hatred of native people of the province against Urdu speaking peoples and bigger quota of jobs for rural areas of Sindh created sense of deprivation in urban areas who were dominated by Mohajirs. It resulted in the form of All Pakistan Mohajir Students
Organization which was founded by Altaf Hussain in 1978 that turned into Mohajir Qaumi Movement in 1984 and now is working under the banner of Mutahida Qaumi Movement since 1997. The continuing racist system in Sindh posed a threat for the identity of Mohajirs. Currently MQM is supporting PPP at the stance of Mohajir province and talking about the unity of Sindh as many other nationalist parties are against the creation of new province in Sindh but the fact is that violence and unrest in Sindh clearly describing the situation and economic hub of Pakistan Karachi is burning due to identity crises (Politics of More Provinces, 2012, January 8).

6. Some realities not to be neglected.

From the above discussion it is clear that creation of new provinces is a matter of great concern but here are some points which need careful considerations.

(i) What would be the criteria for the creation of new provinces? Some parties like that of PML-N insist that this should be done only on administrative grounds. An effective local government system can enhance the administrative capability of neglected areas so according to them creation of new provinces will harm the federation of the state.

(ii) Stance of the ANP is that the creation of Saraiki province is necessary for the identity of the Saraiki people but it is against the creation of Hazara Province, if it is true than why not Hazara province. If a Saraiki province is created in name of identity then a Pashtun province in northern Balochistan, an Urdu province or Mohajir province in Sindh, and a Baloch province in South Western Punjab is also seems necessary.

(iii) Another question is, as how these provinces are created. What will be the mechanism for altering the boundaries of existing provinces? Article 239(4) strictly prohibits such exercise by saying that no bill to amend the constitution that can change the boundaries of provinces can be presented to the head of state for his assent unless it has been approved by the provincial assembly of that particular province by a two third majority. It also needs
Development of Regional Planning Criteria for Health Services in the city of Riyadh
two third majorities in both houses of parliament for its approval. The ground realities for creating new provinces are not in favor of the issue. Economic condition of Pakistan is very poor. Allocation of budget for new administration of new provinces is also a difficult task, so we can say that issue of new provinces is not more than political point scoring.

7. Conclusion
Creation of new federating units always remained matter of great concern for Pakistan. Issue of new provinces came into forefront after the approval of 18th amendment when NWFP was renamed as Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. After this Hazara Province and Saraiki province movements started in the country. Now the ground was open for political point scoring and major political parties like PPP, PML-N, ANP and MQM all started to impress the people by their views. In the presence of Article 239(4) and keeping in view the economic and political situation of the state it looks very difficult to create new provinces in the country.

References


Business Recorder. (2012, May 2)

Civil and Military Gazette Press. (1951) The Civil and Military Gazette Lahore, p.30


Javid, U. (n.d.) Movement for Bahawalpur Province. (Online)


The Statesmen. (1951, May 2) The Statesmen Dehli.
Development of Regional Planning Criteria for Health Services in the city of Riyadh

Human Rights and Role of the Press in Pakistan
Ghulam Shabir*
Shumaila Ahmed**

Abstract: Human rights are considered important in every period of time. The present research was conducted to study the situation of human rights in Pakistan and role of the press from 1977 to 2002. The objective of this descriptive study was to explore the positive or negative role of print media in the situation of human rights in Pakistan. The present study focused on the most highly circulated and popular newspapers of Pakistan that is, Daily Jang and Daily Dawn, using systematic sampling technique. By using Statistical Package for the Social Sciences (SPSS), the descriptive method was used to represent findings of the research; the relationship among the data collected was also explored through statistical methods. The hypothesis about these phenomena and linkages among them were tested through chi-square test. It was also analyzed through the study that either the newspaper does not give proper coverage to human rights issues or play its part in a better manner in the reporting of human rights issues. The findings of the study reveal that Daily Jang in Pakistan portrays the human rights in a negative way and usually gives a very little space to the issues of human rights in their daily edition. A detailed discussion about the findings, demographic variable, acceptance and rejection of hypothesis was made in the relevant portion of the study after concluding it. Recommendations were also made to improve the existing situation of human rights and role of print media in Pakistan.

Key words: Human rights, Categories, Daily Jang, Daily Dawn.

1. Introduction

Human rights are the rights to which all humans are entitled. They are rights inherent to all human beings; no matter the nationality, place of residence, sex, ethnic or national origin, colour, language,
religion or any other status, we are all equally entitled to our human rights without discrimination. These rights are all interrelated, interdependent and indivisible. Concept of human rights is a result of human beings struggle to remain human beings. This struggle has always been present in all the societies against political, economic, social and cultural oppression as well as against injustices and inequalities. No doubt, all human beings are born free and equal in dignity and rights. They are endowed with reason and conscience and should act towards one another in a spirit of brotherhood.

Human rights are a set of individual and collective rights that have been formally promoted and protected through international and domestic law since the UN Declaration of Human Rights in 1948. Arguments, theories and protections of such rights, however, have been in existence for much longer through the great charter of Magna Carta. But Islam spoke of human rights as early as the fourteenth century, before any Magna Carta had been drawn up in Britain and also before UN Declaration of the Human Rights. Since the UN Declaration, the evolution of their express legal protection has grown rapidly.

Today there are numerous international treaties on human rights promulgated since the UN Declaration to which an increasingly large number of nation states are a party, while the language of human rights increasingly pervades our moral, legal and political vocabulary to such an extent that many have claimed we now live in an age of rights.

To begin with, human rights in simple language may be regarded as those fundamental rights to which every man or women living in any part of the world is entitled by virtue of having been born as human being. In other words, human right is a genus to which humanitarian law is a species. The former relates to the basic rights of human beings everywhere at all times, and the later relates to the rights of particular categories of human beings, particularly, the sick, the wounded, prisoners of war during armed conflicts and hostility. In common parlance, human rights may refer to those
rights which are inherent in the people by virtue of their being human beings, the rights that are required for the full and complete development of human personality.

The human rights landscape looked very different at the beginning of the 1990’s than it was at the end of the 1970’s with more advocates and institutions addressing more issues in more impressive manner. Yet even as human rights, NGOs grew in number and human rights institutions proliferated, the number of claims of violations of human rights has increased and the record of enforcement grew ever more dismal. That is why concern about the rights and their protection has always been the uppermost in the minds of sages and philosophers, not only in the present time but in every period of human history.

In a democratic society, free media can be a powerful instrument against abuse and violation of human rights. Media play an important role in this crusade against violation of human rights.

Mass Media “The fourth Estate” after the legislature, the executive and the judiciary, has become the prime educative, informative and catalytic agent in safeguarding human rights. It is the most systematic and effective means of reaching quickly and communicating convincingly with a large number of people in a very short span of time.

Media is rightly called the “Watch dog” of peoples’ rights and the “mirror of contemporary society”.

Vigilant and enlightened mass media can go a long way in spreading human rights awareness to achieve this objective; it is essential that agencies of mass media should remain free, independent, responsive, trained in human rights and committed to social welfare.

Media influence people at the social and cultural levels and its impact is more popular, lasting and far-reaching than all the government agencies put together. Media can also establish an effective and impressive dialogue among people and between government and people hence its role and responsibility increases
many fold. It provides a free platform for popular dialogue and is
dreaded by wrong doers and violators of human rights.

Pakistan is a developing country. Due to its economic crises and
poverty, the basic human rights are always neglected. In our
country, the role played by media in the struggle for protection of
human rights would increase in the coming days as media
penetration is going to multiply. The studies done by World
Association of Newspapers reveal declining popularity for print
and electronic media in the Western World due to the onslaught of
internet, however, this is not happening in Pakistan. In Pakistan all
forms of mass media like print, Television, Radio and internet are
expanding. The multiplicity of media can be useful to maximize
human rights coverage in the media.

2. Human Rights - Background

There are two major approaches to the question of human rights,
the Western and Islamic approach. The comparative analysis of
both approaches will enable us to study human rights issue in its
proper perspective.

i) The Western Approach

Mostly Western people claimed that the world got the concept of
basic human rights from the West. According to them the world
got the concept of modern human rights from the Magna Carta
which was issued by King John in 1215, but it did not limit the
power of the king in middle ages as it was just a piece of paper.
The truth is that until 17th century (Elizabeth and Stuart periods)
no one knew that the Magna Carta contained principles requiring
the king to renounce certain rights, respect legal procedure control
of parliament on the right of taxation and accept that the will of
king could be bound by law. If the people who had drafted Magna
Carta were living today they would have been greatly surprised if
they were told that their documents contained all these ideals and
principles. It shows that the West had no concepts of human rights
before the seventeenth century. However, it is only at the end of
the 18th century in the constitutions of America and French that
we can find the practical proof and demonstration of these
concepts. After the American and French constitutions, many other countries also included the provision of basic human rights in their constitutions, but these rights were only given on paper and were not given to people in their real life.

In the middle of the 20th century, United Nation passed Universal Declaration of Human Rights against genocide and also framed the regulations to check it. But the role of United Nation in providing and protecting these rights is very obvious. It has passed several resolutions and regulations against the violation of human rights. But there is no single resolution which can be enforced; these are all just piece of papers and have no physical or moral force to enforce them. Most United Nations resolutions have been violated at different places; the major examples are Kashmir and Palestine issues, where United Nation has failed to enforce its resolutions against violation of human rights.

ii) The Islamic Approach

Islam is a universal religion which introduced the concepts of human rights before any other religion in the world. Islam did not only give the ideas of a noble individual regardless of his caste, colour and creed but has restored the dignity of entire humanity and paved way for an integral forum of existence for all human beings. Dignity of man was restored not only in terms of their status in society but also in terms of security and sanctity. The Quran declared: ‘if you kill a man, you kill all mankind’; nothing could be a more comprehensive and concise injunction than this positive declaration.

When we talk about human rights in Islam we really mean that these rights are directly granted by God. These rights are not given by any kind of legislative assembly. The rights by king or legislative assembly can be withdrawn in the same way in which they are conferred, such as the dictators, they give the rights to their people when they are pleased and withdraw them when they wish, they also violate them when they like. But in Islam all the rights are given to man by God. No legislative assembly or government has the authority to abrogate or withdraw them. These
rights are the part of Islamic faith. Every Muslim or administration must have to accept, recognize and enforce them. The 1973 constitution of Pakistan describes the fundamental human rights which are to be available to all citizens’ women as well as men wherever they may be, as well as all people temporarily or permanently in Pakistan. The executive is bound to implement these rights while the judiciary is bound to take notice of any violations and provide redress on individual complaints or take notice of its own (called ‘Suo moto’ notice) of any gross violations of a collective right.

3. Literature Review

Pollis (2002) narrates that it is ironic that in an era in which a consensus on the scope and substance of human rights is evolving, this very consensus is threatened by global forces against which both states and human rights activists are relatively powerless.

Shaukat (1980) focuses on the fact that concern about the rights and welfare of the people has been uppermost in the minds of philosophers and scholars in every period of human history. In practical politics however, rulers have often denied these rights. It is only the religion of Islam which gives importance to human rights on practical grounds with equality and liberty in every field of life.

Arvin (2006) points out that the wisdom of drafting a statement of rights for the entire world on the basis of values of the societies of Western Europe and America was questioned even at the time of framing the Universal Declaration of Human Rights in 1948. In the decades, since it came into being, the Declaration has come under increased criticism at various times from states in Asia and Africa. The charge has been repeatedly made by policy-makers and scholars that prevailing ideas of human rights are of Western origin and not necessarily of relevance to societies in the rest of the world.

Clapham (2007) says that different people currently see human rights in different ways. For some, invoking human rights is a heartfelt morally justified demand to rectify all sorts of injustice;
for others it is no more than a slogan to be treated with suspicion or even hostility.

Garling (1979) states that by its very nature, human rights work is individual and ad hoc. Any attempts at systematization go against this grain. Yet there is a widely recognized need for more efficient flow of information and more systematic referral of individual casework.

Speaking on Human Rights and Asian values, Jacobsen (2000) - contesting national identities and cultural representations in Asia, says that since Asian values are used to promote cultural relativism as an argument against the universality of human rights, it has created a sense of urgency among critical intellectuals and in human rights circles.

Regarding human rights complaints systems, Sulibian (2003) narrates that since at the international and regional levels human rights have been promoted through legal standards, to what degree have human rights been protected in fact? If we take ten of the most international instruments of human rights, we find that there is an array of measures available for the formal implementation of human rights. Subbian (2003) suggests that international area is the most obvious area for the promotion of human rights.

Zamir (1990) says that the history of human rights tells a detailed story of the attempts made to define basic dignity and worth of the human being and his or her most fundamental entitlement. These efforts continue to this day.

Sharif (1993) narrates that man is elevated to the human level only when he attains consciousness of human rights and begins to acknowledge and respect the rights of his fellow beings; however, human rights are not mere social exigencies, rather these rights are ingrained in human nature, emanate from the human conscience and constitute the warp and woof of the human soul.

Timothy (1997) says that there is an incredibly widespread assumption that ‘human rights’ is a Western concept, meant for a certain group of people and not for all human beings universally.
This is sheer political propaganda perpetuated by third world leaders with vested interests.

Bhalla (1991) narrates that one of the significant aspects of contemporary international relations is the importance now being attached to the promotion and protection of human rights. Institutions of great importance spend an increasing amount of their time on questions of human rights and an increasing sector of the membership of international institutions accords to human rights question a priority that in many cases even exceeds questions of peace and security. The increasing interdependence of modern world-economically, strategically, culturally, politically and technologically has made concern for human rights a major international fact.

Forsythe (1989) narrates that problems of human rights have often been viewed in different ways, especially the question of how much emphasis should be placed on each category of rights civil and political or economic social and cultural. Arguments have been advanced in favour of economic and social rights as prerequisites for the enjoyment of civil and political rights. On the other hand, it has been argued that civil and political rights are preconditions for the realization of economic and social rights.

According to UNESCO (1977), on ‘human rights’ approach, it is not surprising to remember that at least half the population of the globe are effectively deprived of their basic human rights; the uprooted, oppressed, illiterate, unemployed, starving and so on.

After complete study of the available literature we may observe that some fragmented efforts have been made by the scholars, professionals, practitioners, and activists of human rights and media persons.

The duplication of work is also visible in respect of press. Government relationship and human rights policies. But this is due to the fact that no serious and fruitful effort has been made to establish human rights studies for journalists and media practitioners as an independent theory.

4. Research Methodology
As a research methodology the researcher has taken two kinds of researches, namely historical research, and qualitative and quantitative research.

i) Historical Research

Historical research is the critical investigation of events developments and experiences of the past, the careful weighing of evidence of the validity of sources of information on the past and the interpretation of the weighed evidence. Historical background of the topic is studied through the study of documents.

ii) Qualitative and Quantitative Research

The research is conducted using content analysis as a research design. Walizer and Wiener (1978) have defined content analysis as any systematic procedure devised to examine the content of recorded information.

As a method of social research, content analysis is a documentary method that aims at a qualitative or quantitative analysis of the content of texts, pictures films and other forms of verbal, visual or written communication.

iii) Hypotheses of the Study

\( H_1 \): Urdu newspapers give more coverage to the issues of human rights.

\( H_2 \): English newspapers report the issues related to human rights in a negative way.

Rationale of the Newspapers

The newspapers selected for the study are considered the most popular, highly, circulated influential, opinion maker and leading newspapers of Pakistan. One National Daily of Urdu language and one of English language is used here: Daily Jang and Daily Dawn. The period of study is 26 years from January 1977 to December 2002. The three most important categories selected for study of human rights are: i) women ii) children and iii) minorities. For these categories, the most important and general issues related to human rights are: i) gender discrimination ii) sexual harassment iii) 

53
physical torture iv) child labor, and v) general discrimination. Reporting of all these issues is analyzed in three ways, viz: i) positive ii) negative and iii) neutral.

5. Findings

Testing for association between the attributes of categories and issues of the Daily “Jang” from 1977 to 2002

This test is performed to check the association between categories and issues of the Daily “Jang” from 1977 to 2001 and see if there is any association among the attributes characterized. This test is performed on the 5% level of significance and chi-square test is used to check the association. The cross table of the categories and issues are as shown in Table 1.

**Table 1.** Association between the attributes of categories and issues of the Daily “Jang” from 1977 to 2002.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attribute</th>
<th>None</th>
<th>Gender discrimination</th>
<th>Sexual harassment</th>
<th>Physical torture</th>
<th>Child labour</th>
<th>General discrimination</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Categories</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>None</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minorities</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Table indicates that in human rights issues women are mostly highlighted by the “Jang” newspaper. 210 (70%) newspapers from the total of 300 contain reports on different issues about the women. In these 70% women issues, the maximum number of cases is about the sexual harassment. From the 210 reports of the women, 126 (60%) are about the sexual harassment. When we
apply the chi-square test to this, we then see that there is an association between the attributes at 5% level of significance (Chi Square = 4.70).

i) Testing for association between the attributes of categories and reporting of the Daily “Jang” from 1977 to 2002

Chi Square test is performed to check the association between categories and reporting of the newspaper “Daily Jang” from 1977 to 2001, and see if there is any association among the attributes characterized. This test is performed on the 5% level of significance and chi-square test is used to check the association. The cross table of the categories and their reporting is shown in Table 2.

**Table 2.** Association between the attributes of categories and reporting of the Daily “Jang” from 1977 to 2002.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attribute</th>
<th>None</th>
<th>Positive</th>
<th>Negative</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Categories</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>None</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minorities</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>161</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above Table reveals that women are mostly highlighted by the “Daily Jang.” Two hundred and ten (210) (70%) newspapers from the total 300 contain reports on the different issues about the women. In these 70% women issues and in the case of reporting, the maximum number of cases reported negatively. From the 210 reports of the women, 126 (60%) are negatively reported. When we apply the chi-square test to this, we then see that there is
association between the attributes at 5% level of significance (Chi Square = 2.15).

ii) Testing for association between the attributes of issues and reporting of the Daily “Jang” from 1977 to 2002

This test is performed to check the association between issues and reporting of the “Daily Jang” from 1977 to 2002, and see if there is any association among the attributes characterized. This test is performed on the 5% level of significance and chi-square test is used to check the association. The cross table of the issues and their reporting is shown in Table 3.


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attribute</th>
<th>None</th>
<th>Positive</th>
<th>Negative</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender discrimination</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sexual harassment</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical torture</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General discrimination</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>161</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table No.3 shows the relationship between issues of human rights and their reporting by the “Daily Jang” newspaper. From the table, we can see that sexual harassment issues are mostly repeated in the newspaper. One hundred and forty-six (146) (50%) newspapers from the total of 300 contain the reports about the sexual harassment issues. In these 50% issues, maximum number of cases is negatively reported. From the 146 reports, 84 (58%) are negatively reported. When we apply the chi-square test to check the association between the issues and their reporting, then we see
that there is association between the attributes at 5% level of significance (Chi Square = 2.44).

iii) Testing for association between the attributes of categories and issues of the Daily “Dawn” from 1977 to 2002

This test is performed to check association between categories and issues of the “Daily Dawn” from 1977 to 2001, and see if there is any association among the attributes characterized? This test is performed on the 5% level of significance and chi-square test is used to check the association. The cross table of the categories and issues are shown in Table 4.


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attribute</th>
<th>None</th>
<th>Gender discrimination</th>
<th>Sexual harassment</th>
<th>Physical torture</th>
<th>Child labour</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>None</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>163</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minorities</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>176</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table No.4 shows that in human rights issues, women are mostly highlighted by the “Daily Dawn” newspaper. Two hundred and fifty-five (255) (85%) newspapers from the total 300 contain reports on different issues about the women. In these 85% women issues, the maximum number of cases is about the sexual harassment. From the 255 reports of the women, 163 (64%) are about sexual harassment. When we apply the chi-square test to this, we then see that there is association between the attributes at 5% level of significance (Chi Square = 2.65).
iv) Testing for association between the attributes of categories and reporting of the Daily “Dawn” from 1977 to 2002

This test is performed to check the association between categories and reporting of the “Daily Dawn” from 1977 to 2002, and see if there is any association among the attributes characterized. This test is performed on the 5% level of significance and chi-square test is used to check the association. The cross table of the categories and their reporting is shown in Table 5.

Table 5. Association b/w the attributes of categories and reporting of the Daily “Dawn” from 1977 to 2002.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attribute</th>
<th>None</th>
<th>Positive</th>
<th>Negative</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>None</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>165</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minorities</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>199</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Table indicates the relationship among attributes of the categories of human rights and their reporting’s. Two hundred and fifty-five (255) (85%) newspapers from the total of 300 contain reports on different issues about the women. In these 85% women issues and in case of reporting, the maximum number of cases is negatively reported. From the 255 reports of the women, 165 (65%) are negatively reported. When we apply the chi-square test, then we see that there is association between the attributes at 5% level of significance (Chi Square = 2.27).

v) Testing for association between the attributes of issues and reporting of the Daily “Dawn” from 1977 to 2002

Chi Square test is performed to check the association between issues and reporting of the “Daily Dawn” from 1977 to 2002, and see if there is any association among the attributes characterized.
This test is performed on the 5% level of significance and chi-square test is used to check the association. The cross table of the issues and their reporting is shown in Table 6.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attribute</th>
<th>None</th>
<th>Positive</th>
<th>Negative</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>None</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender discrimination</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sexual harassment</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical torture</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>199</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Table shows the relationship between issues of human rights and their reporting’s by the “Daily Dawn” newspaper. From the table, it is clear that sexual harassment issues are mostly repeated in the newspaper. One hundred and seventy-six (176) (59%) newspapers from the total of 300 contain the reports about the sexual harassment issues. In these 59% issues, maximum number of cases is negatively reported. From the 176 reports, 120 (68%) are negatively reported. When we apply the chi-square test to this, we then see that there is association between the attributes at 5% level of significance (Chi-Square = 3.072).

6. Discussion

1) Daily “Jang”:It is observed that the space in centimetres occupied by the reports on the human rights in the daily Urdu newspaper “Jang” shows that the space varies from “0 cm” (means no news about the human rights) to the 48 cm space in the Jang newspaper. The news with space 2 cm is mostly repeated in the newspaper.
It is observed that the categories of reports on the human rights in the daily Urdu newspaper “Jang” reveals 70% reports about the women, 20% reports about the children, 3% reports about the minorities, and the remaining 7% have nothing about the human rights. If we compare all categories of the human rights, we can then reach a conclusion that mostly repeated reports are about the women.

It is observed that all issues of reports on human rights in the daily Urdu newspaper “Jang” shows that 49% reports about sexual harassment, 20% reports about physical torture, 17% reports about gender discrimination, 5% reports about child labour, 1% reports about the general discrimination and the remaining 8% have nothing about the human rights. If we compare all the issues about the human rights, then we can say it mostly reports about the sexual harassment.

It is observed that the reporting criteria of any report on human rights in the daily Urdu newspaper “Jang” shows that 54% reports are negatively reported, about 28% reports are positively reported, 11% reports are neutral and the remaining 8% have nothing about the reporting decision on human rights. If we compare all the reporting signs about human rights, then most reports are negatively reported.

ii) Daily “Dawn”:
It is observed that the space in centimetres occupied by the news on human rights in the daily English newspaper “Dawn” indicates that the space varies from “0 cm” to 18 cm space in the newspaper. The news with space 6 cm is mostly repeated in the newspaper. It is observed that all the categories of reports on human rights in the daily English newspaper “Dawn” indicates that 85% reports about the women, 11% reports about the children, 2% reports about the minorities and the remaining 2% have nothing about the human rights. If we compare all categories of human rights, then we can reach a conclusion that mostly repeated reports are about the women. It is observed that all the issues of reports on human rights in the daily English newspaper “Dawn” shows that 59% reports about the sexual harassment, 30% reports about physical torture, 7% reports about gender
discrimination, 2% reports about the child labour and the remaining 2% have nothing about the human rights. If we compare all issues about human rights, we will notice it mostly reports about the sexual harassment. It is observed that the reporting criteria of news on human rights in the daily English newspaper “Dawn” shows that 66% reports are negatively reported, 21% reports are positively reporting, 10% reports are neutral and the remaining 3% have nothing about the reporting decision on human rights. If we compare all the reporting signs about human rights, it therefore means most reports are negatively reported.

7. Conclusion & Suggestions

After the content analysis the researcher has found the results that though journalists have expanded the coverage or reporting of human rights into new areas, many human rights issues are still underreported by the media. Human rights issues that are less visible are rarely reported. Human rights are still taken largely to mean civil and political rights, and importance of economic, cultural and social rights is completely ignored by the print media in their reporting of economic issues, including poverty as well as social and economic discrimination.

The print media do not explain and contextualize human rights information. Although the data on human rights violations and on human rights standards are not lacking, the impact of this reporting on the public is not as great as might be expected.

The print media miss a lot of human rights stories because they do not pay attention to the specific legal and policy implications they have. Most of the time, they do not have adequate knowledge of human rights and its relevance to the material they are reporting. These shortcomings diminish the professional quality of reporting and hamper the communication of information that is sometime essential for understanding.

The print media’s interest to cover human rights (as well as other issues) in a consistent and accurate manner is limited by the proliferation of news outlets, the concentration of news ownership. Organizations from the traditional ‘news’ and business news
sectors have combined in large multimedia groupings with organizations that specialize in entertainment. That is why majority of news organization give more importance to the entertainment and infotainment issues. In this context, most media observers, journalists and media practitioners express anxiety that quality of reporting in newspapers has been falling.

There were no special pages on human rights issues in print media. As compared to print media, electronic media treats human rights issues with relatively wider focus. Due to its distinct educated group, English newspaper has much space to report the human rights issues in their true perspective. Urdu print media nonetheless has more or less language related pressure from society, depending on the nature of the issue being reported. The researcher found that Urdu news reporting was more narrative. English newspapers’ reporters were found more specialized in human rights issues than Urdu reporters although human rights is not yet a distinct reporting area.

There is lack of investigative reporting on human rights issues in Pakistani newspapers. The human rights reporting in the English media is comparatively better where reporters/journalists are not forced to work in multiple areas and they have educated class to write for.

The Urdu newspapers rely much on sensationalism, simple narration and personal coloration. The realistic and unbiased analysis of the issues is largely missing. The journalists should have professional duty to understand what these rights are, in order to be able to describe the issue reported. Journalists should be given opportunities to become better informed about international laws of human rights. This can best be done through a range of awareness raising activities including courses on human rights.

Meetings between media professionals and human rights activists should be arranged. Special training programmes should be organized for the journalists from the media organization and NGO’s. There should be regular updating of editorial reporting, editing and handbooks to familiarize journalists with human rights
terminology and to reinforce ethical principles in reporting human rights issues. Government should commit themselves to eliminating all forms of official interference in the work of journalists and should remove all obstacles to the exercise of free media. Government should provide open access to official information and should train official spokesmen on the need to provide media with up-to-date reliable information relating to human rights obligations.

Intergovernmental organizations should develop more effective and more integrated programmes of assistance to encourage media excellence in the reporting of human rights issues. To play their parts effectively, journalists’ groups’ media and human rights organization need to better understand their different roles and responsibilities. There should be tailor-made training workshops for journalists on how to report human rights issues. Instead of focusing on providing them information and data on rights violence, the journalists should be taught tools helpful in carrying out investigation, and in reporting the cases.

Media organizations should be politically and financially unbiased in cases of human rights violation and their reporting. The government should promote and encourage the media with exclusive liberty to work, focus and criticize any government policy which is detrimental to human rights.

References


Development of Regional Planning Criteria for Health Services in the city of Riyadh


---

Shrine and Divine Essence in African Indigenous Religious Tradition, Experiences and Expressions

---

---
Abstract:
There is not an issue that is puzzling to the minds as much as the reality of the divine. The issue is both epistemological and as well ontological. Epistemological, because of an inherent push to accept or reject the reality, ontological because of the beingness, it raises the question on whether the divine is or not. This is because the divine is neither concrete nor tangible so, it is beyond normal human perception. This question does not arise when the issue of matter or materiality is being discussed. The domain where the divine is regarded to be of relevance is the domain of religion as religion is virtually empty without the divine. To concretize and locate the divine, humans from time immemorial create shrines as practical device through which the reality of the divine can be validated. History of religion and religious practice has long been associated with the reality of the divine.

Key words: African indigenous religious tradition, reality of divine. Epistemology, ontology.

1. Introduction
In African indigenous religious tradition, the spiritual and divine is as real as the material. In fact, there is an imposing and permeating presence of the divine. This is in sharp contrast with Western cosmology where reality is enshrined mainly within the domain of physicality. This explains why in Western cosmology the supernatural is relegated to the background. This is essentially true considering the Western scientific paradigms which are inherently naturalistic despite the apparent pervasive role of the supernatural even in the Western science, (Brenner 1985). The reality of the supernatural is not part of any debate, this is because the supernatural is so confronting. However, the location, activation and substantiation for optimum benefits are compelling necessities. The divine beings are both immanent and transcendental and as a result, they are approachable, they can be experienced as...
indubitable reality. In African indigenous religious tradition, gods or Orisa guide the affairs of most indigenous persons, families and communities. For this reason, from birth to death, the Orisa influence every aspect of their lives. This explains why atheism and agnosticism are inconceivable. At one point, or the other, most indigenous Africans have experienced a kind of hierophany which means divine disclosure or appearance of divinity to man. In fact this is inevitable as one moves on in the journey of life. By implication, the divine is enshrined in the spiritual domain of African cosmology. In a bid to localized or situate the divine so as to have direct access to them, the Africans naturally create shrines. Shrine therefore is the meeting place of the material human and the spiritual divine essence. The glaringly imperative questions are, when exactly does any object becomes a sacred object or when does a place become a shrine? Is it before the activation through the use of specialized ritual and behaviour? Why the differentiation between the “before activation and the after activation”? In what ways do shrines help in the location of divine essence in Nigerian indigenous religious tradition?

2. Field Works

In this paper, I drew heavily on my experience as a researcher in African indigenous religion and medicine. I also followed carefully the Okija scenario in Anambra State of Nigeria. The paper is a distillation of my observations in the practices of Babalawo (father of ancient wisdom) in Osogbo. My participation in several rituals including initiation rituals into Osun cult and divination sessions in Osun Osogbo shrine during and after the festival period enriched my data. I drew from three major sources: the Ifa corpus and the legendary of Osogbo. The Osogbo legend is the most “pounded” issue regarding the founding of Osogbo and the myth in Ifa which is of tremendous revelation though neglected and unexplored. My keen interest in Okija saga opens me up to objective understanding of shrine in Igbo land of Eastern Nigeria. Also, my close observation of the symbolic relevance of what is regarded as simple, insignificant and negligible objects and how these are activated through the use of plants, invocation and incantation and
songs, and these objects immediately become sacred, transcendental or supernatural invoking so much awe and wonder, and this, gives call for concern. I observed closely some forms of synergy of herbs with the spiritual object or symbols and the synchronisation of material objects to bring out the spiritual component to invoke awe and wonder. The process is systemic and it is an evocation and invocation of spiritual component in matter. Materiality, therefore, has no foundation in the philosophy of African indigenous religious tradition. Through the activation of material objects, they are symbolically showcasing the immanence of the divine, and as well validating the fact that the divine influences every activity.

3. Issues in Perspectives

Too many misconceptions regarding shrine in African indigenous religious tradition have thrived for so long. When the word shrine is mentioned, what immediately leap into the imagination are grisly images. What the picture foreshadows is that of a disgusting image of backwardness, totally offensive to cultured personalities. It creates fear and conjures the meaning of a place where ritual killings are done for money making, advance free fraud and all forms of evil. In such shrines, human parts such as hand, head, genitals and others are said to be found for the purpose of using it mostly for money making rituals. To the modern and elitists, Christian or Muslim minds, shrine will imply primitivism, dirtiness, idolatry and fetishism. The modern mind for example will see palm oil on the top of Esu (one of the principle divinities of the Yoruba) in Esu shrine as irritating and filthy, sees conjured spirits and forces in Sango shrine as dangerous occultism and the preservation of forest for ritual purposes and as shrine for the Orisa as wastage and primitivism. The questions that are begging for answer are what is the true meaning and concept of shrine in African indigenous religious tradition? Are shrines really meant for evil?

In Africa as shown in this study, shrines function as the spot that binds the community together, to themselves and also to the divine, it is a uniting energy. In practically all ethnic groups and
communities among indigenous people of Africa, there are shrines. Most of these shrines are created with adequate support of the traditional authority in which they exist to serve general and specific functions. Even the shrines in Okija, Anambra State, Nigeria which was painted in bad light have been known for over a hundred years to serve as some sort of traditional jurisprudence guided by taboos under the supreme authority of the Okija gods. There are many activities of Okija shrine that are positive in nature, and therefore serve the interest of the Okija community as well as a larger interest of the Ibo people. Many shrines among the Igbo, in many respects have reputation for justice in the settlement of disputes especially land and family disputes. In doing this, oaths are taken and binding in the presence of the divine. A native of Okija claims that the shrine was consistently patronized by politicians and by big business men from many part of Igbo land, when they feel cheated, they seek redress through the Okija shrines. This is because it is crucial that the divine witnesses the sessions so as to serve as agent of judgment.

The main business is oath-taking and traditional oath-taking is a common feature of resolving disputes in Africa, it could also be used in detecting criminals. (Edu, 2004). According to Oba (2008), traditional oaths play decisive roles in customary law arbitration and are recognised and accorded due respect by the courts. Among the Igbo and particularly in Okija shrines, various disagreements were settled by oath-taking at the shrine. The priests for example claim they were not doing anything illegal. Indeed, the shrines are run by legally registered cultural body thereby legitimising their activities. In effect, several eminent Igbo personalities supported them. It also helps to generate taboos that guide the moral and spiritual lives of the people. When oaths are taken and covenant made in the shrine, it is binding on all the parties concern. Okija shrines instil on Okija community and adherents of the shrine the need for trust and respect for neighbours; it also serves as agent of judgment and nemesis thereby inculcating discipline.

Many shrines especially those that are named after mountains, rivers and forests in Nigeria indigenous religious tradition are
meant for the preservation of the ecosystem. They are regarded as sacred or holy so as to avoid infiltration which can lead to desecration. In a community, there can be a taboo that prevents fishing from a particular river principally to preserve the fish in the river for collective advantage. Stan Stevens (1992; 2) notes that African indigenous religion and practices are veritable means by which the indigenous societies preserve their ecosystem and biodiversity. It has been revealed that many traditional practices do not damage the environment but enhance it.

Most of the cultures in Africa have rich folk and religious traditions on the conservation of biodiversity and sustainable use of natural resources. Studies on sacred grooves reveal that they are priceless treasure of great ecological, biological, religious and historical values. In the evolution of religions, sacred grooves, mountains, rivers and trees once played a vital role. This accounts for the reasons why the Nigerians have established several natural places and protect them from destruction from time immemorial. Access to these sites is usually restricted by taboos and management codes to particular activities. These sacred places are regarded as inviolate from ordinary use and set apart, dedicated and consecrated for religious use and observance. These areas of unblemished nature are also sanctuaries for the Orisa (Deity) in traditional concepts. Most of them left great history and mysteries behind them. The shrines provide for them a ceremonial home and the sculptures embodied their myths. Strangely, such practices are becoming extinct due to changes in religion, and in recent times, industrialization. This has resulted into desecration and desacralisation of not only the shrine but the whole of African cosmology and African collective destiny. A case in point was that of Odo shrine, an ancestral shrine of the Abor community in Ojebiogene Area development council of Enugu State, Nigeria where some Christian youths in the area destroyed Odo masquerade shrine. The reason was because it was suspected that some diabolical persons in the community use juju under the cover of the Odo shrine to harm their opponent and other innocent people. The question that borders the mind is; is it the shrine that must be destroyed? It was not the shrine got involved in diabolic
actions that are inimical to the survival of the community but the people. Much of the sacredness in nature has been rejected creating disharmony bringing about and emergence and re-emergence of new diseases in people and communities. Human history is littered with the ruins of socio-cultural matrices that rose to dominance and power, and then receded to obscurity (Field 1999).

Sacred sites also serve as ethnic identity and play a key role in the indigenous and traditional people’s culture and life styles. Among the Remo people of Ogun State Nigeria, Oro shrine, an ancestral shrine among the Yoruba of Nigeria and Benin republic was in 1999-2000 used to eliminate thieves and robbers in the land. Oro is an indispensable divinity that is used to douse tension in the land so as to bring about equilibrium especially during crisis period. For example, during any political or social instability, economic, ecological crises and even war, people take recourse in the shrine. For example during the 1993 June 12 saga, there was going to be a disintegration and everything in Nigeria was getting ruptured, there was a rant and rave of war, the Oba of Benin was reported to have led his priests to Olokun shrine where sacrifices were offered on behalf of the nation and the war was averted. It was also reported in 2005 that Ekiadolor community in Edo State recently witnessed a traditional ritual during which Oba’s representatives led traditional chiefs in placing a curse on all those who are involved in bloody cultism in Ekiadolor College of Education. The Oba of Benin Om N’Oba Erediauwa has said of recent that he is currently tackling the scourge of high crime rate in Edo State by going to the shrine of the ancestors to invoke their energy.

Before the advent of Western medicine and especially during an epidemic of small pox, Obaluaye’s shrine was the hiding place for the people of Epe in Lagos state of Nigeria. Sacrifices offered to this divinity were capable of removing the epidemic. Though shrine, can be used to serve selfish interest of priests, priestesses and adherent of the gods. For example, experience shows that fraudster do come to Osun shrine to deceive victim so as to perpetrate their evil intentions. Some can as well over mystify their shrines to extort their clients. Shrine officials can manipulate their
divinities for personal enrichment and vendetta. Nevertheless, shrines can serve as center of cohesion, symbols of unity of intention and goals. This is an off beam and in fact a deplorable use of what should serve collective advantage for egotistic and impious end. It is not the destruction of the shrine that solves the problem as this amount to desecration, but rather dealing with the individuals as the shrines are not guilty of the evil perpetrated by the shrine officials.

Shrine, which can be translated as *ojubo* or *oju ibo* (the centre or the eye of worship) in Yoruba: an indigenous language and ethnic group in the South-western Nigeria, is also a place where worship and sacrifices are offered to the divine. The revelation of the divine is a sacred revelation of spiritual beings. It showcases the inherent nature of human to participate in spiritual beingness so as to live the sacred life. According to a respondent who is also the Aseda of Osogbo, divinities are not just Orisa or divine beings, but also energies in the cosmos which must be propitiated with ritual. Shrine therefore is the place where the divine is identified and are offered necessary sacrifices. It is meant to satisfy human curiosity to see, through the domestication of spiritual realities for easy access. It is the place where an individual, family, group of people or community gather for worship and prayers.

Shrine can either be personal Ottenberg (1970), or corporate; a personal shrine is a shrine owned by individuals and these shrines can be found in personal rooms, parlor, farm or any other place where the owners may deem fit. All the divinities (Orisa) belong to individual as well as the community. For example, Sango the Yoruba divinity in charge of light and thunder, Oya in charge of thunderstorm, Ogun in charge of road construction are venerable, their shrines are found in many communities so as to serve communal advantages. They can as well be found in individual rooms, backyard, and farm or even in front of a personal or family house. Although the indigenous people in Nigeria are communalistic, there is nevertheless the individualistic dimension. As there are shrines for the collectively of the people, there are also shrines for families and individuals. In most towns and
villages there are shrines for most of the Orisa which are meant for communal or cooperate worship. None of the divinities is particularly meant to serve personal or collective advantages only.

In African indigenous religious tradition, the reality of the existence of the divinity is validated with the reality of the existence of natural phenomena. This explains why all the divinities by virtue of their extra ordinariness are invisible and so, they are represented and associated with natural objects. For example, Ogun is associated with iron, stone and other strong and hard object, while Osun is associated with spring or flowing river, brass and comb while Obatala is associated with white objects signifying purity.

4. Sacred Profane Dichotomy

In view of the imperative of the physical in the validation of spiritual realities, the sacred profane issue and the formation of shrines deserves critical analysis. The issue has always been concerned with an existence of two worlds which have nothing in common. It is about the categorization of object in place, space and time into the sacred and profane categories. The sacred implies that which is holy, separated, special and uncommon. This is what the Yoruba refer to as owo (that which deserve special honor and careful handling and as well guided by taboos). The profane category is regarded to be those things which are general, common or mundane. This is what can be referring to as sakala (that which is of no spiritual essence or special relevance and can be handled anyhow and is not guided by taboo). The assumption is that the sacred/ profane opposition is absolute, that it is systematically pervasive, and that it refers to things totally not aspectual. The general understanding of scholars such as Mircea Eliade, Tylor, Frazer et al writing on the distinction between the sacred and the profane is the basis for the phenomenology of religion. The conceptual blur becomes apparent given the problems of differentiation and categorization of phenomena into the sacred and profane domains. As Matthew Evans (2003) argues the sacred is the key concept in the sociology of religion. Despite its importance and long pedigree, the concept remains under-
conceptualized and the use of the sacred obscures meaning. Emile Durkheim in his *Elementary Forms of Religion* stressed the total otherness of the sacred and the profane and specifically denied that there is a continuum between the sacred and worldly evaluation. What this implies is that the two realms were totally different orders. This assumption within the context of Nigerian indigenous religious tradition is at best questionable. It is my thesis in this paper that in Nigerian indigenous religious traditions and the concept of the distinction between the profane and the sacred does not arise. I argue that the Nigeria universe is in the main sacred; therefore every place is a shrine and that every object has is material and spiritual reality, that there are no criteria with which the religious and nonreligious phenomena can be separated. To regard and categorize the universe into the sacred and profane is tantamount to reductionism which is alien to African cosmology. In this paper therefore, it is argued that the Nigerian universe is sacred and sacralisation is the activation of the sacredness in the universe for religious purposes. According to Evans (2003:36), we could probably blame the problem of sacred profane dichotomy on over-precision or simply on the vagaries of language. Within the context of Nigerian indigenous religious tradition, I propose in this paper that what the priests and priestesses do is just to activate the objects and that the sacredness is already imbued in every object in space before the activation through specific cultural behaviour and ritual. I mean that there is the nontangible attributes of every object or space and the activation of the nontangible attributes of objects on a landscape or space is what makes a place or an object a shrine. The activated “nontangibles” in the attributes of natural objects is what can be referred to as life, energy, power, the divine or gods as the case may be. This is what makes all shrines to serve the purpose of intermediaries; mediations and they as well provide access to the divine (Stephen, 1992:10).

Humanity exists universally in a physical medium. The physical objects which are regarded as profane are means by which one may ritually come to terms with and control the spiritual forces of nature by creating and validating the divine world within the “real” world. Opposition does not imply “absolute heterogeneity” but on
the contrary designate a particular kind of relation by virtue of which the two extremes are encompassed as a kind of totality, as the same order of facts. (Evans, 2003). Although some anthropologists have argued that the sacred/profane opposition as it derives from Durkheim is analytically unsound and overtly ethnocentric. One of the difficulties is that unlike the right/left presupposition the sacred/profane distinction is not always explicit.

At the beginning of the sacred and profane, Prof. Eliade makes the following assertion: the first possible definition of the sacred is that it is the opposite of the profane. In his description of the sacred space, he claims that it is an “irruption”. A “break” in the homogeneity of the space, a revelation of Reality. Sacred space involves the discovery of a “fixed point” a centre patterned after mythic paradigm. By contrast profane space is neutral homogenous and a “relative” even “chaotic” and non-real. It is the meaningless vastness of the temporal domain, devoid of any true order or ontological orientation, and always threatened by “non-being”. In this passage, Eliade constructs a model of the sacred/profane opposition which reflects the cosmology of many traditional societies, yet it will be mistaken to take precisely this form of presupposition as universal archetype.

5. Physical, Spiritual and the Formation of Shrine in Nigerian Indigenous Religious Tradition

Despite the apparently pervasive presence of the mysterious in all physical objects and space, the reality of the spiritual and the interconnectedness between the spiritual and physical is still a subject of debate in academic discourse. The ontological and epistemological issue regarding the debate on the reality of the spiritual does not pose any puzzle in Nigeria indigenous religious tradition. The spiritual cannot exist in vacuous of the physical. What I mean by this is, if the physical does not exist, the spiritual cannot be conceived. So in the formation of a shrine, the physical objects are coupled with music, invocation and incantation so much that the divine or spiritual assumes the physical and a shrine
is formed. By inference, it is logical that unlike Eliade’s assertion spiritual reality also belong to our world. The process and movement of the transformation of the physical “profane” to the spiritual sacred is what I call the liminal stage. The question that is compelling here is what is the status of the shrine objects before the sacralisation or before it becomes sacred. To attempt an answer to this question, it moves us into the difficult and conceptual domain. That is the problem of language as means of differentiation. It could have been for the sake of convenience of language that differences are made between the shrines’ objects and space before they are sacralised. Sacralisation, in this paper, I regard as metaphysical awakening of matter which is a process of bringing the gods into physical reality. So, reality itself is the fusion of physical and the spiritual. Wenger(1985) says: The modern physicists’ symbolic approach to the mystery of being manifest itself in their formula of the equivalence of mass and energy or the equivalence of gravitation and inertia, which are subatomic phenomenon. Whatever is physical as space and material objects in the shrine have the double attributes of being divine and physical. Though they are symbolic, they are also expressions of spiritual reality. The symbols themselves touch and exhilarate centers of life beyond the reach of vocabularies of reason and coercion.

6. Osun and Osogbo Nigeria

Osogbo, Osun Osogbo and Osun shrine are almost synonymous. According to Yoruba tradition as in Ifa Oṣẹ’ura:

*Kohunkoro Awo Ewi ọlọṣẹ Ado*

*Orun mu dede kanle Awo ode Ijesa*

*Alakan ni nbe lodo ni n te iye aakara pepepe*

*Awon ni nwon dífa fun igba Irunmole ojukotun*

*A bu fun igba Irunmole Ojukosi*

Kohunkoro the diviner of the King of Ado
Orun mu dede kanle the diviner of Ijesa town
It was crabs that were inside the river
And were mark as if they are doing divination
Performed Ifa divination for 200 divinities of Ojukotun town.
And another 200 divinities of Ojukosi town.

Life of the gods became miserable and their authority was broken down because of the neglect of Osun, but their authority was restored when Osun was admitted into their council. Thus, Osun possesses so much power and she positively influences the activities of the gods. She is therefore indispensable in the day to day activities of the divinities in heaven and on earth. Among all the divinities, Osun is the Iyalode representing the potent but hidden power of womanhood in the control of the Yoruba universe.

The holy odu Ogunda ‘se establishes this:

* Kube kube oke Ijero
* Ajalu winwin
* Eni a gbola fun lola nye
* A dia fun Osun seegesi oniko olorun.

* Kube kube oke Ijero
* Ajalu winwin
Whoever is given honor deserves it
Performed Ifa divination for Osun seegesi

Who has entourage from heaven?

According to this odu, in Osun dwells the energy of femininity, beauty and fecundity. She is symbolized in *Omi*; water which is life (the water of life), Ota Osun, (small and strong stone from
Osun river), Ide; (brass), Edan, symbol of authority in Yoruba theocratic system. She does not go out alone; she goes with Iko (entourage) which signifies her kingly position. Hence for everywhere she goes, she goes with Edan; her symbol of authority. Edan can be regarded as maze; it is the symbol of sovereignty of a king. This explains why for every Osun festival, there is always Edan which serves as insight to the authority of Osun in Osogbo land. The King of the city Ataoja as in all Yoruba community of South Western Nigeria is the Alase ekeji Orisa which means representative of the gods, or one whose authority is derived from the gods. The testimony of the Iya Osun lends credence to this; she claims that the supreme ruler in Osogbo is Osun why the Ataoja is the Deputy. The Ataoja derives his authority from Osun. By implication the gods are the rulers of the people while the kings are representatives of the gods. This Olupona (2001) captures succinctly in his assertion that the sacred kingship in Osogbo derives its source from Orisa Osun as exemplified in the Osun festival drummers’ rhythm that Osun is the king and the eldest.

According to the Odu Ogbe Alara, it was Osun who rescued the people of Osogbo when their lives became miserable. In the dangerous times of tribal wars, Osogbo gave a home to refugees from every direction. When the Fulani war was coming from Ilorin, it is believed that it was Osun who stopped the war from entering Osogbo. This is the basis for which the people of Osogbo handed over their lives to Osun as a precondition for them to enjoy the privilege of her blessing, protection and peace. This is how the annual Osun festival was instituted. It is impossible to conceive of a year when the Osun festival will not be celebrated in Osogbo. Respondents reinforced this position by claiming that it was Osun who helped Osogbo to become the capital of Osun State. The development that Osogbo is experiencing today has been attributed to the benevolence of Osun.

_Panduku oju ina_

_A benu gbooro_

_Lo difa fun Osun_
Development of Regional Planning Criteria for Health Services in the city of Riyadh

Ti n lo re e tun Ilu Osogbo se
Ni’jo ti ilu Osogbo fo bi igba
To ya peere bi aso

Panduku oju ina
A benu gbooro
Performed Ifa divination for Osun
When she was going to reform Osogbo town
When Osogbo broke like calabash
When it torn like cloth

This can be adduced as the reason why it is not surprising to find a close connection between Osun shrine and the rulership of the people of Osogbo. The Aworo Osun asseverated that shrine is itself a palace and in fact, the first palace. The isolation of secular activities from religious ones makes little or no sense in a place where spirits’ shrines are central to most activities of community life and the issues of secular; secularity and secularization are inconceivable and therefore are aberrations.

It was observed that Osun shrine is the traditional religious and political centre as well as the cathedral of traditional religion in Osogbo, the capital of Osun State, South western Nigeria. It is a well structured, clearly delimited space regarded as the concentration of the reality of Osun and other divinities. Through the shrine is in Osogbo land, the people do not claim that it is their personal property. Devotees of all categories of life, states and nationalities come to Osun Osogbo shrine for religious pilgrimage and for meditation. It also serves as a sight for private as well as public rituals. The area where the shrine is located houses many of the Yoruba Orisa such as Ogun, Egbe, Sango, Obaluaye, Iya moopo and many others. Osun shrine, therefore, embodies many of the Orisa. The Osun’s shrine is located in Osogbo and as one of the
most important pilgrimage centers of all. Osun devotees and adherent of traditional religion, the Osun river flows round many parts of the world in her own way. The Osun water flows from Igede Ekiti to Ijesa land and to Osogbo and many other parts of Yoruba land to the Caribbean, Latin America and North America. Thus Osun shrine is of such profound influence so much so that our experience can be representative of Nigerian indigenous religious traditions. The question that is imperative in the sacred profane dichotomies is, was Osun sacred or did the river, groove and the surroundings posses the sacred and spiritual qualities only after the experience of Laro and Timoyin, the first progenitors of Osogbo land?

To clarify this pertinent question and issue, it is important for us to state the antecedent of the shrine. It was the shortage of water at Ipole, few kilometers from Osogbo that led Laoroye, Timoyin and their hunting cohort that led them to the holy land. When they got to the holy land, they saw the need to settle there a while as they needed to settle where there would be enough water. They did not recognise the sacredness of the spot and as a result, they started to do any how. They fell a huge tree and the noise was so disturbing and the ghosts in the forest were displeased and they started to complain bitterly thus; Osọ igbo n binu o, gbogbo ikoko aro o mi le ti fo tan (the forces or wizards in the forest are angry, you have broken all my pots for indigo dyeing). The oso, forces or ghost were already in the forest before Laro and Timehin got there. By implication, there was already sacredness in the forest as the place was already a place of awe and wonder before their infiltration. All venerable mountains, rivers, forests, stone, trees and other shrines in Nigeria were already shrines before humans encounter them. Religion is only a response of humans to the wonders of creation.

From the above argument, in African indigenous religious tradition, the divine is in everything and everywhere is sacred, it depends on the experience of the community or the individual. What makes a shrine is what can be called the other dimension of an object or space, the symbolic relevance of an object or space,
the nature and the systematization in the use, these are vivid evidences that every object and space is sacred and the combination of the objects in a space or landscape makes a shrine. Take for example, broom:

Symbolic relevance: for sweeping which results to cleanliness, it is also a symbol of unity.

Nature: broom is strings of palm fronts (mariwo) tied together for sweeping. This is what makes it osusu that is, that which is tied together.

The systematization: the method of sweeping for broom to be functional

The other dimension: this is what it cannot be used for. For example, owo ni ti’gi owo omode ki i fi igi owo o dana, agbalagba ki i fi igi owo o dana. (To broom belongs sacredness, a child cannot use broom as firewood, an elderly person cannot use broom as firewood).

Everything in nature and space from cloth which symbolizes support and in fact the symbol of true humanness (eniyan laso o mì) humans are my cloth. From pounded yam to land, farm, trees, the sky, mountains and rocks to land ile ogere a foko yerì (land ogere which uses hoes to decorate its head) are themselves objects used for a shrine, junctions, entrances and others are shrines and objects of shrine in their own right since they all have the “otherness”. Broom is one of the important paraphernalia in Obaluaye’s shrine; this is because Obaluaye which western scholarship refers to as god of small pox is god of cleanness. The fact that pounded yam is the king of all foods and that it is white in color makes it a true symbol of Obatala. This is because Obatala is regarded as the supreme Orisa and the true symbol of all purity. According to Wenger (1985), “white is the sacred sum of all colors in light”.

The unusual noise of owl, mouse, cat and barking of dog strikes the African persons as divine directive or divine information. For example, among the Yoruba, if dog cries especially at night, it is sounding the warning of impending death. If somebody is sick and
a cat is carried so close to him/her, and the cat does not run away, the cat is giving message that the person will soon be well and he will not die as a result of the sickness. If the cat should run away, it means the person will die. Lightening, storm and wind, when river overflow its bound, if a big tree suddenly fell or dried up and when an illness cannot be diagnose, all give impression of the reality of the spiritual within the physical and the reality is one and the other. This is what Henry Sawyer (1968: 150) refers to as “presence of presences within Nature”. Similarly trees which are unusually big and difficult to cut and rocks of peculiar shapes and sizes, high mountain yam and other farm produce in African indigenous religious traditions are vivid evidences of the presences of the spiritual and the physical which make the reality. The sacred Seideltz et al (2002:44) quoting Larson, Sawyer, and McCollough (1998:30) in his attempt to define the sacred claims that it is a socially influenced perception of either some divine being or some sense of the ultimate reality of truth. This is what James (1982) calls “religious experience”. Thus shrine is a landscape which embodies the reality of the supernatural because of the inherent spiritual reality in the physical reality. This is what Suzanne Wenger (1983) refers to as “metaphysical awakening of matter”. This goes a long way to evidence the fact that shrine evidences the fusion of the natural and the supernatural. Shrine, therefore is a place where objects in nature or in space are combined in a systemic manner, to express the reality of the divine in nature, accord the divine their deserved veneration and seek the faces of the divine for guidance and control. This reinforces more vigorously the fact that the reality of the physical is the reality of the spiritual and that they interact. It can also be deduced here that the active forces in everything in nature and in space are within, and these active forces are the divine, spirits or gods. There is the transcendental dimension of all earthly being and matter. There is also the transformation of physical to spiritual and the spiritual to physical, this is continuity and eternity in Nigerian indigenous religious tradition.

It is therefore, acceptable to say that everywhere is a shrine within the context of Nigerian indigenous religious tradition. Given the
name oju-ibo, it implies that everything in land and space are venerable. Since people will not worship everything at the same time, some things in nature which are representational of other things not combined are combined in a systematic manner. A centre is landscaped in a community, a place is earmarked in a room, parlor or compound where the people offer sacrifice, venerate the divine and seek its face for favor. It was observed during the course of my investigation that one of the factors responsible for this is the inherent eagerness humans to identify with the divine through the stimulation of human spiritual components.

From the indigenous religious paradigms, at every junction and entrance of a town, there supposed to be a shrine for Esu and Obaluaye as they help to ward off evil including war and diseases. At the entrance, outskirt and four corners of most cities, villages and community centre of a compound, and in fact, houses rooms and parlor in Nigeria, especially the Yoruba of South western Nigeria, there are always shrines. According to a respondent in Osogbo, it implies that every object in space is sacred and every place is a shrine.

Aside from the fact that Osun water flows round Osogbo, there is the Idi Baba, Obaluaye shrine at the entrance of Osogbo from Ibokun. The Ogun shrine is right in the centre of the town at Oja Oba. A little down is the Osun shrine and grove. In these shrines, especially Osun shrine, all that is in the place and space from animals to trees and other things in the grove are sacred, guided by taboos as well as official restrictions. Even the monkeys and other animals, trees, river, stone, sculptures and everything in the Osun shrine are to a long extent sacred and therefore worthy of veneration. This explains why the collective name gods, Orisa or that which inhabit African universe is Irunmole which n Yoruba language means irun-imole that is the innumerable beings that inhabit the universe. This explains why it is not possible to conceive of any place or object in African indigenous religious tradition as profane or mundane.
References


Politics and Novel: An Eclectic Reading of Maniza Naqvi’s Novels

Mohammad Ayub Jajja*

Abstract: In countries like Pakistan, due to a number of reasons, people take keen interest in politics. This finds reflection in literature. The present study examined the portrayal of the Pakistani politics, especially, the imposition of different martial laws with their disastrous consequences

*Assistant Professor, Department of English, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Pakistan
E-mail: drjajja@yahoo.com
for the country, its people and culture by Maniza Naqvi in her novels. The novels included in the study were Mass Transit, Stay with Me and On Air. The research methodology was based upon the analysis of the texts of the novels in the light of a combination of critical approaches like New Criticism, Marxism and Postcolonial theory. The study proved its major proposition that politics is responded to by writers, for the pivotal and central role it plays in the lives of the people. The study also found that novels of Naqvi are comparable to Postcolonial novels from other cultures and countries, in their response to politics. The study found that Naqvi takes a pro-people approach while portraying the Pakistani politics.

Key words: Literature, Novel, Portrayal of the Pakistani politics, New Criticism, Marxism and Postcolonial theory.

1. Introduction

Portrayal of politics in the novel has been examined by many critics in different contexts. Irving Howe has dealt with the handling of politics by nineteenth and twentieth century European and American novelists, in Politics and Novel. Howe shows that novelists like Stendhal, Dostoevsky, Joseph Conrad, Henry Adam, and Henry James have responded to political ideas and events in their novels due to the important role politics plays in the lives of the people.

The Anglo-Indian novel absorbed and portrayed politics during the early part of the twentieth century, because the Indian politics affected the British and their empire in the real sense of the word, though the Anglo-Indian novel mirrored the political reality from the perspective of the colonizers. Bhopal Singh has taken account of the portrayal of Indian politics by Anglo-Indian novel in the beginning of the twentieth century, in A Survey of Anglo-Indian Novel.

Crane (1992) has also dealt with the portrayal of politics by Anglo-Indian and Indian novelists. These include John Maters (Night Runners of Bengal) and M.M.Kay (Shadow of the Moon), The Siege of Krishnapur by Farrell, Paul Scott (Raj
Quartet), R.K. Nayran (Waiting for the Mahatma) and Raja Rao (Kanthapura). Richard Cronin in Imagining India has done the same.

A Bangla Deshi scholar, Niaz Zaman has also taken account of the portrayal of Partition of India in 1947 and the accompanied politics, by Indian and Pakistani novelists, in her book, A Divided Legacy. Some of the novelists discussed are Khuswant Singh (Train to Pakistan), Mumtaz Shah Nawaz and Mehr Nigar Masroor (Shadows of Time)

In addition to Naqvi Pakistani writers like Sidhwa and Mohsin Hamid also believe in the centrality of politics to the lives of the people and its ultimate portrayal in literature. Sidhwa in An American Brat contends that, “in Pakistan, politics, with its special brew of Martial Law and religion, influenced every aspect of day to day living” (11). She further adds:

In Pakistan, politics concerned everyone --- from the street sweeper to the business tycoon --- because it personally affected everyone, particularly women, determining how they should dress, whether they could play hockey in school or not, how they should conduct themselves even within the four walls of their homes.(171)

Hamid believes personal and political to be like inhaling and exhaling, the two sides of the same reality (Hamesh Hamilton).

Emma Duncan in Breaking the Curfew expresses similar views and says, “Change and uncertainty keep people riveted to their politics” (199). She further adds about Pakistan and its people:

More than anywhere I have been--- Much more than India---its people worry about the state of their country. They wonder what went wrong; they fear for the future. They condemn it; they pray for it. They are involved in the nation’s public life as passionately as in their small private dilemmas... A chatty
Interestingly Rehman (1991) comes up with something different. He contends that except for a few Indian works, like, Raja Rao’s Kanthapura (1938) Narayan’s Waiting for the Mahatma (1955) and Khushwant Singh’s Train to Pakistan (1956), the Indian literature in English has hardly responded to Indian political events (224). He further adds that Pakistani literature in English has not dealt with major political events like the philosophy of Partition, imposition of various martial laws, the 1971 war, and the execution of an ex-prime minister of Pakistan (225-27).

Rehman further adds that in Pakistani literature in English has even less response to history than that of Indian literature. (224). Rehman acknowledges a limited reference to the political events surrounding Partition, by some Pakistani writers, but he adds, “However, the point I want to make is that there is little response to political events and that is different from African and West Indian literatures” (224).

Rehman contends that Pakistani writers failed to respond to the imposition of martial law by General Zia-ul-Haq:

The martial law of General Zia-ul-Haq was resented by liberal and leftist intellectuals in Pakistan. However, the resentment was expressed in occasional poems in English and in short stories of symbolic kind. There was no major response to this great event by Pakistani writers in English literature. Even the hanging of Bhutto, the ex-prime minister of the country, did not produce any response in English literature. (227).

Rehman concludes his book with a statement that Pakistani fiction in English is not political sophisticated or even realistic. This is a serious misunderstanding on the part of Rehman about Pakistani Literature/novel in English. This needs to be addressed to and replaced with a correct analysis and interpretation of Pakistani novel in English. This
indicates the justification and potential of the present study. The proposition of the present study is that in countries like Pakistan, people take politics very seriously, and it is portrayed by the novelists. The present study intends to investigate the portrayal of politics by Maniza Naqvi in her three novels i.e. Mass Transit, Stay with Me and On Air. The proposition of the study is that Naqvi has responded to Pakistani politics for the central role politics plays in the lives of the people. The research methodology for the study is the analysis of the texts of the novel in the light of an eclectic critical approach, consisting of New Criticism, Marxism and Postcolonial theory, especially New Criticism with its emphasis upon the text as presented by Lois Tyson (Critical Theory Today, 136)

2. Discussion and Analysis

Maniza Naqvi, a Pakistani English language novelist, believes events like the Partition, the two wars with India, the Afghan war, martial laws especially that of General Zia, the execution of an elected prime minister, have left an indelible impact upon people and the country. These political developments have affected the people; therefore, Pakistani writers cannot stay uninvolved with politics (The News, August 29, 2004). Naqvi in her novels, Mass Transit, Stay with Me and On Air has incorporated the different aspects of the Pakistani politics, especially the consequences of martial laws upon Pakistani society.

Maniza begins her novel Mass Transit with a reference to the hypocrisy of Zia regime when discriminatory laws were passed to victimize the poor and the women. They were punished in name of religion under the Hudood Ordinances, while the ruling class enjoyed chivas regal served by white-
gloved waiters. The government of General Zia and the feudal ruling class are condemned by Naqvi, for unleashing the reign of terror and torture against the activists of political parties opposing the Zia regime and for introducing the Hudood Ordinances. She asks, “Isn’t that illegal? Against the law, their laws, against our law in this land of so many laws, this land of so many courts, so many judges, so many ministers” (ix). Naqvi portrays the nexus between the superior judiciary and the dictators and voices her strong disapproval of some members of the top judiciary who always defended the abrogation of the constitution by martial law authorities and provided it invariably with a safe passage (x).

Naqvi, like what Sidhwa does in *An American Brat*, shows that women, especially belonging to lower classes were the worst victims of Hudood Ordinances promulgated by General Zia, which prescribed the punishment of stoning to death for adultery. Naqvi raises the question of the definition of adultery (zina). “Adultery, lets stone a woman to death for zina (adultery) what the hell is zina? Who are the prostitutes in this country? Who go to the highest bidders? Who compromise principles, isn’t that zina” (x). In *Mass Transit* Naqvi gives expression to her anger against the ruling class for showing scant regard for the laws they themselves have passed and for their hypocrisy and selfishness. Naqvi condemns them for their willingness to sell their conscience, convictions, and loyalties to the highest bidders. She uses very strong language for the rulers. She cannot forget the help extended by the feudal ruling class to the dictators to pass anti-women laws in Pakistan (ix). Rushdie an Indian writer has also responded to Pakistani politics, especially the Zia era, in his novel *Shame* and has mirrored the repressive measures undertaken by Zia regime (248-49).

In *Mass Transit*, Naqvi is extremely disappointed that even after decades of getting independence from colonizers; the real independence still eluded Pakistan and its people. She is dismayed that the country was often in the grip of dictators.
The real participation of the people in the decision making process was denied. Naqvi shows that out of forty years of independence, Pakistan has groaned for twenty-four years under martial law in the name of control and discipline. She holds frequent martial laws responsible for drugs, gun running, violence and riots in the streets, bomb explosions, curfews and the civil war in former East Pakistan. Naqvi shows that martial laws result in the denial of the rights of people (12). These are all very serious issues. These affect people, their country, and culture. She shows that the banishment of political parties and political process had divided the country into smaller ethnic and regional groups fighting and killing each other. Naqvi reflects the direct impact of martial laws and its policies upon the people and therefore her portrayal of politics in her novels. She shows that the first Afghan war affected the Pakistani society politically and economically. This converted the country into war zones. Naqvi shows that the wrong policies of the dictators divided the country into two broader classes, the rulers and the ruled:

Forty-one years of independence and forty-one years of steadily increasing lies, deceptions, and outright, outrageous contempt for the ideals which we thought we had founded this country on...Kalashnikovs in the streets, and curfews. (10)

Naqvi in Mass Transit portrays the typical excuse of the dictators and their allies to intervene in civilian matters. Doud is one such man. He holds the politicians responsible for mucking the things up. Doud blames the politicians for inviting the army to intervene due to the mess they make of everything. Doud further blames the politicians for chaos, corruption, nepotism, and discord. Doud believes the civilians jeopardize the very security and the unity of the country. He comes up with a fine solution to end the street violence in Karachi or for that matter in Pakistan, by favouring more stringent measures on the part of martial law authorities. Doud says:
This blessed mother land, sir, has always been under threat from outside forces, with their devious ways, like invisible hands, that keep creating mischief amongst us. We must be warned of their presence amongst us, and be vigilant of them. The nation is too young to take care of itself. It needs to be defended by strong control and discipline. (12)

His arguments are not different from those of the nineteenth century British imperialists and mirrored by Anglo-Indian novelists and discussed by Bhopal Singh Through the technique of multiple narratives, Naqvi facilitates the reader to arrive at the truth. Naqvi blames the martial law regimes for subjecting the students, doctors, poets to persecution and torture in the name of security, unity and integrity of the country (18). Since politics affects people in a real and substantial way, this is why, Naqvi maintains, people discuss politics instead of discussing art, drama and dance (57).

Naqvi is of the opinion that interest in art and literature becomes difficult while living in the shadows of death, destruction and strife (59). Naqvi is strongly critical of the dictatorships because she associates the tyranny with violation of human rights, murders and repression. Naqvi shows how Humayun, a student activist, was murdered by state agencies during an earlier martial law for protesting against the imposition of martial law (62). Naqvi blames Zia for exploiting religion for his political objectives (70). She shows that Zia’s brand of Shariat promoted narrow-mindedness and repression especially against women (171).

Naqvi in Mass Transit seems to show signs of hope and optimism at the emergence and rise of new leadership in Pakistan. She probably had MQM and Benazir in her mind, while she talks about the new political leadership in Pakistan. She uses the city of Karachi as a microcosm, representing the whole of Pakistan. She expects the new political leadership of Pakistan to address the genuine grievances of the people and to work for their resolution. She ascribes the rise of the new political leadership in Pakistan to the decades of
deprivation, neglect and resource strangulation by the alliance of feudal rulers and establishment (149-50). In *Mass Transit*, she mentions only Benazir by name. She seems to pin her hopes and faith in Benazir. Naqvi shows a group of women sitting cross-legged in a semi circle, breast-feeding their children, while listening to Benazir at a public rally (135). The scene has its symbolic importance. For her, Benazir is a symbol of peace and security, and future of Pakistan. The children are shown comfortable in the laps of their mothers, while the mothers are listening to the speech of Benazir. Naqvi suggests the chadder-clad figure of Benazir is reflective of her regard and commitment to the cultural and social values of Pakistani society. Unfortunately, Benazir became victim of terrorism and died in December, 2007.

The new political leadership of Pakistan is praised in the beginning by Naqvi for their resolve to change the old order, consisting of the establishment and the corrupt feudal ruling class who squandered national resources for their own personal aggrandizement (149). She shows the excitement of the people, at the prospects of change and makes Safina say:

A new order was dawning; they were its inheritors, this young and vibrant band of leaders who would remain committed to them and the city. She looked around at the jubilant people, young and old alike, whose faces showed clearly how deeply they believed in the sincerity of this message. (150)

However, towards the end of the novel Naqvi is overtaken by disappointment even with the young political leadership of Pakistan. She is critical of some cadres of the new political leadership of Pakistan. Naqvi feels that such undemocratic practices on the part of some elements may transform the new political leadership into a tyranny, thus, extinguishing all the “diyas” (lamps) of hope and shattering the beautiful dreams about future. Naqvi is also critical of the new representatives of Pakistan, for siding with the forces of status-quo. Therefore, through Safina in *Mass Transit* Naqvi expresses her sense of disillusionment with new leadership. Safina is
dismayed and disappointed that actually nothing of substance is going to change. It is only a change of guards:

Everything was exactly the same, religion being used for politics, funds being used for power, and the people being used for fodder. Everything was exactly the same, only this time even her dreams had been used and squandered and hope had left forever and circles after circle of barricades seemed to engulf her. (181)

The cause of Naqvi’s grief and sorrow is that she observes that all those who were pointed out as feudal lords and religious exploiters are again seen sitting next to those who have won the country’s heart and confidence (181). Naqvi is quite unhappy at this and she is quite discouraged and disappointed (182). Naqvi is grieved that the young representatives of Pakistan have succumbed to forces of status-quo and they have found themselves making alliances with obscurantist groups and the exploiters of the people. Basit Haqqani in Papio also focuses upon the alliance between feudal and the dictators for the objectives (278,299). The discussion shows that Naqvi has responded to the Pakistani politics due to the impact it has on the lives of the people as she makes clear in her interview (News, August 29, 2004). While responding to Pakistani politics, she takes pro-people and liberal stance. She condemns the martial law regimes for the repression and the violation of the rights of the people.

Stay With Me, by Naqvi, is the most hard-hitting novel against the repressive regimes in Pakistan. In this novel she deals with the repression and persecution exercised by the dictatorships in Pakistan with disastrous fall out for the country and the people. Naqvi expresses her sense of outrage and protest at the violation of the rights of people by the martial law regimes. She mirrors the preferences of the martial law regimes for torture and violence to achieve their objectives. Naqvi, in Stay With Me raises her strong voice against the brutality and violence perpetrated by the dictators.
Naqvi produces the standard speech delivered by every dictator at the time of the takeover, with usual rhetoric:

At the stroke of dawn, one week ago, Destiny beckoned, the blessed homeland called its patriotic sons, to once again serve its need. At that hour, I had reported to you that the homeland was safe, and I made a promise to you, my dear countrymen fathers, mothers, sisters, brothers, my children. I had promised you that we would always remain loyal servants and that we would safeguard this sacred soil to the last breath. (76)

Naqvi mirrors the dictators’ condemnation of the politicians for being irresponsible, and arrogant. The dictators blame the civil governments for bringing the country to the brink of economic and social collapse. Naqvi is disappointed that the dictators label the civil political set up as the cancer for the nation and the country, to be removed, by the “saviors of the people” (76). Naqvi in Stay With Me refers to the rhetoric and pet words of the martial law authorities, like the hour of crisis, history in the making, service and duty to the nation, integrity, honesty, transparency and finally accountability of the politicians to mislead and deceive the people (53). She realistically portrays the attempts of the martial law authorities to present to the world a civilian façade to hide behind. She exposes the nature of the claims made by the dictatorial regimes for the restoration of order, decency, the constitution and democracy. Naqvi points out that even the elections are promised to hoodwink the public opinion and deceive the international community. Actually, they pick up a pliant figure with an acceptable face:

In the mean time, we have searched the world, to find a patriot to head the country’s interim government. Cast, creed, gender and ethnicity are not our concern. We are proud to tell you that we have convinced a decent, honest, intellectual human being with a vision, to lead you, someone that all of you admire and can be proud of to take up the position. (77)
Like a liberal and progressive writer, Naqvi is sceptical of the promises of the restoration of democracy by the dictators. She rejects the claims of the dictatorial regimes to wipe out corruption. Naqvi in *Stay with Me* shows that the martial law authorities do not want to transfer the power to the civilians (36). She reflects the helplessness of the civilian prime minister who is not allowed to deviate from the set policies of the martial law authorities. The civil prime minister cannot question, for example, the defense policy or budget. If he asks such questions, he risks being labelled as a security risk or even a traitor (38). The civilian figure head is meant to function as a show piece for the outer world (39). In *Stay With Me*, Naqvi also focuses upon the attempts of the dictators to bring the judiciary under its influence and control. The dictators never allow the superior judiciary to function independently. “The supreme court and other courts will continue to function as long as they don’t contradict us” (91). Naturally this approach affects the country and the people who are denied justice under dictatorships. Naqvi shows that any attempts on the part of the civilian partners to differ are crushed severely. The dictators never allow the undoing of the amendments in the constitution which may reduce the role and the power of the dictator (93). She shows the true nature of things in *Stay With Me*:

You cannot change what we have worked so hard to establish. If you ask why, you are a traitor. You are a traitor if you question it. You cannot question it. You cannot change it. If you try, we will wipe you out. But first we will establish you as a criminal. Everything you will accuse us of, we will accuse you of, and hang you with it. (96)

Naqvi makes it very clear that the civilian façade is not a power sharing. It is a cover up, to deceive the world community. She suggests that under dictators even the parliament is not more than a rubber stamp, because it is the privilege of the dictator to abrogate the constitution and not that of the parliament to change it (127). Naqvi shows that
the dictators in Pakistan have absolute power and control over the state machinery, therefore resistance on the part of the civilians can be crushed through repression and cruelty (28).

The real nature of the apparent peace and quiet under martial law is exposed by Naqvi. She shows that it is achieved through draconian measures like torture, imprisonments, even killings, thereby transmitting fear among the general public. Naqvi shows that under martial law regimes everybody is frightened. In this atmosphere of insecurity and fear for one’s own life and that of one’s children, the protests by the people are out of question (52). Naqvi in Stay With Me shows that the civil-military coalition is artificial, unnatural and therefore incompatible. Even the most pliant and handpicked civilian politicians’ fall from grace. She suggests that the Pakistanis are familiar with this model. Naqvi chooses not to name either the dictator or civilian figurehead in the novel. She adds that after his/her fall from grace; ex-prime minister is arrested, tortured and tried. This is a familiar story for Pakistanis. According to Naqvi, the onetime claps of applause turn into slaps on face (45). The ex-prime minister is accused of treason and of instigating rebellion. Instead of the prime minister’s house he is taken around at places like, Attock Fort, Lahore Fort, Rawal Pindi Jail, Kot Lakpat, all notorious places for torture and brutality (64). Naqvi suggests that the world of a dictator is characterized by raw absolute power. The fallen politicians are accused of being the agent of the enemy, looking outside the country for support. They are accused of instigating protests, boycotts and sanctions (152). Naqvi praises the civil society for protesting against the martial law regimes in spite of the cruelty, the torture and repression of the dictators. She records that people call the dictators as thieves, usurpers, murderers, trespassers, rapists (139-40). The discussion shows the relevance of politics to the people and its reflection in the writings of Naqvi.

The martial law regimes are condemned by Naqvi for being extremely intolerant of the difference and dissention.
Therefore, children of the nation, Aman and Iman, metaphors for peace and integrity cannot survive in this brutal atmosphere. While the dictators desperately seek to justify themselves and their actions with familiar catch phrases: patriotism, homeland, stability even freedom. In *Stay With Me*, Naqvi portrays her views against dictatorial regimes for their use of violence and torture against the general public to perpetuate their rule. She proves her credentials as a liberal, progressive and pro-people writer (159). Javid Amir in *Modern Soap* has also exposed the nature of the dictatorships, and the repression and cruelty experienced by the people under them.

Naqvi in her novel, *On Air*, presents the reasons for the keen interest people in Pakistan take in politics. She suggests that politics is the most important thing in the lives of the people in Pakistan (45). She begins *On Air*, with an indirect reference to the arrests and killings and massacres which take place in the country during a martial law regime, describing it only as the “sensitive stuff” (5). In *On Air*, Naqvi also associates the dictatorships with repression, and the denial of the freedom of speech and action, which in her opinion is like killing a human being, which reflects her liberal and democratic views (12). Naqvi shows that the dictators are like colonizers and they distort the psyche of the nation in addition to the killings and the crackdowns under taken by them. She expresses her point of view on the nature of dictatorships:

When a people are suddenly taken over, their rules and traditions over turned by invading conquerors, when they are made to do things they never wanted to do, when they can no longer exercise their will and are made to do things against their will, when their will is broken, when their heroes are humiliated and when their mythologies are desecrated and ridiculed, when all this happens, do they become ashamed individuals? Do they become ashamed societies, say like, a
person who as a child had been abused, molested and beaten, abandoned or humiliated? (88).

The time tested excuse of the dictators for toppling the civilian governments in Pakistan is depicted by Naqvi in *On Air*. The dictators sight the infighting in the ruling party, the allegations of corruption and the inability of the government to resolve the financial crisis in the country (101). Naqvi reflects those dictators and their cronies from amongst the bureaucracy and feudal lords; themselves do the same on a larger scale and buy expensive properties around the world. These cronies of the dictators and the beneficiaries of their regimes appear in the talk shows and defend the dictators and claim that only they can save Pakistan and the entire world from a terrible scourge like fundamentalism that would have taken civilization into the Dark Age (106).

The West is blamed by Naqvi in *On Air*, for its double standards. She shows that whenever it suits the interests of the West; they support and defend dictators in Pakistan. The West ignores all the repression, cruelty, killings and massacres, unleashed by the dictators on the people. She shows that dictators in Pakistan kill innocent people, who oppose their regimes in the name of eradicating fundamentalism (108). She warns the world community that those who perished during the dictatorships are not necessarily the terrorists. They might be the ones who struggled for equality, justice and the eradication of poverty. She further shows that the fundamentalism is the extension of the first Afghan war, when another dictator opened and organized training camps, with the help of the West, to recruit freedom fighters for the first Afghan war. She reflects the fall out of the first Afghan war for Pakistan and its people:

So you had the Mujahideen to begin with and later on the Taliban. The flush of funds raised the level of corruption in the country, and finally we see the effect of all of this on Karachi and on the rest of the country, the Western flanks now borderless with Afghanistan, the entire country flushed
Development of Regional Planning Criteria for Health Services in the city of Riyadh

with refugees, drugs, guns and overnight millionaires who are smugglers and warlords. (44)

The dictators in Pakistan, Naqvi shows, use the campaigns to eradicate fundamentalism to perpetuate their own rule:

I will drag Pakistan kicking and screaming into the twenty first century. I will turn it into a model of success and dynamism. There is no place for fundamentalism in this country. Wherever I find it, I will uproot it and eradicate it. (111)

She fears a new wave of repression in the name of war against fundamentalism. Naqvi in her novels incorporates the repression and the violation of human rights under martial law regimes because this affects the people in a real and substantial way.

3. Conclusion

The study has proved its major proposition that politics is responded to by writers in countries like Pakistan, where institutions are not fully developed, people take keen interest in politics because it affects their day to day lives in a massive way. The study has shown that Naqvi in her novels has portrayed different aspects of Pakistani politics, especially, the imposition of different martial laws. She has portrayed the repression and cruelty perpetrated by the dictators and the resistance put up by people. She is also critical of the West for supporting the dictators. The study has shown that politics in countries like Pakistan affects people in a substantial way and is responded to by writers like Naqvi. It has further shown that Naqvi has a liberal, progressive, pro-people approach while dealing with the politics of Pakistan in her novels. Naqvi does not support the martial law regimes. In her novels she has projected the democratic values, basic human rights, sanctity of constitution and respect for justice and fair play.

The study has further shown that Naqvi like a postcolonial writer has privileged Pakistan, its people, their problems,
their fears and aspirations in her works. The study has confirmed Naqvi’s status as a postcolonial writer. The study has also challenged the contention of Dr. Tariq Rehman that Pakistani novel is neither politically sophisticated nor it has responded to politics. This has shown that Pakistani writers like Naqvi have responded to Pakistani politics in a massive way, because it matters to the people.

References


Abdul Wajid Khan*
Arshad Ali**

Abstract: This study examines the portrayal of women in Pakistani feature films (Urdu and Punjabi, 1988-1999). It is a critical evaluation of forty eight films. It explores the characters of women portrayed in Urdu and Punjabi films of Pakistan. The technique of Content Analysis has been used for the study. The results show that portrayal of women in Urdu and Punjabi films is not reflective of true Pakistani women rather this portrayal presents negative image of Pakistani women in the viewers’ mind. These movies do not address the women issues nor do they present solution to these problems faced by Pakistani women. So far as the second hypothesis is concerned, findings show that the portrayal of women in Urdu and Punjabi films are not free from male prejudices and these films do not portray the true social and political role performed by actual Pakistani

* Assistant Prof. Dept. of Media Studies, The Islamia University Bahawalpur
Email: wajidkhan88@hotmail.com

** Lecturer Lahore Garrison University Lahore, Email: arshad.ali@expressnews.tv
women. The critical analysis shows that portrayal of women in Urdu and Punjabi films is based on the assumptions that male are more dominant, authoritative, powerful, good-natured and more intelligent as compared to women who are naïve, coward, weak, lusty and prostitute. This stereotyping with women has been shown in these movies on every level. 

**Key words:** Urdu & Punjabi films, Portrayal of Women issues

1. **Introduction**

Cinema is an extraordinary entertainment medium and a superb story-telling machine. It is a powerful, stable and a perfect system of visual communication. It is a word-image combination which imparts presence and immediacy to the world. It promotes either reality truthfulness or unreality and total falsehood. Elsaesser and Buckland rightly say “The combination of image, movement and sound is obviously something quite mysterious in its effect on human beings, almost magical…” (2002:01). Film is the most popular medium of entertainment. The films play a vital role in the construction of an organized society. This role becomes more important in a society having low literacy rate. Thus the film in Pakistan has become a popular and powerful medium of entertainment. Almost 20 films are produced annually in Pakistan. Most of the producers are of the opinion that this is a simple and low-cost medium that provides entertainment to the people who want to escape from their day to day worries. Therefore films are not taken as a creative source of critical thoughts rather it is taken as a temporary escape from fever and fret of life. As the majority of the cinema going population is uneducated, poor and backward so they are highly affected by the ideology projected in these films. This affects more to those who migrate from rural areas to urban localities and feel themselves as unaccompanied and strangers.

2. **Literature Review**

Film and women is a significant and attractive field of research for the media experts as well as for the social scientists. The researches categorized under the head of media and women can be grouped into two types:
i. The research studies which aim to find out the image of women projected through the media and films.

ii. The research studies aiming to find out the position and status of women within media industry i.e. their professional status, working condition and the proportional representation.

Since our study belongs to the first group, an attempt will be made to summarize the researches and work being done under the first category.

The survey of the literature on women and media brings out the fact that there has been an agreement all over the world that the images of women projected through the film tend to reinforce the traditional attitudes and often present a degrading and humiliating picture of women, which may be true for certain cultures and societies, but do not reflect the changing attitudes and the desired role of men and women as demanded by the modern age.

Social scientists, researchers and international agencies working for the emancipation and welfare of women are aware of the fact that the image of women projected by film constitutes a major obstacle to eliminate the discrimination against women throughout the world, and is a main factor in preserving the traditional sexist attitude towards them.

The International Year of Women (1975) and the United Nations’ decade for Women (1976-85) brought out special efforts in the shape of researches, as well as seminars, workshops and round table discussions, to mobilize all forces in order to change this image and replace it by a truthful, honest and desirable representation of women.

Following are the resolutions and the recommendations of the UNESCO sponsored meetings:

The media workshop for Journalists and Broadcasters, Mexico City (July 1975) observed that there is a tendency in the media to “project a stereotyped image of women, reinforcing traditional concepts of the roles of women, prejudicial to aspiration for the improved status, rights and participation in society”.

107
UNESCO Symposium on ‘Women in Cinema’ held in St. Vincent, Italy (July 1975) adopted the resolution:

“We the participants and the observers at the symposium, denounce the existing sexist images of women in the mass media and appeal to women all over the world to carefully examine and analyze these images and to realize that they are literally living in a world of man-made images which do not resemble real women, or deal fairly with the realities of the woman’s experience.

In a national meeting of mass media communication researchers held in Caracas Venezuela, in July 1975; the same critical accents were heard in various speeches and resolutions. Marta Colomina, Director of the School of Communication, Zulia University, Venezuela, expressed: “If a woman is depicted by the media as poor, she must be beautiful; her beauty enhancing her status. The poor woman on film or television has only one preoccupation; how to keep the man she loves, love being the universal panacea that satisfactorily solves all economic and emotional problems”.

The Regional Seminar on Women and Media at AIBD, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia, November 1980, declared in the policy statement “The media should be used more effectively in raising self awareness in women of their inherent and acquired capabilities and of their roles in society as active participation in development”. It further says, “Vigilance must be exercised in monitoring the portrayal and depiction of women in media”.

The Director General of UNESCO, while formulating the resolution for the World Plan of Action adopted by United Nation’s World Conference of the International Women’s’ Year held in Mexico City (July 1975); expressed “The Conference condemns the degrading exploitation of woman as sex symbol and instrument of economic interest by certain media of social communication”. He further stressed “The Conference requests governments and responsible organizations to promote and encourage in the mass communication media of their countries, the projection of a dignified and positive image of women, diverting them of their role as vehicles for publicity and as targets for the
sale of consumer goods, with a view to bringing about changes in
the attitudes and ways of thinking of both men and women and
their full participation in society”

Mrs. Helvi Spila, Secretary General of International Women’s
Year in her opening speech at the Media Workshop for Journalists
and Broadcasters (Mexico City, July 1975) referred the following
three most common women’s’ stereotypes:

1- The “dumb blond”-a woman who is laughed at, by
men for her lack of education and whose sexual
endowments generally place her in the “desirable” but not
“marriageable” category.

2- The “nice girl”-the virginal woman with whom the
hero falls in love and marries. This stereotype has the
qualities of a good servant: Cheerfulness, dutifulness and
obedience to the desire of her husband.

3- The middle class working woman who seeks to free
herself from either of the previous stereotypes and who
seeks through her work to reach parity with the males. This
newly emerging image is identified as domineering, sharp
tongued, unattractive and castrating. This image has
emerged as a result of pressure from a growing number of
the unsatisfied viewers; but is presented in a distorted way,
which arouses more suspicion than sympathy for the
women concerned.

3. Objectives of Studies

The outcome of the present research may initiate the Pakistani film
producers to produce films free from male prejudices, mannish
whims and wrong speculations regarding women. It may imprint
the picture of women as hardworking, dignified and revered on the
mind of the viewers. Keeping in view the results of the present
study, government of Pakistan may formulate such policies which
may be helpful in ending crimes and aggression committed on
women earlier. Finally, the outcome of this research may create
such an environment for more than fifty percent population of
Pakistan where the Pakistani women by exhibiting their capabilities to the fullest, bring economic revolution in Pakistan. For this purpose, media especially the film can be helpful in creating such a favourable atmosphere for the bereaved and suffering female community. The main objective of the present research is to analyze critically the portrayal of Pakistani women in Pakistani Urdu/Punjabi movies to view if our films are portraying the real status of Pakistani women or it is just a fictional construct.

**Hypothesis: 01**

Pakistani Urdu and Punjabi feature films reflect the positive and true picture of Pakistani women and these films address all the issues related to Pakistani women.

**Hypothesis: 02**

Pakistani Urdu and Punjabi feature films are free from Manish whims and prejudices further, the political and social role of Pakistani women is rightly projected in these films.

**4. Research Question**

The present study covers the answer of the following research questions regarding the portrayal of women.

i. Is this portrayal reflective of unquestioned patriarchal assumptions that contribute to subjugate women?

ii. Does the portrayal of women in Pakistani Urdu & Punjabi Films commensurate with the true picture of Pakistani women?

iii. Does the political and social role of Pakistani women projected in Pakistani films coincide with their actual role in the society?

iv. Whether the economic role being played by Pakistani women in agriculture sector is depicted in Pakistani movies or not.

**5. Research Methodology**

The form of inquiry what the films convey needs three fold distinctions between (i) theory (ii) Method (iii) analysis. Films are
analyzed on the bases of their inherent form, content and structure. The aim of any theoretical perspective or theory is to highlight the invisible structure that orders and confers intelligibility upon films. Elsaesser, T & Buckland W say “A particular theory enables the analyst to identify specific aspects of a film’s structure, and to look at and listen to the films from the perspective of its own values…. The aim of theory is to construct different conceptual perspectives on films” (2002: 05).

Each theory devised certain postulates and hypothesis regarding the general nature of films. Whereas the term ‘method’ is concerned, it is used here simply to refer to procedural knowledge that provides tools for the analysis of films. “Methods turn film analysis into an explicit, systematic, and a repeatable discipline based on reliable procedures. It avoids relying on intuition, introspection and hidden assumptions” (ibid: 05).

According to guideline devised by Elsaesser, T & Buckland W, in their book ‘Studying Contemporary American Films: A guide to movie analysis’ I have used feminism as a theoretical perspective and ‘textual analysis’ as a method to collect data and coding as mode of analyzing data. Research design of the present study is as under.

6. Theoretical Frame Work

The analysis of women’s portrayal in films is closely related to Feminist research which has occupied a significant place in the postmodern research for the last two decades. It has contributed to the origin of various methodological ideas e.g. standpoint, positional and reflexivity as well as fore-grounded critical inquiry into gender relations and society. Its main concern is to challenge the silencing of women’s voice in society and research. It also challenges a narrow gendered kind of science which casts women in passive and subordinate role which have become a cause of their exclusion from social science practices as they are considered emotional and incapable of reason. Neumann is of the view that
“feminist research is conducted by people almost all of them are women, who hold a feminist self-identity and consciously use a feminist perspective” (1992: 80).

Feminist research is conducted to give voice to women. It attempts to correct the male-oriented perspective that has predominated in the development of social sciences. The feminist researchers have used different research techniques including films analysis in which women are portrayed in different roles defined and delineated by male producers.

Feminist research is mostly conducted to raise philosophical issues of ontology and epistemology. Reinharz has raised ten claims for feminist research. She observes that feminist research is not a matter of method but a perspective. It involves an ongoing criticism of non-feminist scholarship guided by feminist theory and it aims at creating social change. In same vein, portrayal of women in films is analyzed from feminist perspective. Weiner (1994) offers three principles as a guide: feminist research involves a commitment to improve life chance for girls and women; it involves a critique of unexamined assumptions about women and dominant form of knowing and doing; it is concerned with developing equitable professional and personal practices. So it can be inferred that feminist research is a critical, political and praxis-oriented research

Reinharz (1992) observes that feminist study is an approach and a perspective. It is to examine the unexamined and neglected perspectives of human life. It has a great impact and contribution to the development of many key methodological ideas. It commences many critical inquiries in gender relations and society.

7. Textual Analysis as a Research Method

The present study would be qualitative and explanatory analysis of the movies. The researcher has employed research design of ‘textual analysis’ to encompass the research questions and hypothesis. The dialogues of the chosen films have been recorded and converted into text. Thus the data would be consisting of words, sentences, ideas and themes. So the present research
requires intensive study of these dialogues-cum-texts to find out evidences as the dialogues contain ideas and themes of the producer. So no other method is suitable for the study than ‘Textual Analysis’.

Textual analysis is a technique for collecting and analyzing contents of the text. This method of analysis goes back nearly a century. It has been used in many fields- literature, history, journalism, political science, education, psychology and so on. ‘Textual analysis’ an element of close reading is described by Rockwell (2003) as exploring the question of the relationship between how we represent texts, how we see them, and our theories of textuality. Generally, textual analysis seeks to identify patterns within the text, such as concordance or unity, meaning and truth.

The method of Textual Analysis enables the researcher to include large amount of textual information and systematically identify its properties, e.g. the frequencies of most used keywords (KWIC means Key Word in Context) by detecting the more important structures of its communication content.

8. Finding and Analysis

The female portrayal in Urdu and Punjabi films is based on masculine ideology about women. These masculine ideas are based on sexual desires. Although there are different dimensions of female character, the Urdu and Punjabi movies only show her from one aspect. Hence, woman is presented in the light of traditional views of male-dominant society. According to the female portrayal in the Punjabi movies, different controversial elements are prominent in her personality. Simultaneously, she is strong and weak, prominent and hidden, wise and foolish. The most important thing is that in the form of mother, sister, daughter and wife she is either shown as very virgin and chaste or in the form of notorious gang leader, smoker, drinker, and prostitute she is shown very attractive. As a bad woman she is shown very clever, having all the vices of the world. She can fulfil her sexual
desires even with her servants. She is very bold and aggressive enjoying the murders and assassinations.

Punjabi films portray the woman in a more horrible way than in the Urdu films. It is clear from the movie “Hunter Wali”. There are twin sisters. The first is Bano a very gentle domestic girl. She is very pious girl offering five times prayers and wearing full dress while the second daughter Bali is fond of roaming about in the village. She is adept in horse riding. She is fond of riding with a hunter in her hand that is why she is famous as “Hunter Wali”. The heroines in the Urdu and Punjabi movies are either very shy, obedient, domestic and self-sacrificing or very vulgar. It is also prominent from the heroine of the movie Bakhtawar. Bakhtawar’s mother died the day when Bakhtawar was born. Bakhtawar’s aunt (Phupho) takes the responsibility of her nourishment. After the death of her Phupho, Bakhtawar is handed over to her father and step-mother. Bakhtawar’s father considers her an ill-woman. He does not allow her enter inside the house. She is only allowed to stay in the servant quarter. She serves her step-mother and father as a servant washing the dishes, sweeping the house, washing the dirty clothes etc. She is quite contented at her life and does not complain anybody against it. She is realized time and again that she is ill-omened girl being the cause of her mother’s death. It is aimed that a shy and obedient woman bears all kinds of tortures even she is ready to serve as a maid in her own home. She faces all the hardships silently but when her husband says that her health is falling down and they should not indulge in love making, she comes in a short dress showing vulgarity and obscenity. It is shown that she can face all the hardships but if she is deprived of the sex rights she becomes very aggressive and resists it. This is a negative portrayal of female.

The heroine of the Urdu and Punjabi films does not get big achievements in life rather she is fond of unnecessary and meaningless dances. The heroine of the movie Hunter Wali is the best example of such characters. Though she is the daughter of a rich Chaudhary having wealth yet she does not have any great thing in her life. She does not use the wealth of her father in a
positive way. She could have got higher education by her father’s wealth instead she is an illiterate and ill-mannered girl. She could have got some high office if she had got education but she is only fond of horse riding. She is an expert rider. The people are afraid of her as she is very quarrelsome and haughty but it sounds very odd that when some vagabonds try to rape her, she is unable to some such act by using any fight or action. She becomes very helpless and disappointed after her rape. She wants to commit suicide after her rape. Further, it is very critical that she is in need of the help of a male (Umeri) to avenge vagabonds who raped her.

The heroine of the Urdu and Punjabi films not only performs any great deed but also she is the first one in the expression of love. Bali in the movie Hunter Wali is the perfect example of such characters. Umeri helps her to avenge the vagabonds that raped her. She is inspired by him and falls in love with him. She dances on a vulgar song in order to attract her lover. In the song she is clad in tight fittings. She takes the first step to express her love.

The heroine of the Punjabi films is mostly presented as self-sacrificing sometimes for the parents and sometimes for the siblings or friends. It is clear from the films Niki jayi Han and “Dopata”. In the movie Dopata, there are two friends who become dopata badl behan (so called sisters). In the movie the husband of one friend kills the husband of the other friend who says to her friend that our friendship can only sustain if you also kill your husband. This kind of sacrifice in the real life is impossible. In the movie Niki jayi Han the two friends sacrifice their lover for each other.

The heroine of the Urdu and Punjabi movies arouses the sexual passions of her lover by very obscene and vulgar affectations. It is clear from the movie Dopata. The heroine dances in a vulgar way to attract her lover. But the hero remains unaffected by her dances, then, she sings vulgar song “mera mahboob muje aam ki tarah chusta hai (my lover sucks me as mango). During the song the camera remains focus on her breasts. Throughout the song the hero is shown unaffected by her sex-arousing tricks but at the end of the song he tries to make love with her, she shows some kind of so-
Development of Regional Planning Criteria for Health Services in the city of Riyadh

called resistance. The hero is very aggressive at the end of the song and his way of love making is absolutely uncivilized ill-mannered.

The heroine of the Urdu and Punjabi films is very sentimental and emotional. She does not have a tinge of shrewdness and rationality. The heroine of the movie Hunter Wali after her rape does not seek help of any law implementing authority or her family members. She does not even tell her mother or sister about this tragedy rather she is very hasty in committing suicide. She does not think about the reason of her rape and how to deal with the vagabonds responsible for her rape in a logical way. Although she is not responsible for her moral laxity, she is raped by force yet she considers herself responsible for it which seems quite unreal and irrational. Furthermore, when her father reaches the mountain from where she is about to commit suicide, she does not tell her father that she has no fault of her own in her rape instead she requests her father to kill her so that her father may avoid the impending shame in the society. Her father also is very rash in killing her. He also does not consider the fact that his daughter is raped and he should do some consolation with her instead he is ready to kill her because she may be the reason of shame for him in the society. This gives a negative message to the viewers that the parents should not console with their daughters rather they should kill them.

The heroine of the Urdu and Punjabi films is either very sex-thirsty or very violent girl. As in the movie Wehshi Aurat, the heroine Bali is full of fire of youth. She is a fish out of water in search of love. She sings a vulgar song “a mere mahya mere andar pyar di ag jal rye a, mere utay ishaq pani pa ta k a ag thandi ho sakay, haln k aj main khulay kapray paye ne fer v menu a ag sta rye a (My friend! a fire of youth is burning inside me, put some water to cool it down, though I’m wearing loose clothes, yet the fire is very intense).” During the song her friends throw water to her that makes her body wet and her clothes become stickier to her body and hence the parts of her body become more prominent. The idea of “the fire of youth” is portrayed in a vulgar way. In the song, the gestures of her arms show that she is embracing her love. We get an idea that such kind of female portrayal is due to the negative
thinking of producers. They consider that a female starts burning in the fire of youth when she becomes a bit mature.

The heroine of the Urdu and Punjabi movies is not shrewd but superstitious. As in the movie “Miss Cleopatra”, the heroine is haunted by a giant. The giant tells her that he wants to marry her. She does not fight with the giant instead seeks help of the charms given to him by a charmer. The hero fights the giant and kills him. It is very prominent that a woman cannot kill a giant. It is only a man who has the power to kill a giant. The heroine of the Punjabi films is also attracted by the strong muscles of a man. As in the movie “Kalay Chor”, the heroine ‘Laachi’ is attracted by the strong muscles of Kabeera. She takes the initiative in the expression of love and stops him in the way. Her dialogue with Kabeera is as follows

*Kabeera:* “tu menu kyun rokya ae (Why have you stopped me)?”

*Laachi:* “main tenu is layi rokya ae k tu mere nal i k raat guzaren (I have stopped you to beg a night spending with me).”

*Kabeera:* “dekh tere ch te mere ch boat farq ae (Look! There is a hell of difference between you and me).”

*Laachi:* “ek aurat ek mard di umer nalu nai balke oday mazboot bazuan kulun matsar hundi ae( a woman is inspired by the strong arms of a man instead of his age).”

She is always ready to present her body to Kabeera. In order to attract him, she kisses her naked shoulders and arms. It is shown that she has a bad character while the man has the power to resist her sex-arousing tricks. It seems as if she were on a certain mission of forcing her lover by sobbing, sighing, making gestures and vulgar dances while the hero is shown as having some particular purpose of avenging his enemies. This kind of mission could also have been shown for a girl but she is given the task of alluring the hero.

The women of Urdu and Punjabi films is shown as a sex-product. She is presented by the villain to the men of authority (police
officers) for getting some recommendations and approval. It is prominent from the movie Kalay Chor. The drug dealer Saith Kali Das presents Neeli for sex to a police officer so that the police officer may not arrest the drug dealer and his notorious business may go on. She is wearing very sexy dress in her love making with police inspector. When the police inspector resists her love, she says to him that “ye aurat wo meva hai jo her dasterkhawan ki zeenat banta hai (woman is the sweet dish which is presented at every meal table).” When the police inspector is not enticed by her, she sings vulgar songs “Hye main Kha lye hari mirch, panda gya ve mera tirk tirk (I have eaten green pepper, my body is pricking, I want to have some water).” Her character shows that she is a sex-product used for exploiting the police officers and higher officers.

9. Conclusion and Recommendations

So far as hypothesis of the present study are concerned, findings and evidence of the research analysis show that both of the hypothesis laid down in the chapter ‘Research Methodology’ have been proved false. As the portrayal of women in Urdu and Punjabi films is not reflective of true Pakistani women rather this portrayal presents negative image of Pakistani women in the viewers mind. These movies do not address the women issues nor do they present solution to these problems faced by Pakistani women. So far as the second hypothesis is concerned, findings show that the portrayal of women in Urdu and Punjabi films are not free from male prejudices and these films do not portray the true social and political role performed by actual Pakistani women.

So far as the first key question regarding ‘the unquestioned patriarchal assumptions’ is concerned, the critical analysis shows that portrayal of women in Urdu and Punjabi films is based on the assumptions that male are more dominant, authoritative, powerful, good-natured and more intelligent as opposed to women who are naïve, coward, weak, lusty and prostitute. This stereotyping with women has been shown in these movies on every level. Women as a mode of mother, daughter, sister, wife and friend are portrayed as a passive, dominated, humble, lusty, and helpless creature. These patriarchal discourses regarding the superiority of male &
inferiority of female have been normalized and prevail in the society through the ways the woman are addressed, projected and portrayed in movies. The implication of these normalized prevailing discourses is that gender discrimination can be observed on every level in Pakistani society.

Concerning the second key question, the analysis shows that true Pakistani women do not have any match with the women of films. Actual Pakistani women are playing very active role in every walk of life and striving for the restoration of their political and social status but unfortunately in Punjabi and Urdu films, women have been divided into two extremes. They are shown very virtuous, sacred and idealized character or portrayed as playful, lusty prostitute. She is either portrayed as an angel or Satan. The average population of Pakistani women falls between these two extremes. The evidence of the critical analysis shows that a woman portrayal in Urdu and Punjabi films don’t commensurate with the actual Pakistani women.

Whereas, the social and political role of Pakistani women is concerned, findings prove that political and feminist movements are not projected in films. Though, there are number of N.G.Os and organizations which raise the voice of women and these organizations are connected to the political movements in the society but unfortunately, this wake up call for women rights is heard in the society but in movies, it is totally silent. If the woman of film wants to do some good in the society, she has to sell off her body to set aright what is wrong with the system. No political and social will of the women is portrayed to highlight the women issues in Urdu and Punjabi feature films. Instead, she is portrayed as dancer, pros, madam of brothel house and centre of all evils. Even the liberal and non-conformists are considered as playful and lusty woman because they challenge the dominant normalized discourses that prevail in the society.

Whereas, the role of women in agriculture sector is concerned, it is totally ignored in Pakistani Urdu and Punjabi feature films. Pakistan is an agricultural country and most of population of Pakistan lives in rural areas where the women work shoulder to
shoulder with men and perform different activities right from sowing to cultivating crops. Unfortunately, their activities in the fields are totally ignored in the movies. In agricultural sector, women are doubly colonized by their husbands & by their landlords or feudal and even their agricultural serfdom is not highlighted in movies. They are shown as helpless servitude busy in cutting fodder for cattle or milking buffalo with naked body to be exposed to the ardent lover. She is portrayed as love mongered waiting for a young gallant to whom she wanted to be loved, embraced and married. She is portrayed as a dancing queen in the field of crops. In the fields, she is supposed to wear glamorous and sexy dress in place of a simple and rustic dress. Romantic & sexual illusions are attached with their movements during the activities in fields of crops.

On the basis of the findings of the research, we would like to make a few recommendations to the concerned organizations, agencies and authorities. The recommendations can be considered at two levels.

a. At the policy making level by the:
   i. Federal and Provincial Ministries of Information and Broadcasting.
   ii. Officials of the Central and Provincial Censor Boards.
   iii. Vocal representative of the masses.

b. At the implementation level, by the:
   i. Writers and Actors.
   ii. Film producers and directors, who are the technical hands behind the films,
   iv. Viewers who help in labeling film, a success or a failure.

Following are the recommendations made for improving the image of women:
1. The film should not always portray women sacrificing for the significant others.

2. The film should not project the image of women who are emotionally dependent on others, so much that, if they are deprived, it becomes a matter of life and death for them.

3. The image of women portrayed in film should not be shown as ignorant unaware of her positive human qualities.

4. The film should not glorify and idealize the image of suffering and pathetic women.

5. The film should not glorify the fatalistic attitude adopted by women.

6. The film should not always project women in passive and submissive role.

7. The film should portray the image of women who can manipulate the circumstances according to their wishes and needs; instead of becoming the victim of the circumstances.

8. The film should not over emphasize the physical beauty and attractiveness of women characters.

9. The film should try to project the image of women who have inner human qualities, and are valued and respected for these qualities instead of their physical attractions and sex appeal.

10. She should not be recognized only through the references of her counterpart. She must have her own identity.

11. The women should not be projected with narrow and limited interests in life.

12. She should not confine herself to the domestic roles only.

13. The women should not always be shown as behaving at emotional level, instead of rational level.

14. Love and romance should not be the major assignment of the young women characters portrayed in the film.

References
Development of Regional Planning Criteria for Health Services in the city of Riyadh

Bukhtawar. (1991) A Film By Iqbal Kashmiri: Lahore

Dopatta. (1998) A Film By Javaid Hassan: Lahore


Hunter Wali. (1988) A Film By Iqbal Kashmiri: Lahore


Kale Chore .(1991) A Film By Nazarul Islam: Lahore

Miss Kelopatra. (1990) A Film By Javaid Faazal: Lahore

National Meeting of Mass Media. (July 1975) Caracas Venezuela
Regional Seminar on Women and Media (November 1980) Kuala Lumpur

Resolution 19. Adopted by the World Conference of the International Women’s year. (July 1975)

The Media Workshop for Journalist and Broadcasters. (July 1975) Mexico City

UNESCO Symposium on” Women in Cinema. (July 1975) St. Vincent Italy


Comparing the Salient Features of Digital Library Software
Farzana Shafique* 
Sundus Tariq**

Abstract: There are many open source software available for organizations and individuals to create digital libraries (DLs) but to assess the merits and demerits of DLs software, there is no simple instrument available to evaluate these DL software packages. The objectives of the present work were not only to develop a checklist for evaluating the Digital library software packages but also to compare the features of two most used open source DL software against this checklist. For achieving these objectives, a comprehensive checklist was developed to assess the merits and demerits of digital library (DL) software. Features that characterized “good” open source DL software were determined after reviewing the relevant literature and the features of many state of the art DL software packages. At first, the essential categories of features that DL software should possess were identified and a checklist consisting of 12 main categories of features was developed. These 12 categories were further subdivided. The two most used DL software in Pakistan, i.e. GreenStone and D-Space were assessed and compared against this checklist. After evaluation against this checklist, GreenStone was found to be the best performer than D-Space. GreenStone was the only software package that held most of the features in the checklist.

Key words: Digital libraries, DL software, Open source software

1. Introduction

The digital era not only influenced the society but all the social institutions as well. The libraries as social institutions had no exceptions. This digital revolution not only influenced the services of libraries but collection formats as well. New terms have emerged in recent years to represent this digital influence on

* Lecturer, Department of Library and Information Science, IUB
Email: alakhdarem2001@yahoo.com

** MLIS, Department of Library and Information Science, IUB
libraries. The term of digital libraries was introduced not only to represent the new collection format but new mode of accessing the library collection as well. According to Prytherch (2005), the digital library is an umbrella term for conceptual modes of libraries of the future that focuses on the provision of services associated almost totally with digital content and to describe those aspects of existing library services that have significant components. In broader context, the digital libraries can be defined as organizations that provide the resources, including the specialized staff, to select, structure, offer intellectual access to interpret, distribute, preserve the integrity of, and ensure the persistence over time of collections of digital works so that they are readily and economically available for use by a defined community or set of communities (Feather & Sturges, 2003).

According to Hull (2001), libraries of all sizes and types are embracing digital collections, although most libraries will continue to offer both print and digital collections for many years to come. New purchases and purchases of journals, magazines, and abstracting and indexing services are heavily weighted toward digital. While digital books (e-books) are only beginnings to become a presence in library collections. One must rely on hardware and software in order to view the digital contents of digital resources. Breeding (2002) believes that one of the key functionalities of a DL should be the matching of user work patterns. To achieve this, a thorough understanding of the users of libraries and the system itself should be obtained. Apart from the need for deeper understanding of users, the fit between the tools used to craft the DL and the necessary requirements has to be ascertained.

There are wide varieties of digital library software; some are free or open source software and some are commercial ones. The concept of developing digital libraries and use of open source software has widespread within last few years. In developing countries, open source softwares are more used for developing digital libraries. Hussain (2006); and Hussain, Mahmood, and Shafique (2008) found that there was a little awareness among
library and information professionals of Pakistan about the development of digital libraries. However, in recent years the concept of digital libraries has become pervasive in Pakistan. For example, Shafique and Tariq (2011) concluded after a focus group of information professionals that now many library and information professionals are not only aware of the concept but many libraries of Pakistan had developed their digital repositories and many others were planning to develop. They also mentioned that GreenStone and D-Space, the two open source digital library software were among the most used software. Thus keeping the findings of researchers in Pakistan (Hussain, 2006; Hussain, Mahmood and Shafique, 2008; Shafique, 2009; Shafique, and Tariq, 20110) in view, two open source digital library (DL) software i.e., Green Stone and D-Space were selected for evaluation against the checklist developed by these researchers.

2. Objectives of the Study

No comprehensive study has been conducted in Pakistan at local or national level for finding out the best suitable digital library software. Nor any standard tool or directory is available for the selection and evaluation of the digital library software, neither comprehensive literature is written and published in Pakistani scenario discussing the technical and practical aspect of digital library software. In this perspective, following are the objectives of the study:

   i) To develop a comprehensive checklist for evaluating the digital library software.
   ii) To evaluate the two most used open source and free digital library software (i.e., GreenStone and D-Space) against this checklist.

3. Methodology

The two most used DL software in Pakistan, i.e. GreenStone and D-Space are assessed and compared against the checklist. A checklist consisting of 12 categories of items was developed.
Research Limitation/ Implication: In this paper only two open source digital library software were compared on the basis of checklist.

4. Findings and Analysis

This section compares the GreenStone and D-Space software against the checklist developed by the researchers. Table-1 provides a tabular view of the checklist. There are 12 main categories in the checklist i.e., Content Management; Content Acquisition; Metadata; Search Support; ACCESS Control and Privacy; Reports and Inquiry Capabilities; Preservation; Interoperability; User Interface; Standard Complaisance; Automatic Tools; and System Support and Maintenance. Each category is further divided in sub categories. The details of all the categories covered in the checklist and an analysis of Greenstone and D-Space against this checklist is also presented in Table-1. The description of that analysis is as follows:

1. Content Management

Content management involves procedure and tools pertaining to the submission of content in to digital library as well as management of the submission process.

1.1 Submission Management

Only GreenStone allows multiple collections within same installation system, repository administration to set submission parameter and provides home page for each collection. These features are absent in D-Space.

1.2 Submission Workflow

Both the softwares do not provide segregated submission workspace and configurable submission roles within collection, while a submission role is only available in D-Space.

1.3 Submission Support

Facility of E-mail notification for users and administration is only available in D-Space.
1.4 Submission Review

Feature of allowing users to review complete and incomplete contents and allowing content administration to review submission are available only in GreenStone digital library software, while D-Space does not have these features.

2. Content Acquisition

Content acquisition refers to content import / export, versioning and support documents formats.

2.1 Content Import / Export

Only GreenStone allows uploading of compressed files and uploading from existing URL. It also supports volume import of objects and metadata for existing volume.

2.2 Document / Object Format

Administrator ability to limit approved file format: In Greenstone, the administrator has ability to limit approved file format, and submission items can comprise multiple files or file type.

2.3 Text Format

Both the digital library software support ASCII as text format, while only GreenStone supports UNICODE and RTF as well.

2.4 Image Format

GreenStone supports image formats such as TIFF, GIFF, and JPEG.

2.5 Presentation Formats

Both the software support adobe post script, while only GreenStone supports PDF too.

2.6 Structured Formats

HTML and XML as structured formats are supported by both the software, while SGML is only supported on by Greenstone.

2.7 Audio and Video Formats
Only GreenStone digital library software supports Wave, MP3 as audio and video formats, while MPEG is supported by both the software.

2.8 Version Control

Both the software allow past version of files to be retrieved, identification and composition of the change.

3. Metadata

Metadata support in DLs is vital in content indexing, storage, access, and preservation

3.1 Real time Updating and Indexing of Accepted Content Features Available

GreenStone and D-Space software support the following metadata standards; DUBLIN CORE, MARC21. On the other hand, none of the software supports EAD, LOM, MODS and VRA Core categories.

3.2 Add / Delete Customized Metadata Fields: This feature is not available in any software.

3.3 Set Default Values for data: Only GreenStone allows setting default values for data.

3.4 Support Unicode Character set for Metadata: This feature is not available in any software.

4. Search Support

4.1 Full Text

Only GreenStone supports full text search with Boolean logic. Other search options such as use of Truncation/wild cards, Phrased and Proximity search are not supported by both the software.

4.2 Search all Descriptive Metadata
Searching of all descriptive Metadata with Boolean logic is available only in GreenStone, while use of Truncation/wild cards for this purpose is not supported by both the software.

4.3 Search Selected Metadata

Browsing by author, title, issue date is supported by both the software, while searching by subject term, collection, and customized fields are supported only by GreenStone.

4.4 Sort Search Results

Sorting of search results by author, title is possible in both the software, while sorting by issue date is only supported by D-Space. However, sorting by relevancy or by other criteria is not possible in both the software.

5. Access Control and Privacy

Access control and privacy include the administration of passwords, as well as the management of the users’ accounts and rights to specified location within digital library.

5.1 Password Administration

Both the soft wares do not allow assigning of passwords by the system. However, both the software support the user selected passwords and retrieval of the forgotten software.

5.2 User Management

The feature of adding and deleting of users’ profile is not available in both the software. However, editing of users’ profile is possible in both the software.

5.3 Limits Access at Different Level

Features like File/object and collection levels are not available in both the software.

5.4 Users’ Roles
Both the software do not support features related to users’ roles such as allowing definition of different user groups; limiting access by role; and allowing collection to be customized for each role.

5.5 Access Management
Similarly the Access Management related features are also missing both the software such as IP source address and Proxy filtering.

5.6 Credential-based Access
Credential-based Access features like encryption and digital signature are also not supported by both the software.

6. Reports and Inquiry Capabilities
This category is concerned with usage monitoring and reporting.

6.1 System Generated Usage Statistics
System Generated Usage Statistics is possible only in GreenStone.

6.2 Usage Report
The features related to Usage Report such as report timeline specification; report fields customization; and reports templates are available only in GreenStone.

7. Preservation
Preservation refers to preservation of metadata and quality control measure to ensure integrity, and persistence documentation identification for migration purposes.

7.1 Persistence Documents Identification
System assigned identification and CNRI Handel features are not available in both the software.

7.2 Quality Control: This feature is not available in both the software.

7.3 Prescribed Digital Preservation Strategy: This feature is not available in both the digital library software.

8. Interoperability
Interoperability is concerned with the benefits of integration distribution collection and system.

8.1 OAI-PMH: OAI-PMH feature is available in both the digital library software.

8.2 Z39.50 Protocol complaint: Z39.50 Protocol is only supported by GreenStone.

8.3 Research Protocol: Dients and SDLIP features are not available in both the digital library software.

9. User Interface

This category deals with support for multilingual access as well as the ability to customize the user interface to suit the needs of different digital library implementation.

9.1 Modify Interface “Look and Feel”: In D-Space and GreenStone the modification of interface according to users’ needs is possible.

9.2 Apply a customized Header / Footer to Statistics or Dynamic Pages: Both the digital library software support customized header/ footer to statistics.

9.3 Support Multi-lingual Interface: D-Space and GreenStone also support multilingual interfaces.

10. Standard Complaisance

Standards are important for sharing the digital contents and long-term digital preservation (Dawson, 2004).

10.1 Structured Document Formats e.g. XML, SGML: D-Space and GreenStone support structured document formats.

10.2 Metadata Formats e.g. Dublin core: Standard metadata formats are also supported by D-Space and GreenStone.

10.3 Text Format e.g. UNICODE: Similarly the text formatting feature is also supported by both the software.

10.4 Image Formats e.g. TIFF: Only GreenStone supports this feature on the other hand D-Space does not support it.
11. Automatic Tools

This category refers to tools for automated content acquisition, harvesting, and metadata generation. In this context of DLs, automatic tools are useful for maintenance and can reduce labour cost, especially for large collection (Arms, 2000).

11.1 Metadata entry system: This feature is available only in GreenStone.

11.2 Generation of Search indexes: The features related to Generation of Search Indexes are available only in GreenStone, such as Search Indexes; HTMML; and Reports.

12. System Support and Maintenance

Support and maintenance are important aspects in all software system, and open source software is often criticized to be lacking these. It contains documentation, manuals, mailing list, discussion forum, bug tracking, feature request system, and formal helpdesk.

12.1 Documentation / Manuals: This feature is available only in GreenStone.

12.2 Mailing list / Discussion Forums: Both the digital library software supports this option.

12.3 Bug Tracks / Features Requested System: This feature is also supported by both the digital library software.

12.4 Helpdesk Support: Helpdesk support is also provided by both the software.

5. Conclusion

The checklist developed by the researchers can be helpful for evaluating the digital library software either commercial or open source. The checklist is consisting of 12 main categories. The 12 main categories i.e., Content Management; Content Acquisition; Metadata; Search Support; ACCES Control and Privacy; Reports and Inquiry Capabilities; Preservation; Interoperability; User Interface; Standard Complaisance; Automatic Tools; and System Support and Maintenance are further divided in sub categories.
The two most used DL software in Pakistan, i.e. GreenStone and D-Space were assessed and compared against this checklist. The selection of these two open source software was in the light of reviewed literature (Hussain, 2006; Hussain, Mahmood and Shafique, 2008; Shafique, 2009; Shafique, and Tariq, 20110).

Above comparison shows that most of the features are available only in GreenStone. It is the only software package that holds most of the features included in the checklist. Literature findings also rate GreenStone as a better and most used software (Hussain, 2006; Hussain, Mahmood and Shafique, 2008; Shafique, 2009; Shafique, and Tariq, 20110). Following recommendations are made in the light of findings of the study:

1. The librarians interested in developing the digital libraries should conduct a field survey before selecting any software. They should consult the librarians who are already successfully running their digital library projects.
2. The checklist developed by the researchers can be used for evaluating any digital library software before selection.
3. The open source digital library software can be a good and economical source in Pakistani perspective.

References


Hussain, A., Mahmood, K., & Shafique, F. (2008) Perceptions of LIS professionals about digital libraries in Pakistan. *The Electronic Journal of Academic and Special Librarianship, 9*(1). Available at: [http://southernlibrarianship.icaap.org/content/v09n01/hussain_a01.html](http://southernlibrarianship.icaap.org/content/v09n01/hussain_a01.html)


**Taqiyy Al-Din Ibn Taymiyyah as a Philosopher**

---

Abdul Rauf Zafar*

**Abstract:** Ahmed b. Abdul Haleem b. Abdussalam known as Taqiyy Al-Din Ibn Taymiyyah was born in Harran, Syria in 661AH -1263AD and died in Damascus in 728AH -1328AD. His grandfather, Abu al-Barkat Majd al-Deen ibn Taymiyyah al-Hanbali (d. 1255) was famous scholar of the Hanbali School of law. Ibn Taymiyyah’s father, Shihab al-Deen ‘Abd al-Hleem ibn Taymiyyah (d. 1284) was also a well known scholar. He got his earlier education at his home from his father. The number of his teachers is more than 200. One of his teachers was Shamsaldin Al-Maqdasi who was the Chief Justice of Syria. Ibn Taymiyyah was about seventeen years old when the Chief Justice authorized

---

* Director Seerat Chair, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Pakistan.
him to issue Fatwa. At this age he also started delivering lectures. When he was thirty, he was offered the position of Chief Justice which he denied.  

Key words: Western Philosophers & Muslim Philosopher Ibn Taymiyyah

1. External Situation of Muslim Ummah in his Age

In the era of Ibn Taymiyyah, the Islamic world was suffering from external aggression and internal strife. The crusaders had not been fully expelled from the Holy Land, and the Mongols had entirely destroyed the Eastern Islamic Empire when they captured Baghdad in 656/AH 1258/AD. In Egypt, the Mamluks had just come to power and were consolidating their hold over Syria.

2. Internal Situation of Muslim Ummah in his age:

Within the Muslim society, Sufi Orders were spreading beliefs and practices not approved by orthodox Islam, while the orthodox schools of jurisprudence were stagnant in religious thought and practice. It was in this setting of turmoil and conflict that Ibn Taymiyyah formulated his views about the causes of the weakness of the Muslims and on the need to return to the Quran and Sunnah (practices of the Holy Prophet (S.A.W)) as the only means for revival.

3. Main Doctrine of Imam Ibn Taymiyyah:

Ibn Taymiyyah was a staunch defender of Sunni Islam based on strict adherence to the Qur'an and authentic Sunnah (practices) of the Prophet Muhammad (S.A.W). He believed that these two sources contain all the religious and spiritual guidance, necessary for our salvation in the hereafter. Thus he rejected the arguments and ideas of both, Philosophers and Sufis regarding religious knowledge, spiritual experiences and ritual practices.

4. Revival in the Field of Philosophy:

---

7 www.islamicphilosophy.com
In the field of philosophy Imam Ibn Taymiyyah played a vital role which can be discussed in two folds.

(i)  Refutation of the Theory of Greek Philosopher (Aristotle):

Those people, who have compiled the history and memoirs of the philosophers, are of the view that the earliest philosophers such as Pythagoras, Socrates and Plato etc had the opportunities to visit frequently the lands where prophets lived. They got benefited from the teachings of sage Luqman, and the prophets Daud (A.S) and Suleman (A.S), but Aristotle had never been to the lands of the prophets, thus never gained anything from them, nor did he have any piece of the scriptures, as his precursors had. He had some material of astro-worshippers, and he gave such teachings and made such a law, that his disciples followed him blindly.  

Unfortunately, the philosophy which gained immense popularity in the Muslim world is that of Aristotle, and his philosophy is considered the philosophy of Greece during the last period.

“The philosophy which is followed by Al-Farabi, Avicenna, Averoes and Suhrwardi etc, is the philosophy of Mashaien and all that is reported from Aristotle who is remembered as the first teacher among the philosophers”.  

If the philosophy of Aristotle is studied in depth, the entity and concept of God has merely a mental existence in it. Imam Ibn Taymiyyah says:

“When a shrewd or a man of wisdom thinks over his sayings regarding God, it becomes crystal clear that the oneness of God, proved by these philosophers, have an existence in the mind only, and He has no existence outside of that mind (in external life)”.

(ii)  Imam Ibn Taymiyyah (R.A) and Those Affected by Greek Philosophy:

---

9 Ibn Taymiyyah, Taqiyy al-Din, Al-Rud Alalal Al-Bakri, P.206.
10 Ibn Taymiyyah, Tafseer Surah-e-Ikhlas, P.37.
Ibn Taymiyyah (R.A) severely castigates on those sages or scholars who applaud and eulogise Aristotle so greatly. In this concern, mostly, he criticized Avicenna who is considered the greatest interpreter and explainer of Aristotle’s philosophy in the East. Imam Ibn Taymiyyah says about him:

“The philosophers of the previous ages seem to be the most ignorant creature to the learned and believers. Their deviation and contradiction is so naked that it can be deemed even by the sharp children. When they decided that they have to follow their predecessors who themselves got astray, and have to acknowledge the building of logics stood on their laws, and not to get any light and guidance which revealed and exposed everything to their hearts and ears, then their instance is like that who tries to blow out the light of the sun with his puff or strives to hide it under his skirt”.

Avicenna has proved that the grandeur of prophet-hood is a force among the forces of soul or spirit or body. And the forces of the soul are in so much contradiction. Such things can be uttered merely by a person who is ignorant of the reality of the prophet-hood; and it is just like that, as a person who argues and admits the existence of sages and experts in fiqh, on the basis of the existence of the poets, rather this example, does not suit altogether, for there is a great difference rather extra difference between a prophet and an ordinary man as compared to the difference among expert in fiqh, physician and a poet. But philosophers are entirely unacquainted with the connotation of the prophet-hood. When the prophets became famous, their followers began to prove everything regarding them on the principles of those philosophers who knew nothing about prophet-hood and who had no knowledge with the prophets.

A well known sage and philosopher of the 7th century AD, Averroes, was so immensely confident in reasoning and oration

---

11 Ibn Taymiyyah, Al-Rud Alalal Al-Bakri, P.115.
12 Ibn Taymiyyah, Al-Nubuwah(al-Matba tu-Salfia wa Maktabatuha, Cairo). P.22.
Development of Regional Planning Criteria for Health Services in the city of Riyadh

that he considered it the standard of human felicity, and it was impossible for him to access the reality without it. The biographer of Averroes says:

“Averroes had a great passion with the reasoning of Aristotle. He says about him that he was provenance (Mumba) for the felicity of human beings. The right measurement of human felicity is that how much reasoning and logic he knows. Reasoning is such a source and device which makes an easy approach to reality where not only ordinary but particular persons can’t reach”\(^\text{13}\)

Similarly, Imam Ghazali writes about “reasoning” in the foreword of his book “Al-Mastasfa”:

“Reasoning is the preface of all knowledge, and one who is not fully conversant with it he should absolutely not rely upon his knowledge”.\(^\text{14}\) Imam Ghazali narrates the importance of reasoning in his book “Maqasid Al-Falasifa”:

“As for the theorem and conversations are concerned, the fact is, that most of them are correct and proved and there is seldom any mistake in them. And if there is any contradiction between Greek Scholars and Ahl-e-Haq (Muslim Scholars) it is that of terminologies and objections, not of meaning and objectives. That is why the motive and procedure of this art is the correction and reformation of arguing and reasoning. All worthy commentators are agreed in this concern”\(^\text{15}\)

In the view of Imam Ibn Taymiyyah (R.A) there are also such philosophers who were too much absorbed in Greek knowledge and philosophy, and apart from reaching to the status of Imams in the knowledge, they were good writers and scholars. For example, Avicenna, whose “ode” is a fine model of Arabic spirit and in whose writings, suavity and eloquence, is found against the philosophers. According to him, it is an avocation with Islamic and

---

\(^{13}\) Islam Muhammad Lutfi Jumma, Tareekh-e-Filasifa, P. 120-121.
\(^{14}\) Al-Ghazali, Al-Mustasfa, 1/10.
\(^{15}\) Al-Ghazali, Maqasid Al-Falasifa (Matba tu-Saadata be Jaware Muhafiz-e-Misar), P.3.
Arabic literature and the blessings of Islamic studies. This is confirmed by the biographers of Avicenna. Ibn Taymiyyah writes:

“If eloquence and articulation is to be found in conversation of anyone among these philosophers and men of reasoning, as can be seen in the writings of Avicenna, this is the consequence of the benefit got by the Muslims from these literatures, for if he followed the way of his predecessors and deviated from the knowledge that he obtained from the Muslims, his wisdom (argument) and narrations would also be deficient and impotent like theirs”.

In this way Ibn Taymiyyah’s brief opinion about reasoning is:

“The part of reasoning which is accurate and useful is natural, that a man of wisdom does not need, and the part which is needed it is useful only in knowing the terminologies of the skilled only, their procedure and their mistakes”.

Ibn Taymiyyah writes in another place:

“I was ever of the view that a man, blessed with sagacity by Almighty Allah, does not need Greek reasoning; and one who is deprived of this blessing of God cannot get any benefit from such reasoning”.

(iii) Meaning and the Proper Position of Ideological Reasoning:

He believed that logic is not a reliable means of attaining religious truth and that the intellect must be subservient to revealed truth. He also came into conflict with many of his fellow Sunni scholars because of his rejection of the rigidity of the schools of jurisprudence in Islam.

Wherever Imam Ibn Taymiyyah makes criticism, he considers reasoning as mental exercise and austerity. Once he says:

---

17 Ibid, P, 201.
18 Ibid, 3.
“It is a fact that the study of minute and particle knowledge and its practice opens the minds and the power of knowledge is acquired, as with the practice of throwing arrows and riding horses makes marksmanship correct, and the riding of horses becomes easy, and the people exercise such practices before war, which is a useful motive and purpose”. 19

(iv) Rejection of Theories of Various Sects:

Imam Ibn Taymiyyah lived in a time after these sects had been emerged. He thoroughly studied their concepts and opinions, and compared them with the views found in the Quran and Sunnah. As a conclusion, he expressed that all these sects which debate or make conversation on (Qazia) were not in accordance with the established Islam. Let’s see his opinions about various sects of his time.

a. Moatazilah:

Ibn Taymiyyah gave primary importance to revelation, as the only reliable source of knowledge about Allah and about a person's religious duties towards him. The human intellect ('aql) and its power of reasoning must be subservient to revelation. According to Ibn Taymiyyah, the only proper use of 'aql was to understand Islam in the same way of Prophet and his companions, and then to defend it against deviant sects. When discussing the nature of God, he argued, one must accept the descriptions found in the Qur'an and Sunnah and apply the orthodox views of not asking how (bi-la kayf) particular attributes exist in God. This means that one believes in all of the attributes of God mentioned in the Qur'an and Sunnah without investigating the nature of these, because the human mind is incapable of understanding the eternal God. For example, one accepts that God is upon a throne above the heavens without questioning how this is possible. This same attitude is held

19 Ibn Taymiyyah, Taqiyy al-Din, Al-Rud Alal Mantaqiyyin, P. 255.
for all attributes of God such as His sight, His hearing or His hand.20

The creeds of Moatazilah are as under:

i. The religion of Allah, His qualities i.e knowledge, power, life etc. are exactly His self.

ii. The Holy Quran is mortal and a creature.

iii. Contemplation of Allah is impossible in hereafter (on the Day of Judgment).

iv. Human being himself is the creator of his own deeds, and on account of this, he deserves reward and punishment.

v. One who commits grievous sins and does not repent will always remain in hell.

vi. Each deed of God is for the profitability of human being and affliction is also a blessing.

vii. Allah is free of resemblance and similarity.

viii. To attribute cruelty and wickedness to God is paganism or heathenism.21

Imam Ibn Taymiyyah (R.A) has written some other significant and useful books about these seditions. For example:

i. Al-Aqeedah-ul-Hamwiyah.

ii. Taaraz-ul-Aql wa al-naqal.

iii. Aqwama ma qeel fi al-qaza wa al-Qadr.


v. Asbat al-radd Ala al-Qadriyah wa al-jabriyah.22

This view is very much opposed to the philosophical view of God as first cause and as being devoid of attributes. Thus the

20  www.islamicphilosophy.com
21  Barq,Dr. Gullam Jillani,Imam ibn Taymiyyah,(Islamic publishing Lahore, 1979), P. 159-160.
22  Ibid, P. 160.
philosophical argument that the oneness of God precludes a multiplicity of attributes was not acceptable to Ibn Taymiyyah (R.A), because God says that He is one and that He has various attributes. This denial of the attributes of God based on reasoning was adopted by the Mu'tazila, of whom Ibn Taymiyyah (R.A) was especially critical.²³

b. Jabariyyah

Ulama (scholars), Ubbad (worshippers) men of reasoning and a group of mystics accept fate and destiny and believe that Allah is the Sustainer and Master of each and everything. Whatever He wants is done, and whatever He doesn’t want can’t be done, He is the Creator of each and everything. To this level whatever these people say is correct. But when they step into other issues like that of the obligatory and the forbidden, the reward and the punishment they make addition or scarcity. Until their exaggeration manage to reach them on the door of atheism. They like the idolaters, in the words of Quran, begin to say:

"That if God want, and then we and our forefathers would not have indulged in idolatry".

No doubt, that the idolaters also accepted it that Allah Almighty is the creator of heaven and earth. Everything is in His possession and control. The idolaters also believe in Allah’s control over destiny, because the Arabs believed in destiny even during the reign of ignorance (before Islam). So many proofs are available in their poetry and prose (literature).²⁵

a. Asha’irah

Orthodox views of the Asha'aris, who accepted seven attributes basic to God, were criticized by Ibn Taymiyyah. However, he did not go so far as to declare these two groups heretical, for they

²³ www.islamicphilosophy.com
²⁴ Al-Anaam:148.
²⁵ Taymiyyah, Taqiyy al-Din, Al-Rasail wa Almasail (Idara al-Bahus al-Islamia wa Dawat wl Irshad al-Riyadh), 5/128.
deviated only in their interpretation of God's nature. But he did not spare the label of apostate for those philosophers such as Al-Farabi and Avicenna who, in addition to the denial attributes of God, also denied the creation of the world and believed in the emanation of the universe from God.\textsuperscript{26}

Asha’irah and Maturediyah:

Asha’irah considered human being helpless and Maturediyah considered the man as independent. Since there was no great scholar in the followers of Maturediyah, that’s why, their doctrine did not promote so greatly while the following scholars took part to popularize the Asha’irah sect.


Imam Ibn Taymiyyah has disparity to some of the doctrines of these scholars. So he has written a few booklets about it.

i. Sharah al–Aqeeda al-Asfahaniyah.
ii. Taaraz ul Aql wa Naql.
iii. Risala fi al-Aqeeda al-Ash’aria wa Al-Maturidiyah.\textsuperscript{27}

He does not agree with Abul’l Hassan Ash’ari because Ash’ari considers Hanabila believing in Tajseem and Ibn Taymiyyah has a great respect for Imam Ahmed b. Hanbal (R.A). He disagrees with Ghazali because he relies upon Avicenna while discussing on philosophy, and he does not agree with Razi also, for, he tries to seek the solution of everything by the force of reasoning.\textsuperscript{28}

Imam Ibn Taymiyyah (R.A) says about Ashai’rah:

\textsuperscript{26} \url{www.islamicphilosophy.com}
\textsuperscript{27} Barq, Dr. Ghulam Jelani, Imam Ibn Taymiyyah, Islamic Publishing House Lahore P162-163.
\textsuperscript{28} Ibid.
“The people having tendency towards Jabar say that these deeds are the creation of their own, but is earned (done) by the human being. These people are also of the opinion that human beings have no interference in the occurrence of incidents of fate, because it is Allah’s art and practice that He creates omnipotence with the destiny. This deed is from Allah Almighty and is created by Him, and is employed by the human being, because on its occurrence he has no authority. They were also of the view that human being is not the creator of his own deeds, nor is the inventor. In spite of this, they say that they do not believe in jabr but accept the power of creation of human being and a pure Jabri man does not accept the power of human being.”

The Sedition of Creation of Quran:

This sedition began during the reign of Caliph Mamun al-Rashid. Once a discussion was going on the issues of knowledge in the Court of Mamun al-Rashid where a Christian scholar stood up and said “if Quran is primal and not a creature, then the Christ (Esa A.S) ought to be primeval and not a creature”. Imam Ibn Taymiyyah (R.A) has written several books on this issue and made it crystal clear with logic and arguments that the Holy Quran is not a creature. Books on this issue are as under:

i. Jawab Masala al-Quran hal Huwa Harfun aw sotun.
ii. Risala fil Quran.
iii. Risala fi haqeeqat ul kalam elahi.
iv. Qaida fil Quran wa kalam ullah.

The summary of the manuscripts of Imam Ibn Taymiyyah (RA) is as follow:

“The Words (Holy Quran) of Allah is primal, but He began to speak whenever He wishes by His power and will. But if it is said

29 Majma Al-Rasail wal Masail, 5/141.
30 Barq, Dr. Ghulam Jilani, Imam Ibn Taymiyyah, p. 161
that Allah is speaking with sound then it is not necessary that His sound is also primeval”.

b. Qad,riah

They believe that there are two types of forces in the world; Force of the virtue and force of the evil. The force of virtue is god of virtue and the force of evil is the god of evil. They are of the view that sin is the creation of man, not of Allah.

By rejecting this, Imam Ibn Taymiyyah says:

“One who writes about Qadariyyah that they say, that obedience is from God and sin is from human being, he is ignorant about Qadariyyah’s creed. No Qadriyyah’s theologian (scholar) had said like that nor was it possible for them to say like that. The real creed is that of man’s act of obedience is like that of his act of sin. The undertaking of both of these is the consequence of his dominion which has secured by him. Nothing can be said about both, the virtue and evil, that the force and intention secured by man have brought in use one thing obedience or evil in particular”.

c. Wahdat-ul-Wujud:

The main tenet of Sufi thought as propounded by Ibn al-'Arabi is the concept of the oneness of existence (wahdat al-wujud). Through this belief, Sufis are of the view that they are able to effect a merging of their souls with God's essence. That is, when God reveals his truth to an individual, that person realizes that there is no difference between God and the self. Ibn Taymiyyah observed a link between the Sufi belief of wahdat al-wujud and the philosophical concept of emanation. Although the philosopher would doubt that a human soul could flow into, and thus be, the First Cause, the mystical experience of the Sufis took them beyond the realm of intellectual discourse. According to the mystic, a merging occurred but could not be expressed in rational terms. For Ibn Taymiyyah, both the philosopher and the mystic were deluded,

31 Majma Al-Rasail wal Masail, 3/156.
32 Majma Al-Rasail wal Masail, 5/141.
the former by reliance on a limited human intellect and the latter by excessive emotions.  

d. Criticism on Mystical Sufism:

Ibn Taymiyyah's argument against the Sufis is on two levels. First, there is the theological position that God has attributes and that one of these attributes is, God as a Creator. Ibn Taymiyyah believed that the Qur'an firmly establishes that God is the one who created, originated and formed the universe. Thus there exists a distinction between God, the Creator and the creatures. This is an absolute distinction with no possibility of merging. He then went on to say that those who strip God of his attributes and deny that He is the Creator are just one step away from falling into the belief of wahdat al-wujud. This is the basis for the second part of his argument. Ibn Taymiyyah believed that a Sufi is simply someone who is overcome by an outburst of emotion. For example, someone may deny God's attributes but could then be overwhelmed by a feeling of love for God. However, the basis of that person's knowledge is not the authentic information from the Qur'an, and so their weak intellectual foundation collapses with the extreme emotion. According to Ibn Taymiyyah, sense, perception, and emotions cannot be trusted, and the likelihood of being led astray by them is compounded when one has a basis of knowledge which itself is errant and deviant. One holds a proper belief in God and maintains a proper relationship with Him, Ibn Taymiyyah argued, by establishing a foundation of knowledge based on the Qur'an and authentic Sunnah.  

5. Revival Movements against Bad Custom and Tradition

Iman Ibn Taymiyyah relentlessly fought against heretic belief and innovated-practice that had crept into the body of Islam. He endeavoured to revive the religion of Islam in its pristine purity and revolutionary spirit. In this context, he started his movement which was two folded.  

33 Zuraq, Muhammad Abu, Biography of Imam Ibn Taymiyyah, Al-maktba al-Salafiyyah Lahore, 1971) P. 513.  
34 www.islamicphilosophy.com
(i) Revolution against shirk and innovation.

(ii) Emphasizing on the concept of Towhid with all its implications.

In this effort he had to encounter with those who upheld Greek Philosophy and the sufi masters. The reason was that according to Imam Ibn Taymiyyah’s the Greek Philosophy is based on worship of Idols. Ibn Taymiyyah says: Allah has condemned polytheists, especially on two grounds. Firstly, they took partners with Allah, without authority. Secondly, they held things as unlawful which have not been forbidden by Allah.  

“The Prophet (S.A.W) clarified this. According to Hadith recorded by Muslim, Allah Says:  

“I had created all My servants as monotheist. Satan, however, misled them, What I had declared as lawful he made it unlawful, and people were commanded to take partners with Me, without any authority”.

Quran says:

“Those who take partners with Allah say: ‘If Allah had willed, we would not have taken partners with Him, nor would our fathers; and we would not have forbidden anything’.”

a). Revolution against Polytheism

Ibn Taymiyyah criticized the idea of emanation not only in its philosophical but also in its mystical context, as adopted by the Sufis. He felt that the beliefs and practices of the Sufis were far more dangerous than were the ideas of the philosophers. The latter were a small elite group that had little direct effect on the masses. The Sufis, however, were widespread and had a large popular following. However, Ibn Taymiyyah saw a link between the ideas

36 Muslim Al-Jame Al-Sahih, Hadith No. 7207, P. 1241.
37 Al-Anaam:148.
of the philosophers and those of the Sufis, even though apparently they had little in common.\(^ {39} \)

Blind Adherences

Imam Ibn Taymiyyah says that blind adherence to one school would bring a Muslim into conflict with the letter and spirit of Islamic law based on the Qur'an and Sunnah. Similarly, he had acquired a deep understanding of philosophical and mystical texts.

His challenge to the leading scholars of the day was to return to an understanding of Islam in practice and in faith, based solely on the Qur'an and Sunnah.\(^ {40} \)

6. Merits of Imam Ibn Taymiyyah writings:

Writings of Imam Ibn Taymiyyah (R.A) and their characteristics:

1. The significance of the writings of Imam Ibn Taymiyyah (RA) is the understanding of the secrets of the objectives of Sharia and the true spirit of the religion. He emphasized on the principles of the religion instead of its parts. He commences conversation in such a way that a writer feels that this is the real soul and temper of the religion particularly when he discusses creeds (aqaid) and scholarly and theological issues.

2. The most significant quality of his writings is that he criticized on the evils in the society, and wrote the impacts of these evils. It seems that his books were written between public and the real life. One can easily judge from his books, the society of his time, and its mentality and morality. For example, he negated and strongly opposed the philosophy and reasoning, in vogue.\(^ {41} \)

3. The style of all of his writings is encyclopaedic. He collects so much material on the subject concerned that consists of so many books and each comprise hundreds of pages. Dr. Ghulam Jelani Barq says about Ibn Taymiyyah:

\(^ {39} \) www.islamicphilosophy.com

\(^ {40} \) Ibid.

\(^ {41} \) Nadvi, Abu al-Hasan Tariekh Dawat Azeemat (Nashryat Islam Karachi), P. 142-144.
The number of his books is more than 500.\textsuperscript{42} He writes in the initial pages of his book.

“The writer of 500 books, mujahid (soldier) mujtahid (jurist) and the most revolutionist personality of our history”\textsuperscript{43}

7. Philosophy in the Books of Ibn Taymiyyah:

i. \textit{Fiqh (theology), jurisprudence and philosophy:}

Imam Ibn Taymiyyah (R.A) was a great reformer of his time. Imam Ibn Taymiyyah (R.A) always decided in the light of Quran and Sunnah. All of his legal opinions are the explanation of Quran and Sunnah. He severely criticizes the methodology of jurist, and said that no performance ought to be given to the opinion of jurist when there is an obvious categorical order of Quran and Sunnah. Imam Ibn Taymiyyah claims that no Hadith is against reason, wisdom and analogy, and he has not only conceptually contradicted the methodology of meditation of analogists but presented such arguments that the analogists claim that those are not against Qiyas (Analogy).

Imam has proved that as agreeable to reasoning and analogy. For example, the analogists view Baye Salam that it does not have exact and fully correspondence with Qiyas (anology). He writes about Baye Salam in his legal opinion:

Salam is in fact is like a borrowing (loan), on the promise of paying price later on, the purchase of it is lawful or permissible. In this way receiving the payment, on the condition that the thing will be handed over later on is lawful and permissible. It does not matter whatever is to be borrowed first out of these two things of exchange. It is also a loan as Allah almighty says:

“\textit{O ye who believe! when ye contract a debt for a fixed term, record it in writing}”\textsuperscript{44}

\textsuperscript{42} Ibid, P. 144.
\textsuperscript{43} Barq, Dr. Ghulam Jelani, Imam Ibn Taymiyyah, P. 3.
\textsuperscript{44} Al-Baqara, 282.
Hazrat Ibn Abbas (RA) says that I witness that Bya Salam is permissible or lawful in the Holy Quran. Then he recited the above mentioned verse. Therefore, the justification or legality of Bay Salam corresponds with qiyas (anology) not against analogy.\(^{45}\)

In a nutshell the principles of derivation and research of Imam Ibn Taymiyyah and the causes of logic on account of which emancipation and consistency of thought is crystal clear in his “Dirasaat”. He derives from the saying of “Aema” after purification his position. He is coincided with and made the Islamic Jurisprudence applicable in all the matters of human life.

ii. **Tafseer and Philosophy:**

Imam Ibn Taymiyyah (RA) refuted Tafseer with opinions and views, and made it conditional with Quran and Sunnah and with the reports transmitted from the companions (Sahaba R.A). The style of his (Imam Ibn Taymiyyah R.A) tafseer is that, he looks beyond the apparent meanings and goes deeply into it in the light of Quran and Sunnah. He does not remain limited to the visible words (meanings) but goes ahead to approach the motives, objectives and pacifications. Imam Ibn Taymiyyah (R.A) went against Tafseer “Bil Raaye” to that extent, that if a Mufassir explains the Holy Quran by his opinion, while remaining in moderation, and does not adopt the way of sedition in resembling, even then, without getting help from traditions, the consequence of opinion only, will lead one far away from Quran and its meaning and connotation.\(^{46}\)

iii. **Hadith and Reasoning:**

Imam Ibn tamiyya along with strengthening his sect with tradition (hadith) has ever proved in his discussions that any maxim proved from hadith is not against reasoning. So in this way he tries to bring under-discussion issue or matter near reason and uses logics by reasoning for explanation. But he never tries to prove any Divine law by reasoning. In his opinion, reasoning is, for making

\(^{45}\) Risalat-ul-Qiyas fi Famin Majma Rasail-ul-Kubra, 2/236.

\(^{46}\) Abu Zuhrah, Hayat Sheikh-ul-Islam Ibn Taymiyyah (R.A), P.347.
clear the things, not for guidance or going on the right path. Because of this, he (Imam Taymiyyah) says that the Holy Quran and Sunnah indicate to such issues of reasoning which leads towards destination correctly, so he writes at one occasion.

“The corroboration or testimony of the Holy Quran and Sunnah for the principles of religion is not only on account of khabr (information) as some mistaken rationalist, scholars of hadith and analogy and mystics have understood, but the Holy Quran and Sunnah have led human beings towards such logics and arguments which so significantly elaborate the principles of religion. The reality is that, these wrong doers have deviated from logics and reasoning and from the obvious and certain facts of the Holy Quran”.

He says at another occasion while discussing the deviation of the philosophers:

“These people give priority to seeing logic and knowledge. In their opinion seeing is the cause of knowledge and that, seeing is obligatory, then discussion is made on seeing, knowledge and logic in such a way that right and wrong amalgamate with each other. Hence when they exercise logics and arguments regarding religion they bring logics on physical incidents from deviated-incidents. It is obvious that this logic is new invention (self originated) according the law of the religion, and absolutely wrong according to the reasoning”.

IV. Refutation of Christianity:

With the political decline of the Muslims, the other religions took a new turn in the Islamic countries. Christianity is the religion which has most actively disclosed itself as compared to the rest of the religions; a large number of followers of which existed in Islamic States, particularly in Egypt and Syria, and the movement of Christianity was motioned very forcibly. This was the reason which compelled Imam Ibn Taymiyyah (R.A) to write against Christianity, and he wrote on this subject in a very scholarly and

---

47 Risala Marz-ul-Wasool Fi Majmooat-ul-Rasail-ul-Kubra, 1/183.
inquisitive manner. The most important book among these is “Al-Jawab Al-Sahih Le Man Baddala Din Al-Masih”.

8. The background of writing his book (al-Jawab al-Sahih le man Baddala Din al-Masih):

Imam Ibn Taymiyyah (R.A) paid attention to this subject more seriously, when an argumentative book from Christian arrived in Syria in which an effort was made to prove Christianity logically and divinely true. It was written in this way that the prophet-hood of Muhammad (S.A.W) was particularized for the Arabs only and it was made obvious that Christians were not bound to be His (S.A.W) followers.

Imam Ibn Taymiyyah decided to take a stake to reply this book and wrote a book which was comprised of four volumes.\(^{48}\)

One can easily judge from this book the broad-mindedness, various fields of study, deep acquaintance and knowledge of the history of religions and expansive knowledge of the previous revealed books.

Imam Ibn Taymiyyah (R.A) did not consider it adequate to make clarification and compliance only but attacked on the foundation of Christianity also. He (R.A) did not use primitive and ancient arguments, to prove Muhammad (S.A.W) as prophet, which is generally done by the scholars but presented such logics, which were more agreeable, appealing and believable.

In this book, the history of Christianity, knowledge of logic of Christianity and their absurdities and elucidation and interpretation have been logically refuted by him. So much material about our Holy Prophet (S.A.W) has been presented in this book that it seems not only a book but a huge and rich library has been consulted for writing this book.\(^{49}\)

In this book he has called the writing of present Christianity and the exact status of “\textit{Anajeels}” as of the period of Palestine.

\(^{48}\) Tarikh Dawat Azeemat, P. 2/261.
Imam Ibn Taymiyyah (R.A) writes:

“The creeds of the Christians, their religions and teachings, and their scholars and clergymen wrote all the time. Similarly as during the reign of Palestine 318 men prepared a brief (Booklet) of Christianity, on which different Christian sects were agreed. Such issues have been included or discussed in it which cannot be found in any revealed book, but contradicts all revealed books and is against sound reasoning”.

It seems now clear that Imam Ibn Taymyyah was not only a Mujtahid, Jurist, Muhadith but also a great philosopher.

References

Al-Quran

Al-Ghazali, Maqasid Al-Falasifa Matba tu-Sadata be Jaware Muhafiz-e-Misar.


____ (1951). *Naqd al-Mantiq Mataba al-Sunnat al-Muhammadia*. Cairo:

____ _Al-Nubuwwah al-Matba tu-Salfia wa Maktabatuha_, Cairo.

____ _Al-Rasail wa Almasail_. Al-Riyadh: Idara al-Bahus al-Islamia wa Dawat wl Irshad.


50 Al-Jawab-ul-Saheeh Leman Badal Deen Maseeh, 1/18.
Mushtaq ur Rehman

Abstract: Much has been talked about the theme of physical death, its nature, experience, effects, after-effects, and the attitude towards death and the traditional ways of looking at it. Some treat it as a dreadful departure; others look at it very positively and consider it as a source of consolation and relief. This paper is an attempt to study a striking parallelism between the attitudes of two poets, Donne and Thomas, towards death.

Key words: English Literature, Philosophy of Death. Donne, Thomas, Parallism

1. Introduction
While reading Dylan Thomas’s poetry one may feel a strong sense of deja vu; a feeling about something already experienced that reminisces somebody of a well-known metaphysical poet, John Donne. Finding a parallelism between these poets’ untraditional and peculiar attitude towards death, whatever the reason are—personal, religious, circumstantial—both have acquired an acute consciousness of death. Both the poets, like John Keats, are fascinatingly preoccupied and obsessed with the thought of death;

* Department of English Language and Literature, Gomal University D. I. Khan email: merhmaneg@gmail.cm
they express in their famous poems on the theme of death a profoundly positive attitude towards this inevitable experience. Unlike traditional way of looking at death, they believe that it is not abominable, negative and dreadful but relieving, soothing and peaceful. This attitude of Donne and Thomas about death leads us to the thesis that death is not the end of life but a continuation of life, a source of consolation, an inevitable part of the natural process and a gateway to immortality. In order to substantiate this argument about the parallelism between these poets through textual evidence, one will have to focus on the two poems, “Death be not proud…” and “A Refusal to Mourn the Death of a Child…” of Donne and Thomas respectively which are their representative poems dealing with the theme of death.

2. Discussion
Donne’s preaching religious sermons on the theme of death in “Death Duells” and Thomas’ obsession with the thought of death in his “Death Entrances” clearly reveal their commonality and like-mindedness. Thomas’ poem is perhaps the best example of his mystic belief in death to be a source of spiritual consolation; death enables us to rejoin parts of the natural process of life leading us to plunge into the ocean of eternity. John Ackerman says, “He sees life as part of an organic whole; existence is unity which is broken when life is conceived, but to the body returns at death” (46). Thomas does not see life or death as something detached from the continuum of the organic whole but as an integral part of the same whole naturally joining one another in a cyclic motion. This is why Thomas has a strongly positive attitude towards death which leads him to vehemently discard and refuse the tradition way of mourning the death of a child. He says:

NEVER until the mankind making
Bird beast flower
Fathering and all humbling darkness
Tells with the silence the last light breaking
And the still hour
Is come of the sea tumbling in the harness
And I must enter again the round
Zion of the water bead
And the synagogue of ear of the corn
Shall I let pray the shadow of a sound
Or sow my slat seed
In the last valley of sackcloth to mourn
The majesty and burning of the child’s death
(1-13). i

In the above passage Thomas vehemently rejects the traditional frowning attitude towards death as ruthlessly agonizing and delinking. The first word “NEVER” in capital letters of the above quoted passage indicates emphatic denial of looking at death from the traditional point of view. The poet’s rhetorical and emotional tone throughout the passage also reveals the vehement refusal of traditional mourning at death whereas the absence of punctuations marks clearly drops a hint of connectivity which points to the continuation of life and death circle as integral components of the natural process of the organic whole. It may be contend that this attitude of Dylan Thomas towards death is in quite consonance with that of John Donne who, in one of his sonnets, says:

Death be not proud, though some have called thee
Mighty and dreadful, thou art not soe
For, those, whom thou think’st, thou dost overthrow,

Die not, poor death, nor yet canst thou kill mee
(“Death be not …” 1-4). ii

The above passage overtly reveals Donne’s firm conviction that death is not as dreadful and cruel as it is traditionally thought. He quite confidently projects the idea that death does not kill or “overthrow” humans from the natural process but rather paves way for spiritual consolation and relief from the harsh term of physical existence. He further argues in the following stanza of the same poem that when “rest” and “sleep” as symbolic pictures of death can give relief, why can’t we get a lot more from actual death. He says:

From rest and sleep, which but thy pictures bee,
Much pleasure, then from thee much more must flow,  
And soon our best men with thee doe goe,  
Rest of their bones, and soul’s deliverie (5-8).

Donne’s view of death as a source of rest and relief tallies with that of Thomas’ who considers it as all “fathering,” “humbling” and reducing all things – mankind, birds, beasts or flowers—to similar origin. It would not be inappropriate to say that death is a great leveller which brings all things to original unity from where all life begins. Thomas believes that coming to life is to be born out of “humbling darkness,” which in a way is primordial unity, and entering the world of differentiated identity. Hence death, Thomas thinks, being a return to the state of rest and original unity, must be relieving and rejoicing.

Similarly, Donne also celebrates death as a great reliever and “souls’ delivery” from the chains of sense and the differentiated world of identity. Although Donne’s tone reveals some signs of scorn towards death by saying “Death be not proud,” yet he strongly proclaims its relief and consolation. Thomas’ attitude is even more positive towards death as he deems it a great equalizer. Thomas in the second stanza of his poem vividly mentions that when he is supposed to “enter again the round…. Zion of the water bead….. And the synagogue of the ear of the corn” (water and corn symbolize primal elements to which all forms of life must return) i.e. to rejoin the parts of the natural process of life, then it is useless and irrational to cry and mourn over death. Ouspensky illustrates the idea of “Eternal Recurrence” in the following words:

But for our mind it is more convenient to think of the idea of repetition under the form of the repetition of cycles. One life ends and another begins. One time ends and another begins. Death is really a return to the beginning (477).

Thomas’s belief in death to be a source of letting things rejoin their sacramental unity seems in parallel with that of Donne’s who deems it to be a medium and state of rest, consolation and relief.
The word “humbling” in the first stanza of Thomas’s poem is reminiscent of Thomas Grey, from the graveyard school of poets, who in his “Elegy Written in the Country Churchyard” also hammers the idea of death as a great equalizer.

Both Donne and Thomas are in tune with each other with regards to the levelling ability of physical death to dissolve the mutable distinctions. Talking about death Donne in his another poem “Dissolution” overtly says, “She is dead; and all which die…. To their first Elements resolve.” Thomas endorses the idea and approvingly insists that we must positively and optimistically accept this “graver truth” as the greatest, reliever, leveller, equalizer and a unifying force. This is why he denies to “sow…salt seed….. In the least valley of sackcloth to mourn. It implies that Thomas does not want to make the valley of an innocent child’s death infertile by mourning it traditionally; and to repeat her agony would be “blaspheme” and “profanity” of the “grave truth.” As he says:

I shall not murder
The mankind of her agony going with a grave truth
Nor blaspheme down the stations of the breath
With any further
Elegy of innocence and youth (14-18).

The last passage of this poem, unlike its rebellious opening, moves in calm and serenity towards a sort of reconciliation which hints the poet cools down from the state of vehement denial to a gradual acceptance of death as an inevitable part of the natural process and urges the reader to channelize his or her tragic emotions on such occasions of sorrow and sadness. Entering or joining the elemental parts, Thomas believes, is to enter “the dark veins of her mother” and to go beyond the age into the realm of immortality. Thomas says:

Deep with first dead lies London’s daughter,
Robed in the long friends,
The grains beyond age, the dark veins of her mother
Secret by the unmooring water
Of the riding Thames (19-23).

The images and expressions like “first dead,” “Robed in the long friends,” “The grains beyond age” and “dark veins of …mother” and “unmooring water….. Of the riding Thames, in the above passage clearly reveal that the primal Elements are symbolically taken as the real mother from where all life begins. The mother symbolically represents as the womb and tomb of everything pointing to primordial unity and eternal existence. Margaid states that “the earth is the lung by which I breathe—the earth is my greater flesh—the eternity” (in Ackerman, 119). “The water of the ‘riding Thames’ is ‘unmooring’ for it accepts the process of life and death” (119) as Ackerman says. The last line “After the first death, there is no other” of Thomas’s poem which capsules the conclusion so closer to Donne’s idea of death that it seems an echo or restatement of the latter’s clincher, “One short sleep past, we wake eternally…..And death shall be no more, death thou shalt die” (13-14).

The concluding parallelism between the Donne and Thomas is so striking that it looks as if the former is at the back of the latter’s mind to be reverberated. The conclusions of both the poems also reflect the poets’ belief in the life hereafter and its immortality to which only gateway is physical death. Perhaps that is why it is more rational to look at death positively rather than scornfully. Furthermore, it should also be noted that Thomas belief in immortality has been criticized especially by Ackerman who says, “Does it mean there is no other death because there is immortality or that there is on other death because there is no further life to make such a second death possible?” (120). It implies that whether he means by immortality a mere return of things to their original or ultimate elements or an eternal life after death purely in a Christian sense of the term. Keeping in view Thomas’ Welsh religious background and the druid’s philosophy ingrained in his mind, the particular line, “After the first, death there is no other,”
needs to be interpreted in the Christian sense of immortality and not merely a return to the primal elements. iv Otherwise his whole Biblical imagery would be meaningless and would turn into Beckettian rotunda, i.e. life as static motion with no beginning and no ending, and would fall into the ambit of existentialism.v

3. Conclusion

A close reading of these poems on the theme of death helps to draw a conclusion that Donne and Thomas seem identical in adopting unconventional but rational and justifiable attitude towards death. As we see similarities in their habits, life style as both were lovers of poetry with their “sexual imagination” (Ackerman, 41), and preaching, theatre and art, likewise we see parallelism in their consciousness of death and their positive unconventional attitudes towards death also. Although there are some differences in their handling of the theme—Donne belittles death by calling it “poor “ and “slave to chance, king and desperate men” whereas Thomas is more reverent to it—yet their overall response to death is much cordial.

Notes

i Dylan Thomas, Collected Poems. (London: J.M. Dent & Sons LTD, 1952). This and all subsequent textual references from Thomas’ poem are to this edition and are parenthetically presented with the title and line number unless otherwise indicated.

ii Jack Dalglish, Eight Metaphysical Poets. (London: Heinmann, 1961). This and all other subsequent textual references from Donne’s poems are to this edition, and are parenthetically presented with title and line number unless otherwise indicated.

iii It would be interesting note the textual lines from Thomas Grey’s well-known “Elegy Written in a Country Churchyard” quoted in Guy E. Smith’s English Literature.Vol.2. New Jersey, Littlefield, Adams & Co Paterson, 1959) P, 8. The lines are as under:

The boast of heraldry, and the pomp of power,
And all that beauty and wealth e’er gave,
Awaits alike th’ inevitable hour.
The paths of glory lead but to the grave.


References


Development of Regional Planning Criteria for Health Services in the city of Riyadh

IUB Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities

The Islamia University of
Bahawalpur, Pakistan

VOL.9 NO.1 January-June, 2011

CONTENTS
Development of Regional Planning Criteria for Health Services in the city of Riyadh
Development of Regional Planning Criteria for Health Services in the city of Riyadh


167
Development of Regional Planning Criteria for Health Services in the city of Riyadh
کتابی شامل 85 صفحات کتب پیدا می‌گردد، بسیاری از آنها در مورد موضوعات مختلفی می‌باشد. این کتاب در سال 2011 منتشر شده است.

[آرایه غیرقابل قرار گذاری در تصویر]

[آرایه غیرقابل قرار گذاری در تصویر]

169
Development of Regional Planning Criteria for Health Services in the city of Riyadh

ICB Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities Vol. 9 No. 1, 2011

(14)

(15)

(16)

(17)

(18)

(19)
قہو چاک یا پاہا کا کچھ بھی چاک کی دوسرے سے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچھ بھی تحقیق کے لئے کچ
Development of Regional Planning Criteria for Health Services in the city of Riyadh
अन्य एक दिस्म ने लिखा है: "Another Lonely Voice - The life and works of Saada Hassan Manto'.

"Manto's Portrait of women in his short stories continue to reflect the gentle affectionate example of..."
Development of Regional Planning Criteria for Health Services in the city of Riyadh
ستاً من کاغذ پیشتر در اینجا نوشته نکنم. من فقط توضیحاتی درباره کتاب می‌دهم. کتاب زبانی می‌باشد و در آن اسامی ادبیات وشناسان نوشته شده‌اند.

1. محمد معتمد، "کتابی درباره سیاست"، تهران: خرداد، 1383.
2. محمد معتمد، "مقدمه‌ای درباره سیاست"، تهران: خرداد، 1385.
3. فریبرز معلم، "مقدمه‌ای درباره سیاست"، تهران: خرداد، 1386.
4. کلام خان، "مقدمه‌ای درباره سیاست"، تهران: خرداد، 1387.
5. فریبرز معلم، "مقدمه‌ای درباره سیاست"، تهران: خرداد، 1388.

7. لیسی اسمیل، 'آخرین صدای تنها - زندگی و کارهای سادات حسن ماندو'، وانگارد لاهور، 1385-PP.21-22.

8. محمد معتمد، "مقدمه‌ای درباره سیاست"، تهران: خرداد، 1389.
9. فریبرز معلم، "مقدمه‌ای درباره سیاست"، تهران: خرداد، 1386.
10. کلام خان، "مقدمه‌ای درباره سیاست"، تهران: خرداد، 1387.

(نتایج در مورد نویسندگان و کتاب‌ها به‌طور کلی بهتر است که به فارسی یا ترجمه‌ای دیگر باشند.)
Development of Regional Planning Criteria for Health Services in the city of Riyadh
کتابیات

1....